



PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION

Project Address: 1114 Sherman Avenue (District 2 – Ald. Zellers)
Application Type: Conditional Use
Legistar File ID # [52904](#)
Prepared By: Colin Punt, Planning Division
Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted
Reviewed By: Kevin Firchow, AICP, Principal Planner

Summary

Applicant & Owner: Courtney & Nathan Greenawalt; 1114 Sherman Avenue; Madison, WI 53703
Contact: Andrew Wanek; Ginkgo House Architecture; 3157 Milwaukee St; Madison, WI 53714

Requested Action: The applicant requests a conditional use to allow an addition to a single-family residence totaling in excess of five hundred (500) square feet on a lakefront property at 1114 Sherman Avenue.

Proposal Summary: The applicant proposes to remove a detached garage, attached garage, raised deck, and patio. The applicant then plans to construct a 1,520 square foot addition that includes an attached garage and interior living spaces, and an exterior rear deck.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This proposal is subject to the standards for Conditional Uses [MGO §28.183], and Lakefront Development [MGO §28.138]. MGO §28.138(2)(a) of the Zoning Code states that additions to a principal building totaling in excess of five hundred (500) square feet during any ten (10) year period on zoning lots abutting Lake Mendota and associated bays, shall require Conditional Use approval.

Review Required By: Plan Commission

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for conditional uses lakefront development are met and **approve** the conditional use requests to allow an addition to a single-family residence totaling in excess of five hundred (500) square feet on a lakefront property at 1114 Sherman Avenue. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The 10,570-square-foot (0.24-acre) subject property is located on the western (lake) side of Sherman Avenue, between North Ingersoll Street and North Few Street. The site is within Aldermanic District 2 (Ald. Zellers) as well as the limits of the Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: The subject site includes the existing 2,777-square-foot, two-and-a-half-story single-family home. City Assessor's records indicate the home was constructed in 1912 and has five bedrooms, two full bathrooms and two half bathrooms. The site also includes a two-stall attached garage and a one-stall detached garage located northwest of the residence.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

- West: Lake Mendota;
- East: Across Sherman Avenue, a mix of single family homes and 2-, 3-, and 4-unit residential buildings, zoned TR-C2 (Traditional Residential - Consistent 2 District);
- North: Single-family homes, zoned TR-C2; and
- South: Single-family homes, zoned TR-C2.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The [Comprehensive Plan](#) (2018) and the [Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Plan](#) (2008) both recommend low-density residential development for the subject site and surrounding properties. “Low Residential” within the Comprehensive Plan includes “house-like” residential uses less than 15 dwelling units per acre. The neighborhood plan also states that a plan goal for the neighborhood is to “restore and preserve the residential character of the Tenney-Lapham neighborhood.”

Zoning Summary: The property is zoned TR-C2 (Traditional Residential-Consistent 2).

Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area	4,000 sq ft	10,570 sq ft
Lot width	40'	70'
Usable open space	750 sq ft	750+ sq ft
Lot coverage	65%	38%
Front yard	20'	24'
Side yards	6'	6', 6'2"
Lakefront yard	71'7"	72'4"
Building height	2 stories/ 35'	1 story (new addition)

Section 28.138(4)(a)3. The median setback of the principal building on the five (5) developed lots or three hundred (300) feet on either side (whichever is less), or thirty percent (30%) of lot depth, whichever number is greater.

Other Critical Zoning Items	Flood plain, Water front development
------------------------------------	--------------------------------------

Tables Prepared by Jacob Moskowitz, Assistant Zoning Administrator

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site is not located in a mapped environmental corridor, though a small portion of the property adjacent to the lake is within the flood storage district. The proposed new construction is not located within this area.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Project Description

The applicant requests a conditional use in order to construct an addition totaling in excess of 500 square feet on a single-family residence on a lakefront parcel.

The existing two-and-a-half-story, single-family home was constructed in 1912, according to City Assessor’s records. It includes 2,777 square feet of living area with five bedrooms and two full and two half bathrooms. A two-stall attached garage on the south side of the house is proposed for demolition. A detached, 1-car garage, also slated for demolition, is located to the northwest of the residence, along the northerly property line.

The proposed changes consist of the removal of a 135 square foot detached garage along the northerly property line, the 430 square foot attached garage, the 330 square foot raised deck at the rear of the house, and a 285 square foot patio. According to the application, the existing detached garage has structural issues and is flaking lead paint, and the existing attached garage is not original to the house and inconsistent with the home's architectural style. A large two-stall garage will be constructed on the southerly side of the house where the existing garage will be removed: in addition to parking space for two cars, the deeper partially-tandem garage will provide storage for bicycles and lake and yard equipment. The attached garage is served by a driveway to Sherman Avenue, which is not intended to be altered. The smaller detached garage is served by a shared driveway on the lot line with 1118 Sherman Avenue. This driveway will also remain. As part of the new construction, a mudroom and ¾ bath will be added on the first floor and the first floor family room will be expanded. Two storage areas are also proposed for the northerly façade of the house. The existing raised rear deck will be replaced by a new deck approximately 900 square feet in area and raised 23 inches above grade. The lakefront setback from the ordinary high water mark is 72'4" to the house and 71'7" to the deck.

