

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 8/12/19

TITLE: 2127 Regent St - Exterior Alteration in the
University Heights Hist. Dist. -
Replacement of roof; 5th Ald. Dist.

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 8/19/19

ID NUMBER: 56855

Members present were: Richard Arnesen, Katie Kaliszewski, Arvina Martin, and David McLean. Excused was Anna Andrzejewski.

SUMMARY:

Timothy Szczykutowicz, registering in support and available to answer questions

Bailey explained that the project involves replacing the existing tile roofing, which is metal to replicate a clay tile appearance. She discussed the applicable standards, which state that if the existing roof is original, the roof must be repaired rather than replaced, but for this case also provides the option to re-roof with a material that approximates the appearance of the original as closely as possible. She said that the existing tile pattern is a barrel, horizontal plane, barrel, and the proposed replacement tile is inverted barrels, which has more of a scalloped appearance. She said that the standards could be met if the applicant explores repairing areas of failed roofing with limited replacement of failed tiles and if they replace the roofing with a tile that replicates the original design.

Arnesen asked if the existing roof is original. Bailey said that it is likely to be original materials. Arnesen asked if the actual roof was original, or was replaced at some point. Bailey said there is no documentation of that, as the oldest photo of the house they have is from the 1980s-90s. Arnesen asked if it would have been a metal roof in 1923 when the house was constructed. Bailey said metal roofing products were available, and using metal tile in University Heights at that time wouldn't be unheard of. She said that it comes down to the fact that they don't know if it is original, but it has been there for a while.

Szczykutowicz said that there is nothing underneath the metal, so it is only the metal and wood underneath with no plywood or planking in between. He said that the contractors thought the tile roofing was probably original. Regarding the unique needs of the Mediterranean-style house, he said that they did their due diligence in talking to many contractors, but could not find a contractor they wanted to work with who could get the barrel-flat tile design. He said that only one contractor out of the many they spoke with had a barrel-flat tile, but the contractor was not someone they wanted to work with because of a long response time and inaccurate estimate for the work. He said that the change in the type of metal roofing is not visible from the street. Regarding Bailey's recommendation to repair the roof, he said that they have had a tarp on one side for almost a year, the south side has ice damage, and the west side has birds living in the barrels and the crown molding is falling off. He said that there are active failings happening all over the house causing internal leaks, and it would all need to be replaced.

Kaliszewski asked the applicant if he thought he could find a metal roof like what is currently there. Szczukutowicz said that Bailey provided some links to suppliers where you can get a flat barrel, and he reviewed all of them; however, it is not offered by their contractor or any contractor in Madison that they want to work with. He said that other companies had tiles with a similar barrel style, but a different texture like asphalt, which he said that he did not want because it seems less historic. He said that there are also products made of sheet metal, but the one they are proposing is aluminum, which will last longer.

Kaliszewski asked if Szczukutowicz plans to apply for tax credits. Szczukutowicz said that they have not looked into it. Kaliszewski said that the tax credit reviewers will care more about the appearance of the roof. Bailey said that they will use the Secretary of the Interior's Standards in their review for tax credits, which will emphasize replacing in kind. Szczukutowicz said that they have contacted six companies and spoke to another six on the phone, and only three could provide a quote. He asked the Commission if they think the proposed materials would meet the requirements for an in-kind replacement.

McLean asked if the roofing being replaced is just the awnings, and if the main roof is flat. Szczukutowicz said that the main roof is currently flat rubber EPDM, but they plan to replace it as well. He pointed out that there is real terracotta on the front caps on the top of the house, and he was able to find similar replacement materials for the terracotta. McLean said that he understands the pain of trying to find a contractor when they are not readily available. Bailey said that she did not know the cornice caps were terracotta, and that makes her think the metal roof might be a replacement. Arnesen said that it is hard to imagine the roof would last 96 years. Szczukutowicz said that one contractor said that the overhang couldn't support the weight of terracotta tiles. McLean said that he looked into some of the roofing products, and found that it was common to have a textured finish on the barrel flats. He said that he found some smooth barrel flats, but the proportions were not the same. McLean referenced the standards, which state that original materials "must be repaired rather than replaced..." and said that must is a strong word. Kaliszewski said that it does allow them to approve something that approximates the appearance. McLean said that it is either a smooth finish with different proportions or a grainy finish with some flats. Arnesen said that the grainy tiles are horrible. Kaliszewski said that grainy tiles would approximate the wrong appearance. Arnesen said that he thinks the proposed material does approximate the existing materials, pointing out that it does not replicate, but does approximate as the standards require.

ACTION:

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Arnesen, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion passed by voice vote/other.