PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

June 24, 2024

PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION



Project Address:	6402 Schroeder Road (19 th Alder District, Ald. Guequierre)	
Application Type:	Demolition Permit and Conditional Use Alteration	
Legistar File ID #	<u>83287</u> and <u>83288</u>	
Prepared By:	Chris Wells, Planning Division Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted	
Reviewed By:	Kevin Firchow, AICP, Principal Planner	

Summary

Applicant & Contact:Jeff Stowe; Thrive Architects, LLC; 7818 Big Sky Drive, Suite 209; Madison, WI 53719Property Owner:Marcio Sierra Jr; Lighthouse Christian School; 6505 Schroeder Road; Madison, WI 53711

Requested Actions: The applicant requests consideration of a demolition permit to demolish a street-facing facade of a private school, and consideration of an alteration to an approved conditional use for a private school to allow construction of an addition at 6402 Schroeder Road.

Proposal Summary: The applicant, Lighthouse Christian School, is proposing to construct a roughly 7,500-square-foot, one-story addition on the south side of existing roughly 37,000-square-foot school building. As this work requires the covering up of the school's southern street-facing façade, a demolition permit requirement is triggered.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This proposal is subject to the standards for demolition permits pursuant to Section 28.185(7), M.G.O. This proposal is also subject to the standards for Conditional Uses [*MGO §28.183*], as §28.082 of the Zoning Code lists *Schools, Public and Private* as a conditional use in the Suburban Employment (SE) District. The Supplemental Regulations [*MGO §28.151*] contain further regulations for this type of use. As the subject site is located in Urban Design District #2, this proposal is also subject to the review standards for that district [*MGO §33.24(6)(c)*].

Review Required By: Urban Design Commission, Plan Commission

Summary Recommendation:

- That the Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find the demolition standards of approval met and **approve** the demolition of a street-facing facade at 6402 Schroeder Road; and
- The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find the conditional use standards of approval met and **approve** the alteration to an approved conditional use for a private school to allow construction of an addition at 6402 Schroeder Road.

These requests are subject to input at the public hearing and the comments and conditions recommended by reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The roughly 155,984-square-foot (3.58-acre) parcel is located on the north side of Schroeder Road, just west of Forward Drive. It is also located within Alder District 19 (Ald. Guequierre), in Urban Design District #2, and is within the limits of the Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: The east side of the subject site contains a roughly 36,900-square-foot, onestory school building, which according to City Assessor's Office records, was originally constructed in 1980. A surface parking lot, which takes access from Schroeder Road, occupies the western half. The site to the north also shares common access from Schroeder Road through this surface lot.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

- <u>North</u>: A one-story telecom building and accessory satellite field beyond which is a multi-tenant office building, both zoned Suburban Employment (SE);
- South: Across Schroeder Road are single-family residences, zoned Suburban Residential Consistent 3 (SR-C3);
- East: Across Rayovac Drive are two vacant parcels, both zoned Suburban Employment (SE); and
- <u>West</u>: Two multi-tenant office buildings containing such tenants as the Madison Waldorf School and a sports apparel company, zoned SE; beyond which is a day care center and a sports club (tennis center), both zoned Planned Development (PD).

Adopted Land Use Plan: The <u>Comprehensive Plan (2018)</u> recommends Employment (E) uses for the subject parcel. The <u>Southwest Neighborhood Plan (2008)</u> does not provide a specific recommendation for the subject parcel.

Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area (sq. ft.)	20,000 sq. ft.	155,984 sq. ft.
Lot Width	65'	478.82'
Front Yard Setback	0' or 5'	24.7'
Side Yard Setback	15' or 20% building height	105.8' east side yard
		Adequate west side yard
Rear Yard Setback	30'	Existing rear yard setback
Maximum Lot Coverage	75%	57.7%
Minimum Building Height	22' measured to building cornice	1 story/16' addition
Maximum Building Height	5 stories/68'	1 story/16' addition
Site Design	Required	Proposed
Number Parking Stalls	No minimum required	79
Electric Vehicle Stalls	Not required	None
Accessible Stalls	Yes	3
Loading	Not required	Shared loading dock area
Number Bike Parking Stalls	Schools- public and private: 1 space per 5 students (45)	30 (See Comment #12)
Landscaping and Screening	Yes	Yes (See Comment #13)
Lighting	Not required	None
Building Form and Design	Not required	Existing building and addition
Other Critical Zoning Items		
Ý	Urban Design (UDD #2), Utility Easements; Barrier Free (ILHR 69)	
1	Historic District; Floodplain, Adjacent to Park, Wetlands, Wellhead Protection; TOD Overlay	

Zoning Summary: The property is in the Suburban Employment (SE) District.