Regarding materials, the letter of intent notes that the siding on the garage and the associated addition will be stucco/EIFS to match the existing siding. New architectural shingles will be employed throughout both the new and old portions of the house. Colors and materials have not been shown on submitted plans or building elevations. Roof pitches and dormers for the new construction will match the existing structure, as will wood rafter tails and soffits. According to submitted materials, plantings will be added to the base of the building along the newly constructed areas, though types and locations have not been provided.

Analysis and Conclusion

This request is subject to the approval standards for Lakefront Development and Conditional Uses.

Lakefront Development Standards

The lakefront development standards were established to further the maintenance of safe and healthful conditions by preserving and enhancing water quality, habitats, viewsheds, and other environmental and aesthetic qualities of lakes. This section includes additional regulations including limitations on the clearing of shoreline vegetation, requirements for public sewer, environmental protections, and additional lot coverage standards. This section also includes the methodology to establish the building setback from the lake. Staff believe the lakefront development standards are met.

Staff also note that the subject site is not located in a mapped environmental corridor, although roughly the 45-foot strip adjacent to the lakefront falls within the flood storage district. No changes are proposed in this area.

Conditional Use Approval

In regards to the approval standards, the Plan Commission shall not approve a conditional use without due consideration of the City's adopted plan recommendations, design guidelines, and finding that all of the conditional use standards of MGO §28.183(6) are met. These standards include one related exclusively to lakefront development (Standard 13) which states that "when applying the above standards to lakefront development under Sec. 28.138, the Plan Commission shall consider the height and bulk of principal buildings on the five (5) developed lots or three hundred (300) feet on either side of the lot with the proposed development." As an estimate of total bulk, staff utilized City Assessor's data to estimate principal building size for the homes on the five (5) developed lots on either side of the subject property. This calculation includes living areas, enclosed porches, and estimated attached garage space. Using this analysis, staff found that the principal building sizes

range from approximately 2,313 to 5,034 square feet (*see Table 1 below*). The median size of the surrounding homes is approximately 3,287 square feet, compared to the roughly 4,297 square feet for the proposed principal structure (which is 31 percent above the median). At 4,297 square feet, the proposed additions result in one of the larger residences in the study area, but staff notes that it is located on one of the larger lot in that area, which at 10,570 square feet, is almost 35 percent larger the median (7,844-square-foot) lot size.

Table 1 – Comparison of Bulk with Closest Ten Lakefront Properties

Address	Height	Living Area	Total Livable Area ¹	Lot Area	Floor Area Ratio
1040 Sherman Ave	2.5	4542	5204	16465	0.32
1050 Sherman Ave	2.5	2939	3239	10675	0.30
1054 Sherman Ave	2	2194	2392	8375	.029
1102 Sherman Ave	2	2522	2522	8125	.031
1106 Sherman Ave	2.5	2410	3381	12400	.027
1118 Sherman Ave	3	4398	5034	7563	0.67
1122 Sherman Ave	2	2025	2313	7488	0.31
1126 Sherman Ave	1.5	3075	3075	7413	.041
1130 Sherman Ave	2.5	3534	3534	7338	.048
1134 Sherman Ave	2.5	3334	3334	7263	0.46
Median	2.5	3007	3287	7844	0.32
1114 Sherman Ave*	2.5	2777	3207	10570	0.30
1114 Sherman Ave**	2.5	3428	4297	10570	0.41

* Existing House
 ** Proposed House

¹ Includes attached garages, and enclosed porches from City of Madison Assessor data

On both sides of the subject property there is a large amount of variation, both in the size of the homes as well as in the size of the lots. Therefore, the floor-to-area ratio or FAR, which compares the total building floor area (on all floors) to the lot area, is therefore the better lens through which to compare the proposed development against its neighbors. (A FAR of 1.0 would indicate that the total building floor area is equal to the lot area.) The calculated FAR for the proposed principal structure is 0.41, which is 29 percent above the estimated median 0.32 FAR for the surrounding homes, but is still lower than four of the ten houses in the study area (*see Table 1 above*).

Conclusion

The Planning Division believes that the standards for Lakefront Development and Conditional Uses can be found met. This proposal is also consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Plan's recommendation for lower-intensity residential land uses. While the proposed additions would make the principal structure the one of the larger residences in the study area, more importantly, the calculated floor-to-area ratio for the principal structure with the proposed additions is 0.41, which places it a bit above the median 0.32 FAR for the surrounding homes, but considerably below the highest nearby FARs. As such, the new home is believed to be compatible with the varied development pattern along Sherman Avenue.

The Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Association has provided a letter, dated August 10, 2018 and included in the Plan Commission materials, supporting the proposal. At time of report writing, Staff is unaware of any additional public comment.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Colin Punt, (608) 243-0455)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for conditional uses lakefront development are met and **approve** the conditional use requests to allow an addition to a single-family residence totaling in excess of five hundred (500) square feet on a lakefront property at 1114 Sherman Avenue. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Recommended Conditions of Approval Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division (Contact Colin Punt, (608) 243-0455)

1. Label building materials and colors on elevation drawings.

Engineering Division (Main Office) (Contact Brenda Stanley, (608) 261-9127)

2. Applicant shall show the 100 year regulatory floodplain on the plan set and shall show that any entrances to the new construction are flood protected to an elevation 2' above that elevation.

3. The plan set shall be revised to show more information on proposed drainage for the site. This shall be accomplished by using spot elevations and drainage arrows or through the use of proposed contours. It is necessary to show the location of drainage leaving the site to the public right-of-way. It may be necessary to provide information off the site to fully meet this requirement.

Traffic Engineering (Contact Sean Malloy, (608) 266-5987)

4. The applicant shall submit one contiguous plan showing proposed conditions and one contiguous plan showing existing conditions for approval. The plan drawings shall be scaled to 1" = 20' and include the following, when applicable: existing and proposed property lines; parcel addresses; all easements; vision triangles; pavement markings; signing; building placement; items in the terrace such as signs, street light poles, hydrants; surface types such as asphalt, concrete, grass, sidewalk; driveway approaches, including those adjacent to and across street from the project lot location; parking stall dimensions, including two (2) feet of vehicle overhang; drive aisle dimensions; semitrailer movement and vehicle routes; dimensions of radii; and percent of slope.

Zoning Administrator (Contact Jacob Moskowitz, (608) 266-4560)

5. Provide a complete inventory of shoreline vegetation in any area proposed for building, filling, grading or excavating. In addition, the development plan shall indicate those trees and shrubbery which will be removed as a result of the proposed development. The cutting of trees and shrubbery shall be limited in the strip thirty-five (35) feet inland from the normal waterline. On any zoning lot not more than thirty percent (30%) of the frontage shall be cleared of trees and shrubbery.
6. Filling, grading and excavation of the zoning lot may be permitted only where protection against erosion, sedimentation and impairment of fish and aquatic life has been assured. Obtain necessary erosion control permits.

7. Any earth disturbing activity along the lakeshore such as the installation of the proposed rip rap may require a permit from the Department of Natural Resources. Contact the Department of Natural Resources for more information.
8. Per Section 28.186(4)(b), the property owner or operator is required to bring the property into compliance with all elements of the approved site plans by the date established by the Zoning Administrator as part of the site and building plan approval. Work with Zoning staff to establish a final site compliance date.
9. On final plans show only the proposed driveway. Per Sec. 28.141(9)(b)1. a driveway must lead directly from the street to a legal parking area outside the front yard, and cannot exceed twenty-two (22) feet at the property line.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, (608) 261-9658)

10. Madison Fire Department recommends the installation of a residential fire sprinkler system in accordance with NFPA 13D. Even if the system only protects the area of the home being remodeled/addition. Additional information is available at the Home Fire Sprinkler Coalition website: <https://homefiresprinkler.org/building-residential-fire-sprinklers>

Parks/Forestry Review (Contact Kate Kane, (608) 261-9671)

11. An existing inventory of trees (location, species, & DBH) and any tree removal plans (in PDF format) shall be submitted to the plans and Brad Hofmann – bhofmann@cityofmadison.com or 266-4816. All proposed street tree removals within the right of way shall be reviewed by City Forestry. Approval and permitting of street tree removals shall be obtained from the City Forester and/or the Board of Public Works prior to the approval of the site plan.
12. Existing street trees shall be protected. Please include the following note on the site plan: Contractor shall install tree protection fencing in the area between the curb and sidewalk and extend it at least 5 feet from both sides of the tree along the length of the terrace. No excavation is permitted within 5 feet of the outside edge of a tree trunk. If excavation within 5 feet of any tree is necessary, contractor shall contact City Forestry (266- 4816) prior to excavation to assess the impact to the tree and root system. Tree pruning shall be coordinated with City Forestry prior to the start of construction. Tree protection specifications can be found in section 107.13 of City of Madison Standard Specifications for Public Works Construction - <http://www.cityofmadison.com/business/pw/documents/StdSpecs/2018/Part1.pdf>. Any tree removals that are required for construction after the development plan is approved will require at least a 72 hour wait period before a tree removal permit can be issued by Forestry, to notify the Alder of the change in the tree plan.