

AGENDA # 9

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: May 19, 2010
TITLE: 117 North Charter Street – PUD(GDP) for Charter Street Heating Plan Upgrades. 8 th Ald. Dist. (16323)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: May 19, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Slayton, Todd Barnett, Mark Smith, Bruce Woods and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of May 19, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a PUD(GDP) located at 117 North Charter Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Alan Fish, Gary Brown and Robert Mangas, representing UW-Madison. Brown reviewed the changes to each of the phases of the plan as they correspond to the individual SIP phases of the project. Revised plans show more vibrant silos. The revised landscape plan includes bio-plant displays. Truck entry off of Spring Street and night lighting are being investigated. Mangas noted that the GDP does not have a lot of change; those changes will be coming back at each SIP stage. He stated this was an opportunity for comment from the Commission as to what they want to see on the SIP. Comments from the Commission were as follows:

- Prefer very stark. Having triangles elsewhere takes away from them.
- Stark wall with vine growing on it will be great.
- Why are there openings on the fence line? Don't block them with spirea.
- Would like to see a variation in the vines on the fence line. Don't block them with evergreens; boring.
- Like the starkness of the silos versus texturing.
- Appreciate the exploration of textured concrete. You are doing your due diligence. Particularly excited about the possibility of the white concrete.
- Feel good about how you are approaching each individual piece of this project as you move forward.
- Make the component parts simple; gives them a more organic nature.
- Not sure about jump form or slip form. Don't quite have the confidence that white concrete will give you the same character and color as the displayed images. Need something more to persuade me that that will work. It has to work up close and far away. When returning with future phases bring in information on ongoing process.
- Fine with the slip form or the jump form; my gut is to go the slip and just let it be a simple form without any ornamentation relative to the silos. In addition:
 - Keep simple and don't enforce form and shape from other portions of the project.
 - Silos are big and will be seen from a distance, need more information on appearance of different forms slip versus jump, bring in samples and provide perspectives and images that deal with spacing in between silos.

- Relate to historic form of silos or think about what will be provided as an alternative.
- Acknowledge how silos meet ground and sky; even though brick base is not favorable, need to address.
- White concrete with light sandblast finish will pick-up general atmosphere around it better than plain grey concrete.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Smith, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** with further address of comments with future phase SIPs. The motion was passed on a vote of (4-0).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7, 8 and 9.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 117 North Charter Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	9
	9	9	-	-	-	9	4	-
	6	8	6	-	-	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	8

General Comments:

- Very promising start.