Table Prepared by Jenny Kirchgatter, Assistant Zoning Administrator

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site is not within a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services including daily all-day Metro service along Schroeder Road near this property – with trips at least every 30 minutes (every 15 minutes or less during the day on weekdays). The City of Madison has approved the elimination of the existing Metro

Transit bus stop on the north side of Schroeder Road, west of Rayovac Drive (#8514), adjacent this property - with removal anticipated during Fall of 2024. The nearest westbound stop along Schroeder Road will now be located roughly 450 feet to the west of the subject site (at the intersection with Forward Drive) while the nearest eastbound stop will remain at the intersection with Rayovac Drive.

Related Approvals

On March 6, 2017, the Plan Commission found the standards met and approved a request for a conditional use for a '*School, Public and Private*' to convert an office building into a private school at 6400 Schroeder Road; Urban Design Dist. 2. (Legistar File ID <u>45802</u>)

Project Description, Analysis, and Conclusion

The applicant, Lighthouse Christian School, requests consideration of a demolition permit to demolish a streetfacing facade of a private school, and consideration of an alteration to an approved conditional use for a private school to allow construction of an addition at 6402 Schroeder Road. The roughly 7,500-square-foot, one-story addition will be on the south side of existing roughly 37,000-square-foot school building and contain new classrooms, multi-purpose space, and teacher's lounge.

In communication with Staff, the applicant provided the following information regarding the reasoning for the addition:

"Currently, students have to use the cafeteria, a conference room, and a multipurpose room as classrooms. At the same time, the art class, one of the school's strengths, does not have a classroom and has to meet in the cafeteria as well.

The purpose of the addition is to:

- 1. Provide the staff with a large enough teacher lounge where teachers can relax, have lunch, and do other work in a comfortable, ample space that can accommodate more staff than the current room. This room will also be used for volunteers on the weekends.
- 2. Build two classrooms that will accommodate two new classes, with 32 students in total. (Staff note that this represents a roughly 10-percent increase in the school's current enrollment of 322 students)
- 3. Build an art room that will be used by students during school hours and also by the community during night hours and during the summer. The school's current art teacher will hold community art classes after hours that will benefit the community as a whole.
- 4. Many organizations in the community use our building. Having a new multipurpose room will benefit not only the school and the church but also the different community organizations that use the building. This year, due to the lack of space, we have had to say no to community events."

The proposed addition will extend across the entire existing southern façade, effectively extending the entire mass further south. Staff note that City Zoning Staff have interpreted 'covering up' an entire existing street-facing façade as falling into the definition of a demolition, which the Zoning Code notes, in part, is "An act or process that removes, pulls down, tears down, razes, deconstructs, or destroys an existing building wall facing a public street."

The school's primary entrance will remain along the western façade of the existing structure. The door located centrally on the addition's southern façade will be for emergency egress only. The proposed hours of operation of the school facility – Monday to Friday, 7:30 am to 5:30 pm, with some evening and weekend community

activities – are not proposed to change, nor is the school's before- and after-school programming (which helps dissipate peak traffic impacts by spreading it over a longer timeframe), or the current arrangement and striping of the parking lot (with pick up/drop off lane (area), 138 automobile parking stalls, and counter-clockwise automobile circulation.) Regarding bicycle parking, the applicant will need to increase the number of stalls another 15 above the 30 proposed or else apply for a bicycle parking reduction (per MGO Section 28.141(5)). The only site change proposed is the relocation of the fenced outdoor play area, currently located where the addition is proposed, to the east side of the addition.

