



Project Name/Address: 308 S Paterson
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in historic district
Legistar File ID # [50155](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: January 22, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: James McFadden, McFadden & Company
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations to a building in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located on S. Paterson Street in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District and has TSS zoning (mixed use/commercial).

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Section:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) NA
 - (b) NA
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.
- 41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**
- (7) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use.
 - (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (a) Height
 - (b) Alterations of street façade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids

- (c) Alterations of street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- (d) Alterations of roof shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

This building no longer serves as a residence. In order to bring this commercial building up to meet current code, it is necessary to install a ramp and make other exterior alterations.

A brief discussion of the standards of 41.23(7) follows:

- a) The height of the existing building is not changing. The visually compatible area map is attached for general reference.
- b) The rhythm of solids to voids is changing in a minor way. The existing front door location is being moved to the side to accommodate the placement of the proposed ramp and in the place of the existing door, a small window is being installed on the front façade.
- c) The beveled and shingle siding shown in the historic photos will be reinstalled to recreate the historic appearance of the exterior wall materials.
- d) The historical roof appearance is being affected by this alteration. The historical front porch roof is being removed and roof extensions are being added on the front and side. Generally, the vernacular roof form is being retained. The added roof extension on the front façade is unnecessary. In addition, the roof extension obscures the historic gable form of the front façade. Two skylights are being added on the north roof slope which further affects the historical roof appearance. The north roof slope faces the historic district boundary.

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the alteration request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. The proposed exterior alterations generally improve the appearance of the existing building, but the roof alterations may frustrate the public interest in protecting the vernacular character and appearance of the historic resource.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the alterations may be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

1. The roof extension at the front facade shall be removed so that the existing gable is unobstructed. The side roof extension can remain, but should be held back a few inches from the rake of the main roof.
2. The Commission shall discuss the appropriateness of the addition of skylights on the north slope of the roof.