



**Project Name & Address:** 1245 Spaight Street

**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

**Legistar File ID #** [67670](#)

**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** November 9, 2021

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Jim Glueck, Glueck Architects

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of an existing front porch and construction of a new front porch.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - 1. Height.
    - 2. Landscape treatment.
    - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
  - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
  - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
  - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
  - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

**Analysis and Conclusion**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the existing front porch and construct a new front porch. The house was constructed in 1890, per the Assessor record. There have been exterior modifications over time, but the most significant modification on the front façade is the enclosure of the front porch and modification of the balcony railing above the porch. While the existing materials are out of character with the historic period of the structure and district, our earliest photo (from the 1980s survey of the district) shows a slightly different design that is also out of character with the structure:



The applicant is proposing to remove the deteriorated enclosed porch and balcony and construct a simple covered porch and balcony design that is in keeping with the character of the district and of the structure. There are no historic photos to base the design upon, but it is similar in character to other historic resources in the vicinity and follows design precedent of previous approvals from the Landmarks Commission. The structure will feature wood

materials with simple wood balusters and newel posts. The base of the porch will be enclosed with panels featuring vertical slats rather than a cross-hatched lattice.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
  - (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - 1. There is no change to the existing porch and balcony structure and it is in keeping with other features found in the vicinity.
    - 2. N/A
    - 3. The proposal will return the porch to a covered porch, which will bring this structure back to a historic rhythm of masses and spaces
  - (b) This will return the porch to the historic proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
  - (c) There are no remaining original or historic materials and the proposal will recreate a period-appropriate porch and balcony configuration with historically appropriate materials.
  - (d) N/A.
  - (e) By opening the porch, the historic windows and doors on the front façade will again be visible.

**Recommendation**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.