Regarding exterior materials, the addition will be primarily clad with white, horizontal metal panels. Woodcolored composite wood siding will frame the windows and help break up the façades. Additional accents will be provided in the form of various-colored aluminum panels added above the windows. The multi-purpose room with its large banks of windows will be given particular prominence via its cladding with a grey-blue metal panel which will wrap the addition's southwest corner.

Analysis and Conclusion

This proposal is subject to the standards for demolition permits pursuant to Section 28.185(7), M.G.O. This proposal is also subject to the standards for Conditional Uses [$MGO \$ §28.183], as §28.082 of the Zoning Code lists Schools, Public and Private as a conditional use in the Suburban Employment (SE) District. The Supplemental Regulations [$MGO \$ §28.151] contain further regulations for this type of use. As the subject site is located in Urban Design District #2, this proposal is also subject to the review standards for that district [$MGO \$ §33.24(6)(c)]. This analysis begins with a summary of the adopted plan recommendations.

Conformance with Adopted Plans

The <u>Comprehensive Plan (2018)</u> recommends Employment (E) uses for the subject parcel. The Plan describes Employment areas as including "predominantly corporate and business offices, research facilities, laboratories hospitals, medical clinics, and other similar uses. They generally do not include retail and consumer service uses for the wider community, but may include limited retail and service establishments that primarily serve employees and users of the area." The <u>Southwest Neighborhood Plan (2008)</u> does not provide a specific recommendation for the subject parcel.

Staff believe that the proposed use could be found compatible with the Comprehensive Plan and would not prevent the surrounding sites from developing in a manner more consistent with the Plan in the future.

Demolition Permit Standards

At its October 5, 2021 meeting, the Common Council adopted Ordinance 21-00065 (ID <u>67074</u>) to revise the standards and process for demolition and removal permits in Section 28.185 of the Zoning Code to remove consideration of proposed future use as a factor in approving demolition requests. The Plan Commission shall consider the seven approval standards in §28.185(9)(c) M.G.O. when making a determination regarding demolition requests and find them met in order to approve. The factors include a finding that the proposed demolition or removal is consistent with the statement of purpose of the demolition permits section and with the health, prosperity, safety, and welfare of the City of Madison. The statement of purpose in Section 28.185 states, in part:

"The purpose of this section is therefore to ensure the preservation of historic buildings, encourage applicants to strongly consider relocating rather than demolishing existing buildings, aid in the implementation of adopted City plans, maximize the reuse or recycling of materials resulting from a demolition, protect the public from potentially unsafe structures and public nuisances..."

In regards to Standards 1 and 6, related to the possible building relocation efforts and the condition of the building proposed for demolition, respectively, Staff do not believe these standards apply as the applicant is not proposing to demolish the building but rather add onto it.

Related to the historic value of the structures, staff notes Standard 4 states:

"The Plan Commission has received and considered the report of the City's historic preservation planner regarding the historic value of the property as well as any report that may be submitted by the Landmarks Commission."

The Landmarks Commission reviewed the demolition of the building at its April 15, 2024 meeting, and at that meeting found that the building at 6402 Schroeder Road "has no known historic value."

Standard 7, which includes references the standards 1-6 states that "The Plan Commission shall consider the factors and information specified in items 1-6 and find that the proposed demolition or removal is consistent with the statement of purpose of this section and with the health, prosperity, safety, and welfare of the City of Madison."

Staff believe the Demolition Permit standards can be found met subject to input at the public hearing and comments from reviewing agencies.

Conditional Use Standards

The Conditional Use approval standards state that the Plan Commission shall not approve a conditional use without due consideration of the City's adopted plan recommendations, design guidelines, supplemental regulations, and finding that all of the conditional use standards of MGO §28.183(6) are met. Please note, recent changes to state law requires that conditional use findings must be based on "substantial evidence" that directly pertains to each standard and not based on personal preference or speculation. Staff provides additional discussion regarding Standard 8:

Standard 8 states, "When applying the above standards to any new construction of a building or an addition to an existing building the Plan Commission shall find that the project creates an environment of sustained aesthetic desirability compatible with the existing or intended character of the area and the statement of purpose for the zoning district. In order to find that this standard is met, the Plan Commission may require the applicant to submit plans to the Urban Design Commission for comment and recommendation."

