

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: October 5, 2011
TITLE: 5602 Odana Road – Minor Alteration to an Approved Comprehensive Design Review in UDD No. 3. 19 th Ald. Dist. (21364)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: October 5, 2011	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, Henry Lufler, Dawn O’Kroley, John Harrington and Melissa Huggins.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 5, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of a minor alteration to an approved Comprehensive Design Review located at 5602 Odana Road. Appearing on behalf of the project was Mary Beth Growney Selene, representing Ryan Signs, Inc. Appearing in support and available to answer questions was Ald. Mark Clear, District 19. Growney Selene discussed explained that the east elevation is no longer a good place for signage. While the back parking lot is not used heavily, it is used and their minor alteration is to utilize their south elevation and omit the east elevation. They also want approval for a yet-to-be-determined ground sign, if and when the time comes. The building is close to the road with parking in the back, it has an additional setback from Odana Road at around 15-20 feet. Going by code, their sign would be located close to the lot line, so they are seeking approval to put it at a 5-foot or maximum setback variance, if they decide to put one up, with a square footage of no more than 40 square feet.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- How are you going to determine if you do need a monument sign?
 - Likely by patient feedback.
- Have you considered a monument sign right away over the building signage?
 - The building likes the signage.
- I think you’re more likely to see the wall sign coming down Odana Road.
- I would not be comfortable providing carte blanche approval for a sign until it came back with details.
- The south elevation is overbearing, crowds building.
- The building is horizontal and you’ve got the sign that is a big block as opposed to integrating with the architecture. The monument sign seems to make a lot of sense.
- Where would the ground sign go? Will it meet the setback? You’d be asking for a setback variance.

Growney Selene asked if the monument sign is off the table, can the applicant withdraw the Comprehensive Design Plan? No, not if it’s already been approved. That’s a question for the City Attorney.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Lufler, the Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this project. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (7-0). The motion recommended that the client and applicant investigate alternatives for ground signs if they cannot find a resolution for the building signage.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3, 4 and 4.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 5602 Odana Road

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	4	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	4	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	3	-	-	3

General Comments:

- Overkill.
- Not good comp design.