

AGENDA # 8

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: April 7, 2010
TITLE: 202 North Charter Street – Signage Package for an Existing PUD(GDP-SIP) Apartment Building’s First Floor Retail. 8 th Ald. Dist. (02053)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: April 7, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, Dawn O’Kroley, Todd Barnett, John Harrington, Jay Ferm, Marsha Rummel, Richard Wagner, Mark Smith and Ron Luskin.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of April 7, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a signage package located at 202 North Charter Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Ryan Coffey of JMB Signs, Inc. Bryce Armstrong and representing Dayton Charter, LLC; with Rosemary Lee speaking in opposition. Coffey appeared and provided details of recent modifications to the uniform sign package for the lower level retail tenant spaces in the building. The team summarized the sign package as outlined within the applicant packet, which provides for three sign areas on the ground level façade of the building, one sign oriented to the building’s Dayton Street frontage, with two individual tenant signs oriented toward the site’s Charter Street frontage. All three signs are a cabinet style mounted with the sign face flush with the overlying overhang of the residential units above. The sign face will be routed aluminum panels with push thru illuminated acrylic lettering. The new package was previously reviewed by the Commission in February of 2010. Following the presentation Rosemary Lee spoke in opposition, noting problems with the high visibility of the “Subway” signage. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Uncomfortable with big box approach for signage; just hangs off the building, not sensitive to building, needs greater separation from upper stories.
- Consider shrinking down 25% and create a separation from the signs with the upper stories.
- Need transparency atop the sign cabinets to allow for a minimum of four-inches between them and the upper stories.
- Sign width on Dayton should be the same width as the overlying windows with mounting midway under the soffit as a blade but not tied to the plane of the residential façade above.
- Existing window signage suffices as is without exterior signage.

ACTION:

On a motion by O’Kroley, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (7-1) with Luskin voting no. The motion provided that the wall signage package be modified to recess behind front panel of building’s upper residential facade with the

panel centered on the overlying soffit. On Dayton Street, the width of the entire sign box shall be no wider than the overlying windows above with the size of the sign and proportion of the sign as created by these requirements to dictate the proportion and size of the two other signs on Charter Street that are to match and be center on architectural elements above to be approved by staff.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3, 4, 4.5, 5, 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 202 North Charter Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	4	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	4.5	-	-	4.5
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	3	-	-	3
	-	-	-	-	6	-	6	-
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	6

General Comments:

- Building design not friendly to signage but appropriate signage is possible.
- Fine as motioned.
- About as well integrated as possible? Center under soffit at Charter Street elevation.