Staff notes that the site is located within Urban Design District #2 (UDD #2). As new buildings in UDD #2 require approval by the Urban Design Commission (UDC), the UDC is therefore an approving body for this request. At their meeting on June 12, 2024, the Urban Design Commission granted the proposal INITIAL APPROVAL (Legistar File <u>83459</u>). (A copy of the meeting report of the UDC has been included at the end of this staff report and the <u>Staff Report to the Urban Design Commission</u> is linked here as a reference). The motion, which passed with a unanimous vote, included the following conditions:

- Relook at the three blue colors to be sure they are compatible.
- Consider vinyl coated chain link fence material, in dark bronze or black.
- Relook at how the building transitions from old to new, and provide more cohesion between the two.
- The continued use of stone mulch in the existing planting beds is acceptable. New planting areas shall use bark mulch.
- The one Callery Pear tree is acceptable, though not preferred; the architectural issues are more important.

On balance, Staff believe the impact on the surroundings will be negligible due to several factors: 1) the modest increase in projected enrollment of just 32 students (which represents a roughly 10-percent increase in the current enrollment of 322 students), and 2) the lack of changes – regarding the hours of operation; the beforeand after-school programming (which helps dissipate peak traffic impacts by spreading it over a longer timeframe); and the current arrangement and striping of the parking lot (pick up/drop off lane (area), 138 automobile parking stalls, and counter-clockwise automobile circulation). Due to these factors, coupled with the initial approval granted by the Urban Design Commission at their meeting on June 12, Staff believe that the Conditional Use Standards can be found met subject to input at the public hearing and comments from reviewing agencies.

Supplemental Regulations

According to Table 28C-1 in MGO Section 28.032(1), '*Schools, Public and Private*' must adhere to the following Supplemental Regulations found in MGO §28.151:

- a) A facility established after the effective date of this ordinance within a predominantly residential or mixed-use area shall have vehicular access to a collector or higher classification street.
- b) Where the use is conditional, an appropriate transition area between the use and adjacent property may be required, using landscaping, screening, and other site improvements consistent with the character of the neighborhood.

Staff believe that these Supplemental Regulations are met.

Public Input

At time of writing, no public comments have been received regarding this proposal.

Conclusion

Staff believe the demolition permit and conditional use standards can be found met and recommends both requests be approved by the Plan Commission.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Chris Wells, 261-9135)

- That the Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find the demolition standards of approval met and **approve** the demolition of a street-facing facade at 6402 Schroeder Road; and
- The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find the conditional use standards of approval met and **approve** the alteration to an approved conditional use for a private school to allow construction of an addition at 6402 Schroeder Road.

These requests are subject to input at the public hearing and the following comments and conditions recommended by reviewing agencies.

Recommended Conditions of Approval Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Engineering Division (Main Office) (Contact Timothy Troester, (608) 267-1995)

1. Proposed addition built above private utilities. Recommend applicant verify condition of facilities (sewer lateral, private storm, water lateral).

- Madison Metropolitan Sewerage District (MMSD) charges are due and payable prior to Engineering sign-off, unless otherwise collected with a Developer's / Subdivision Contract. Contact Mark Moder (608-261-9250) to obtain the final MMSD billing a minimum of two (2) working days prior to requesting City Engineering signoff. (MGO 16.23(9)(d)(4)
- 3. An Erosion Control Permit is required for this project. See Storm comments for permit specific details and requirements.
- 4. A Storm Water Management Permit is required for this project. That will be used for tracking purposes.
- 5. Revise the site plan to show all existing public sanitary sewer facilities in the project area as well as the size, invert elevation, and alignment of the proposed service. (POLICY)
- 6. This project will disturb 4,000 sf or more of land area and require an Erosion Control Permit. Submit the Erosion Control Permit Application (with USLE calculations and associated fee) to Megan Eberhardt (west) at <u>meberhardt@cityofmadison.com</u>, or Daniel Olivares (east) at <u>daolivares@cityofmadison.com</u>, for approval. The permit application can be found on City Engineering's website at <u>http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/Permits.cfm</u>.

