



Project Name & Address: 6 Lathrop Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the University Heights historic district.

Legistar File ID # [57547](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: October 10, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Troy Shibilski

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new garage structure

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located in the University Heights Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

41.23 UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (4) Standards for the Review of New Structures in the TR-V1, TR-V2, TR-U1, TR-U2, TR-C2, TR-C3, TR-C4, MNX, TSS, and LMX Zoning Districts.
 - (a) Principal Structures.
 - 1. Height. The maximum height in the TR-C2, TR-C3, TR-C4, TR-V1, and TR-V2 Zoning Districts shall be thirty-five (35) feet and shall not exceed two and a half (2-1/2) stories except as provided in the height regulations for the district.

The maximum height in the TR-U1, NMX, TSS, and LMX Zoning Districts shall be forty (40) feet.

The maximum height in the TR-U2 Zoning District shall be fifty (50) feet. All new structures in all zoning districts within University Heights shall be no less than fifteen (15) feet high.
 - 2. Materials. Materials for the exterior walls shall be the same as or similar to materials prevalent in the University Heights Historic District. Permitted materials include brick, narrow gauge horizontal clapboards four or less inches in exposed width, stone, stucco, smooth shingles or combinations of the above provided the combinations occur in a manner and location similar to the materials on existing structures in University Heights (e.g., brick on first floor with clapboard on second floor). Other materials, such as aluminum or vinyl

must be visually compatible with structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property. The following materials are prohibited: concrete block, asbestos, wide clapboards over four inches in exposed width, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles, shakes.

3. Visual Size. The gross area of the front facade, i.e., all walls facing the street, of a single-family, two-unit or commercial structure shall be no greater than one hundred twenty-five percent (125%) of the average gross area of the front facades of structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property. The gross area of the front facade of a multiple family dwelling shall be no more than one hundred twenty-five percent (125%) of the average gross area of the front facades of all structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property or variations in the setback shall be designed in the front facade of the structure to repeat the rhythm and proportions of structures to space between them within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property.
 4. Roof Shape. The shapes and pitches of roofs shall be similar to the roof shapes and pitches on existing structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property.
 5. Roof Materials. Roofing materials shall be similar in appearance to roofing materials used on structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property. Modern-style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, Dutch lap, French method and interlock shingles, that are incompatible with the historic character of the district are prohibited. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the ground.
 6. Parking Lots. No new parking lots will be approved unless they are accessory to and on the same zoning lot as a commercial structure or multiple family dwelling.
- (b) Accessory Structures. Accessory structures, as defined in Section 28.211, MGO, shall be compatible with the design of the existing structures on the zoning lot, shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height and shall be as unobtrusive as possible. No accessory structure shall be erected in any yard except a rear yard. Exterior wall materials shall be the same as those for construction of new principal structures as set forth in Sec. 41.24(4)(a)2.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace to replace in-kind a garage that was destroyed by a tree earlier in the year. The design of the garage is in keeping with the simple gable-front garage style of the previous garage. There are a few details about the projects (siding material, window & door specifications) that still need to be finalized, but overall the project appears to meet the standards for the district.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

- (4) Standards for the Review of New Structures in the TR-V1, TR-V2, TR-U1, TR-U2, TR-C2, TR-C3, TR-C4, MNX, TSS, and LMX Zoning Districts.
 - (a) Principal Structures.
 1. Height. This standard is for principal structures.
 2. Materials. The applicant is proposing aluminum for the soffits and fascia. It is unclear what materials are proposed for the siding of the garage. However, the design appears to be compatible with the style of the pre-existing garage and

staff can work with the applicant on the details of those materials to ensure that they will meet the requirements of this standard.

3. Visual Size. This standard is for principal structures.
 4. Roof Shape. This standard is for principal structures.
 5. Roof Materials. This standard is for principal structures.
 6. Parking Lots. N/A
- (b) Accessory Structures. The proposed replacement garage will be under 15' in height at approximately 14' at the roof ridge, and it will be constructed in the rear yard on the pre-existing concrete pad from the previous garage. The exterior materials need to comply with Sec. 41.24(4)(a)2. Otherwise the proposed replacement garage appears to meet the design of the garage previously located on the property.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness can be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the proposal with the following conditions:

1. Siding and trim specifications approved to be by staff
2. Pedestrian door, garage door, and window specifications to be approved by staff