

Regarding: 606 South Thornton Avenue – Marquette Bungalows Historic District – Rear entry porch addition and garage door exterior alteration. 6th Ald. District
Contact: Bob Batyko & Lorie Docken
(Legistar #28922)

Date: February 11, 2013
Prepared By: Amy Scanlon, Preservation Planner

General Information:

The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a rear addition to the house and exterior alterations to the garage at 606 South Thornton Avenue.

Relevant Ordinance sections:

- 33.19(13)(d) Criteria for the Review of Additions, Exterior Alterations and Repairs. All additions, exterior alterations and repairs must be compatible with the historic character of the house and the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.
9. Additions and Other Alterations. New additions on the front of the house are prohibited. Additions on the sides or rear shall be permitted if they are compatible with the house in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials and architectural details used in additions and alterations shall duplicate in texture, appearance, and design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the house or of other houses in the district. The Landmarks Commission may approve an exception to this policy where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade.

Staff Evaluation and Recommendations:

Staff believes that the proposed addition is compatible with the historic character of the house and the Marquette Bungalows Historic District. Staff believes the proposed rear addition is compatible with the house in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Staff also believes that the materials and architectural details used in the proposed addition duplicate texture, appearance, design, materials and details used in the original construction of the house or of other houses in the district. The proposed addition location results in the removal of a portion of the existing rear wall and a related window. Staff does not believe the window is a significant architectural feature.

The Ordinance does not specify the exterior alteration of an existing garage to change two separate garage doors into one large door. The garage elevation that is being altered faces the street, but it is a garage and the Ordinance specifies the treatment of windows and doors on “street facades” (see 33.19(13)(d)6.b.) of the house. Section 33.19(13)(e) states that construction of new garages shall have garage doors that... “blend with the historic appearance of the neighborhood. Horizontally paneled doors and flat paneled doors are prohibited”. Staff believes that the proposed garage alteration blends with the appearance of the neighborhood.

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition and the exterior alterations are met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall clarify the materials to be used for the porch railing and deck. The railing shall be painted or opaque stained.
2. The Applicant shall clarify a detail at the porch column and stair stringer. Staff would prefer that the column be in a different plane than the stringer board.
3. Lattice panels shall be constructed to screen under the porch.