Demonstrate compliance with Section 37.07 and 37.08 of the Madison General Ordinances regarding permissible soil loss rates. Include Universal Soil Loss Equation (USLE) computations for the construction period with the erosion control plan. Measures shall be implemented in order to maintain a soil loss rate below 5.0 tons per acre per year. The WDNR provided workbook to compute USLE rates can be found online at https://dnr.wi.gov/topic/stormwater/publications.html

- All outstanding Madison Metropolitan Sewerage District (MMSD) charges are due and payable prior to Engineering sign-off, unless otherwise collected with a Developer's / Subdivision Contract. Contact Mark Moder (608-261-9250) to obtain the final MMSD billing a minimum of two (2) working days prior to requesting City Engineering signoff. (MGO 16.23(9)(d)(4)
- 8. The 2 buildings currently share a sanitary sewer lateral. Each lot/building shall have a separate sewer lateral as a condition of approval.

City Engineering - Mapping (Contact Julius Smith, (608) 264-9276)

9. Provide for review, comprehensive reciprocal easements and agreements including, but not limited to, access, common areas, storm management that are necessary to accomplish the land division or site development as proposed prior to final sign off. The document(s) shall be executed and recorded immediately subsequent to the CSM recording and prior to building permit issuance. The proposed new 14x23 dumpster enclosure lies within the Loading Dock Easement area per Document No. 5368755. Provided an amended agreement or necessary permissions from adjacent owner to construct within the loading dock area. Additionally Prior building plans showed a storm structure within the loading area that appears to be connected to the unknown structure that the current building and building addition is being located over. Drainage of the loading area may rely on the unknown structure and lines that lie under the proposed improvements. There maybe unclear or undefined rights via the loading dock area agreement afforded to Lot 2 (6416 Schroeder Rd) via the loading dock area. consider redefining the responsibility of the storm structure if it does exist in the loading area with an amendment to the agreement and show the structure on the plan.

10. Coordinate and request from the utility companies serving this area the easements required to serve this development.

Zoning Administrator (Contact Jenny Kirchgatter, (608) 266-4429)

- 11. Section 28.185(9)(b) requires that every applicant for a demolition or removal approval that requires approval by the Plan Commission is required to get a Reuse and Recycling Plan approved by the City Recycling Coordinator, Bryan Johnson at streets@cityofmadison.com prior to receiving a raze permit. Every person who is required to submit a reuse and recycling plan pursuant to Section 28.185(9)(b) shall submit documents showing compliance with the plan within sixty (60) days of completion of demolition. A demolition or removal permit is valid for two (2) years from the date of the Plan Commission approval.
- 12. Bicycle parking for the school shall comply with the requirements of Sections 28.141(4)(g) and 28.141(11). A minimum of 45 short-term bicycle parking stalls are required (1 space per 5 students). The applicant proposes 30 bicycle stalls. A bicycle parking reduction will be required per Section 28.141(5). Submit a request for a bicycle parking reduction with the final plan submittal including information to support the argument for reducing the required number of spaces.
- 13. Submit the landscape plan and landscape worksheet stamped by the registered landscape architect. Per Section 28.142(3) Landscape Plan and Design Standards, landscape plans for zoning lots greater than ten thousand (10,000) square feet in size must be prepared by a registered landscape architect.
- 14. Per Section 28.186(4)(b), the property owner or operator is required to bring the property into compliance with all elements of the approved site plans by the date established by the Zoning Administrator as part of the site and building plan approval. Work with Zoning staff to establish a final site compliance date.
- 15. Signage approvals are not granted by the Plan Commission. Signage must be reviewed for compliance with Chapter 31 Sign Codes of the Madison General Ordinances and Chapter 33 Urban Design District ordinances. Signage permits are issued by the Zoning Section of the Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development.

