

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: March 21, 2007
TITLE: 702 North Midvale Boulevard – Hilldale Redevelopment – PUD(SIP), Hotel. 11 th Ald. Dist. (04090)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: March 21, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Ald. Noel Radomski, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods*, Lisa Geer and Michael Barrett.

*Woods abstained from deliberations on this item.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of March 21, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a PUD(SIP) for the Hilldale Mall Redevelopment. Appearing on behalf of the project were Domenic Lanni, Mike Sturm and Ray White. The purpose of the informational presentation, according to Lanni was to provide additional feedback on the development of a hotel component of the Hilldale redevelopment SIP, in conjunction with two parks (an open space park along Frey Street and a terrace park abutting Sawyer Terrace). The hotel and the two parks were a component of the amended overall PUD-GDP for the Hilldale redevelopment approved in the fall of 2006. The plans contained within the Urban Design Commission's packet provide for the development of a 11-story building featuring 140 rooms with vehicular drop-off and staging area along with the revised surface parking layout in conjunction with the development of the two park areas. Lanni noted that the presentation documents have been modified and now include a structured parking facility in lieu of a the restructured surface parking area as part of the hotel component of the project based on issues with necessary parking accommodations to facilitate the hotel development. He then proceeded to provide schematic and conceptual details of the hotel as it relates to the existing mall, the proposed structured parking ramp, its relationship to the terrace park and upper open space park at the corner of Sawyer Terrace and Frey Street. Lanni noted that revised plans for the hotel now provided for 12-stories with a ground floor entrance, a second story featuring banquet and meeting space including a rework of the rear main entry of Macy's (similar in appearance to its front entry) emphasizing the redo of the existing parking lot in favor of structured parking including an urban streetscape with the ramp anticipated to be two levels above the existing surface parking area. The terrace park adjacent to the ramp includes terrace rain gardens for stormwater infiltration. Following the presentation, the Commission noted the following:

- The addition of the parking ramp structure does not provide for a sufficient buffer or transition area between its Sawyer Terrace and Frey Street frontages; the face of the ramp and access drive has no screening.

- Consider creating a greater connection between the open space along Frey Street, the terrace park and the hotel by making the top of the parking deck the lobby of the hotel along with an entry plaza to enhance the pedestrian experience and provide connectivity between the two parks.
- Bothered by the lack of grading information with the model and plans, including the parking structure. The absence of grading details does not provide sufficient basis to react to.
- The terrace park is now squeezed by the parking structure, not as inviting. Consider flipping the plan as an alternative to relocate the terrace park line with the open space park to provide more connectivity between the two open space areas.
- Look at bike friendly traffic control mechanisms within the drive aisle access between the base of the parking structure and hotel; not rumble strips.
- Consider the incorporation of landscaping elements that tie the parking structure, along with considerations for what mechanisms are necessary to enclose truck loading docks affiliated with the hotel operation.
- The plan that was provided within the Urban Design Commission's packet relevant to the development of surface parking and pedestrian plaza at the front of the hotel in conjunction with its connectivity with the terrace park and upper open space park is now disrupted with the incorporation of the ramp.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 4, 5 and 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 702 North Midvale Boulevard

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	6	5	-	-	5	5	5
	5	-	-	-	-	5	5	5
	4	-	-	-	-	-	4	4

General Comments:

- The concept of adding a multi-story hotel to a mall is a good one. Reconsider siting of hotel vis-à-vis parking structure.
- Really not “cooked” concepts yet. The parking garage at the sidewalk (yuk!) really divides the open spaces, and guarantees that the “amphitheater” will become merely an unused green.
- Plaza at entry and open space compliment each other nicely. Like the idea of the parking structure over the existing lot. There is some concern about the views from the hotel rooms – screen the parking structure if possible. Make sure the parking structure does not become an obstacle to reach the hotel or open spaces from above.
- Full parking garage to south – bring park to north (study this). Locate hotel on top of garage? Good informational presentation.
- Review location of parking structure – increase landscaping/streetscaping in front of parking structure.