

## AGENDA # 11

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	<b>PRESENTED:</b> December 7, 2011
TITLE: 1323 West Dayton Street – PUD-SIP Eight-Story Apartment Building with 73 Units. 8 <sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist. (24690)	<b>REFERRED:</b> <b>REREFERRED:</b> <b>REPORTED BACK:</b>
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	<b>ADOPTED:</b> <b>POF:</b>
DATED: December 7, 2011	<b>ID NUMBER:</b>

---

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Marsha Rummel, Dawn O’Kroley, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, and John Harrington.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of December 7, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a PUD-SIP located at 1323 West Dayton Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Randy Bruce and Jim Stoppel, both representing Madison Property Management. Bruce discussed plans for a site on Dayton Street and displayed images from the East Campus Neighborhood Plan, showing the site’s relationship to campus, Camp Randall and the University. They have received initial approval for the concept from the Landmarks Commission; their concerns were how this building would relate to the old fire station. The building fronts Dayton Street relatively tight at the street edge but will be setback about 10-feet in one area. Access for parking would come in off Randall Court and leave Dayton Street as a pedestrian-oriented façade. The floor plans include a common space on the first floor, housing on the upper levels, and a proposed rooftop terrace for residents with views towards the west and Camp Randall. Materials being discussed are light gray masonry brick; Landmarks requested they use a material on the upper levels that was substantially different than the fire station to create a difference when looking from afar. Vertical elements would be a metal panel in charcoal gray and terra cotta.

Comments from the Commission were as follows:

- I’m not sure about having the 3-story piece relating to the fire station. As you’re walking down the street it’s not going to feel any different. If you get rid of the bay it might make a difference. It seems like an appendage.
- I was struggling with what didn’t work for me. I think if that were built every time I’d drive by I’d think “what a cool fire house, and what the heck is next to it?”
  - One thing to think about, if you look at the student union, you have 3-4 stories right there, if you have outdoor seating they would literally look towards the fire house and this building. Perspective isn’t just at pedestrian level, it’s higher too.
- I have mixed feelings about whether the lower building should stay or not. You could do something with colored glass on the top. You should go out there and look at what kinds of views you have.
- In terms of the 3-story height, what if on Dayton Street instead of projecting out was the metal piece projecting forward, almost giving the fire station more room by pulling back and projecting on the west.

- I think it's beautiful the way it relates to the fire house, but it does look like the landlord that held out, wouldn't sell the property and you had to build behind it.
  - Our intention was something that had more masonry and scale to it that would relate to the fire house, but in a much more contemporary fenestration.

**ACTION:**

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6 and 6.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1323 West Dayton Street**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	-	6	-	-	-	-	7	6
	-	6	-	-	-	-	6	6

General Comments:

- Respect the historic fire station by eliminating the 3-story box. Appreciate the ped scale but prefer a well designed tall building.
- Three story face not essential, detracts.
- The two buildings need a stronger relationship.