Forestry Review (Contact Brandon Sly, (608) 266-4816)

- 16. An existing inventory of street trees located within the right of way shall be included on the site, demo, utility, landscape, grading, fire aerial apparatus and street tree plan sets. The inventory shall include the following: location, size (diameter at 4 1/2 feet), and species of existing street trees. The inventory should also note if a street tree is proposed to be removed and the reason for removal.
- 17. All proposed street tree removals within the right of way shall be reviewed by City Forestry before the Plan Commission meeting. Street tree removals require approval and a tree removal permit issued by City Forestry. Any street tree removals requested after the development plan is approved by the Plan Commission or the Board of Public Works and City Forestry will require a minimum of a 72-hour review period which shall include the notification of the Alderperson within who's district is affected by the street tree removal(s) prior to a tree removal permit being issued. Add as a note on the street tree plan set.
- 18. Contractor shall take precautions during construction to not disfigure, scar, or impair the health of any street tree. Contractor shall operate equipment in a manner as to not damage the branches of the street tree(s). This may require using smaller equipment and loading and unloading materials in a designated space

away from trees on the construction site. Any damage or injury to existing street trees (either above or below ground) shall be reported immediately to City Forestry at (608) 266-4816. Penalties and remediation shall be required. Add as a note on the site, grading, utility, demolition, and street tree plan set.

- 19. As defined by the Section 107.13 of City of Madison Standard Specifications for Public Works Construction: No excavation is permitted within 5 feet of the trunk of the street tree or when cutting roots over 3 inches in diameter. If excavation is necessary, the Contractor shall contact Madison City Forestry at (608) 266-4816 prior to excavation. City of Madison Forestry personnel shall assess the impact to the tree and to its root system prior to work commencing. Tree protection specifications can be found on the following website: <u>https://www.cityofmadison.com/business/pw/specs.cfm</u> Add as a note on the site, grading, utility, demolition and street tree plan sets.
- 20. Section 107.13(g) of City of Madison Standard Specifications for Public Works Construction (website: https://www.cityofmadison.com/business/pw/specs.cfm) addresses soil compaction near street trees and shall be followed by Contractor. The storage of parked vehicles, construction equipment, building materials, refuse, excavated spoils or dumping of poisonous materials on or around trees and roots within five (5) feet of the tree or within the protection zone is prohibited. Add as a note on both the site and street tree plan sets.
- 21. On this project, street tree protection zone fencing is required on the Schroeder Rd frontage. The fencing shall be erected before the demolition, grading or construction begins. The fence shall include the entire width of terrace and, extend at least 5 feet on both sides of the outside edge of the tree trunk. Do not remove the fencing to allow for deliveries or equipment access through the tree protection zone. Add as a note on both the site and street tree plan sets.
- 22. Street tree pruning shall be coordinated with City Forestry at a minimum of two weeks prior to the start of construction for this project. Contact City Forestry at (608)266-4816. All pruning shall follow the American National Standards Institute (ANSI) A300 Part 1 Standards for pruning. Add as a note on both the site and street plan sets.
- 23. The Developer shall submit a Street Tree Report performed by International Society of Arboriculture Certified Arborist prior to the Plan Commission meeting for City Forestry's review of project. This report shall identify all street trees on proposed project site, species type, canopy spread, tree condition, proposed tree removals, the impacts of proposed construction, and any requested pruning.

Metro Transit (Contact Timothy Sobota, 261-4289)

- 24. The City of Madison has approved the elimination of the existing Metro Transit bus stop on the north side of Schroeder Road, west of Rayovac Drive (#8514), adjacent this property with removal anticipated during Fall of 2024.
- 25. Metro Transit continues to operate daily all-day transit service along Schroeder Road near this property with trips at least every 30 minutes (every 15 minutes or less during the day on weekdays).
- 26. Metro Transit would initially estimate the following counts of potentially eligible trips towards US Green Building Council/LEED Quality Access to Transit points: 32 Weekday & 17 Weekend (average). Please contact Metro Transit if additional analysis would be of interest.

The following agencies have reviewed the requests and have recommended no conditions of approval:

Traffic Engineering; Fire Department; Parks Division; Water Utility; Parking