

AGENDA # 8.

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: October 19, 2005
TITLE: 202 North Charter Street – PUD(GDP-SIP), Apartment Building with First Floor Retail.	REFERRED:
	REREFERRED:
	REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: William A. Fruhling, Acting Secretary	ADOPTED:
	POF:
DATED: October 19, 2005	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Bruce Woods, Lou Host-Jablonski (Chair), Lisa Geer, Ald. Noel Radomski, Todd Barnett, Cathleen Feland, Robert March and Michael Barrett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 19, 2005, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) for a 6-story building containing 3,000 square feet of retail and 25 apartment units located at 202 North Charter Street. Michael Gordon, project architect, stated that the retail space was slightly reduced and some columns shifted to increase the bicycle parking in the building to 66 spaces. He reviewed the building materials which consist primarily of ground face concrete masonry units on the base, and hard coat stucco and red corrugated metal panels on the upper floors. Several members of the Commission stated that the building was better when it was taller, as originally proposed. Eric Lawson, Craig Hungerford, Bryce Armstrong, and Jill Buechner registered in support.

ACTION:

On a motion by Geer, seconded by March, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP-SIP) for a 6-story building containing 3,000 square feet of retail and 25 apartment units located at 202 North Charter Street, subject to:

1. The architect exploring the feasibility of introducing an additional horizontal railing below the top horizontal railing on the corner balconies for staff approval.

The motion was passed on a vote of (7-1-1) with March voting no and Wagner abstaining.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5.5, 6, 6.5, 7, 7 and 8, with 3 abstentions from the rating process.

ADDITIONAL ACTION:

After approval of this project, the Commission discussed formally conveying their thoughts on the outcome of this proposal to the Plan Commission.

On a motion by Woods, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission expressed the feeling that there was a missed opportunity at this site by having to reduce the scale of the building to meet non-existent guidelines. These opportunities included:

- Higher density in a high density area where quality student housing is needed and is easily accessible to the University;
- And the loss of amenities, such as the green roof.

The motion included that this action be communicated to the Plan Commission verbally and in writing.

The motion passed on a vote of (8-0-1), with Wagner abstaining.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 202 North Charter Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	5	6	-	6	6	6
	6	6	5	-	-	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	6	6	-	-	-	7	7	-
	6	7	6	7	-	6	7	7
	-	6.5	-	-	-	-	5	6.5
	-	6	-	6	-	-	4	5.5
	7	8	8	-	-	7	9	8

General Comments:

- There is still no plan, yet we are now expected to approve a building stripped of great amenities (green roof, etc.). Very disappointing!
- Look at railing design. Would have been better taller.
- A missed opportunity for a taller structure and better and higher density.
- The process has failed this project at this location. Technicalities and lack of vision have resulted in a less appropriate building with fewer amenities.
- Missed opportunity for additional floors/address adjacent context.
- Proper use of this site – nice design.