

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: December 19, 2007

TITLE: 3801 East Washington Avenue –
Renovation and New Construction in
Urban Design District No. 5, Grocery
Store. 17th Ald. Dist. (07849)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: December 19, 2007

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Marsha Rummel, Richard Slayton, Jay Ferm and Todd Barnett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of December 19, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of renovation and new construction located at 3801 East Washington Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project were Bree Cooper, Henry A. Gempeler, Bob Johnson and Pete Hosch, all representing Hy-Vee, Inc., and Ald. Joe Clausius, District 17. Wagner was excused at 5:15 p.m. during the presentation on this item. The presentation on the revised plans feature the following:

- A day lighting issue was addressed on the front façade with the peeling back of the existing façade with a raised roof structure to let light into the front of the building.
- Punched up architecture by creating uniform tie to architectural treatment for main, minor, and accessory tenant spaces. The expanded use of the brick provided as a base material pushing and diminishing EIFS on the upper façade.
- The project as proposed with seek LEED certification. A review of the site landscape plan modifications featured the doubling up of trees on islands. The utilization of nine different types of trees species with special attention to salt tolerance and accommodations for dry seasons. In addition, landscape maintenance was also looked at in regards to trees and plantings adaptability to parking lot conditions.
- A reexamination of a proposed bioswale with existing contours on the south side of the site adjacent to Mendota Street shows that a bioswale would not work in this area. Therefore, surface bioswales were replaced with an alternative underground detention facilities. The parking lot also features modifications to provide sidewalks to the storefronts in combination with trees and planting areas.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Applaud the use of the existing building, new entry with transom window, high space to provide for daylight. But a little letdown about the loss of the liveliness of the architecture of the existing building's front façade, a previous project.
- Enliven front façade with more windows and/or landscaping, provide more windows on bank tenant's façade. Encourage applicant to work with tenant (bank) for more windows.
- Issue with drive-up conflicting with pedestrian walkway at front of building, the pharmacy drive-up and grocery pick-up.
- Examine potential for down lighting on the Mendota Street elevation.

- Like grocery pick-up removed from main entry to store but problem with 2-way traffic will have with signage issues. Less concern with the remoteness from the main entry.
- Need fixture cut sheets for final approval.
- The “Columnar” Ginkgo should be “standard” Ginkgo with one tree, a tree island when utilized.
- Examine the potential to put trees along the southeasterly property line behind the building to provide more shade.
- Shrubs and ground cover and planting beds should be durable. The use of perennials and the deciduous shrubs a concern with winter texture and cutting/maintenance in the fall.
- Like additional sidewalk in parking lot to main entry, share concern with sidewalk, pharmacy drop-off and grocery pick-up conflicts. Need to provide a blow-up of area for further consideration.
- Look at another concept on how pedestrian pharmacy drop-off and grocery drive-up can be accommodated. Reexamine the level of parking which exceeds the Zoning Code level, if some parking stalls could be eliminated; area could be used to benefit drop-off issue or provide additional on-site rain garden or bio-retention amenities.
- Reexamine traffic movement and circulation to the pharmacy drive-up for the site as a whole in addition to issues and conflicts with pedestrian movement and grocery pick-up.

Ald. Joe Clausius spoke in support of the project noting neighborhood association support in the Hawthorne and Mayfair Neighborhood Associations where a full service grocery will replace an under-utilized site where people will drive, walk and bike in addition to the provision of jobs within the area. Clausius further noted that the project was formerly an “Onion Award” winner which will be cleaned up; a good fit for the neighborhood and district where the issue relevant to a liquor store is a non-issue.

ACTION:

On a motion by Rummel, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (5-0). The motion required address of the above stated concerns and the following:

- Provide a close-up view of the pharmacy drive-thru with a more comprehensive look to a final solution for pedestrian walking/pharmacy drive-up and grocery pick-up.
- Provide lighting fixture cut sheets in addition to a full photometric with further consideration of the project.
- Modify the landscape plan in regards to the use of Ginkgo trees.
- Look at front elevation again to add more windows.
- Look at brickwork; maybe different colored base and top with a provision on the rear elevation of a return of brick from the adjacent elevations at four-foot minimum.
- Relook at lane directions relationship to drive-up.
- Address concern with the extent of outdoor display needs to be defined including any details of front façade display at the walk.
- Signage is to return for formal consideration.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 5, 6, 6.5 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 3801 East Washington Avenue

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6.5
	5	5	4	5	-	-	5	5
	6	5	6	6	-	5	6	6
	5	6	6	6	5	5	5	5
	7	6	8	7	-	-	7	7
	6	5	6	5	5	6	6	5

General Comments:

- Great reuse; front pedestrian zone, however, needs further work and thought.
- Desired use.
- Appreciate LEEDS certification effort. Address drive thru and lane directions; parking. Underground infiltration system interesting alternative to traditional bioswales. Daylighting to front façade is an improvement. Welcome to Madison, great use!
- Provide enlarged plans at detailed areas (plaza, parcel pick-up, etc.) include critical dimensions.
- Glad you're seeking LEED. Parking lot is much improved, keep looking for ways to make it beautiful!
- Great to reuse building; examine drop-off, pick-up, architecture predictable.