

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: March 22, 2006	
TITLE: 202 State Street – Demolition and Exterior Remodeling and Fourth-Story Addition to a Retail/Commercial Building in C4 District. 4 th Ald. Dist.	REFERRED:	
	REREFERRED:	
	REPORTED BACK:	
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED:	POF:
DATED: March 22, 2006	ID NUMBER:	

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Lisa Geer, Lou Host-Jablonski, Cathleen Feland, Jack Williams, Robert March and Ald. Noel Radomski.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of March 22, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a demolition and exterior remodeling and fourth-story addition to a retail/commercial building in C4 District. Appearing on behalf of the project were Jason Ekstrom and Rosemary Lee. The plans as presented featured the following:

- Additional windows have been added on the elevator façade's facets of the tower featuring deep sills.
- The issue with the location of the ATM at the apex of the corner in the face of the elevator tower could not be provided on its exterior face due to the size and type of available automatic teller equipment; therefore it will be located within an interior security accessible lobby.
- Typical wall signage details were presented illustrating the use of uniformed raceways to provide for the location of proposed wall signage to be further developed in consultation with staff.

ACTION:

On a motion by Host-Jablonski, seconded by Geer, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-0-1) with Feland abstaining. The motion required that no backlit letters are to be displayed with all signage to be located on a uniform raceway to color match the building, specific details of the signage package to be approved by staff.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4.5, 7, 7, 7.5, 8, 8 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 202 State Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	8	-	-	4	-	8	8
	-	9	-	-	5	6	8	8
	7	7	-	7	6	7	7	7
	-	7	-	-	-	-	8	7.5
	-	4.5	-	-	-	-	-	4.5
	6	7	7	7	7	-	8	7
	-	8	-	8	8	-	8	8

General Comments:

- Good idea to put ATM in vestibule. Good work!
- Fabulous adaptive reuse. Sign to comply with a permanent raceway and no box.
- Solid, straightforward reuse of historic elements. It would have been very interesting to see a fresher reinterpretation, but this is still very good.
- Applaud reusing/recycling building materials, however, concerned with too many historic elements pieced together without a new or fresh use. Disheartening project, in a prominent location.