



Project Name & Address: 511 N Carroll Street
Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for a new signage
Legistar File ID # [83039](#)
Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: April 30, 2024

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Mary Beth Growney Selene; Ryan Signs, Inc.
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of two new signs.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject property is a designated landmark located in the Mansion Hill historic district.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.
- (3) Signs. The Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs if it finds that the following are true:
 - (a) Signs are located within the façade areas set aside for signs as part of the façade design or are integrated and compatible with the structure where the façade areas have not been set aside for signs;

- (b) New signs shall be consistent with the traditional signage pattern locations on a structure or a property, and shall feature materials and style of illumination typical of the period of significance for the property or district;
- (c) Signs shall comply with Chapter 31, MGO;
- (d) Signs shall comply with specific standards and guidelines adopted for historic districts under this ordinance.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.
4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed project is to install two wall signs on the principal structure: one above the front door and the other above the rear door. The building is a two-story masonry, Italianate building constructed in 1858 as the home of Willett and Jennie Main. This property was designated as a Madison Landmark in 2013 primarily because it has served as the Alano Society House since 1948, and secondarily for its association with Willett Main. The Alano Society provides support for individuals recovering from alcohol addiction. As the building still retains its original residential character, this can create confusion for clients when they are determining how to enter the building. The Alano Society wants to aid the clients it serves by incorporating discrete signage that identifies the appropriate entrances for those clients. The building is served by both a rear parking lot with an associated rear entrance and the front door that serves pedestrians and those utilizing street parking.

The signage is proposed to be affixed to the wall, next to the front entrance door and above the rear entrance door and attached with stainless steel fasteners in the masonry joints. The signage will be located in the places

that we frequently find it on residential form buildings that have shifted to a commercial use. The proposed signage will be removable and will not permanently alter the historic structure.

A discussion of relevant standards follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- (3) Signs. The Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs if it finds that the following are true:
- (a) The proposed signage is to be located on the walls in the places where we expect to find signage on a residential form building that has transitioned to a commercial use. The design will be separate from the building, but integrated so as to not obscure any architectural features.
 - (b) The new signs are consistent with the traditional signage pattern locations on these types of structures and there is no proposed additional illumination.
 - (c) Signs shall comply with Chapter 31, MGO;
 - (d) While this building is located within the Mansion Hill local historic district, there are no specific standards for signs in this historic district beyond the general standards for alterations, which are covered by the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for this designated landmark.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. There are no proposed changes to use and the additional signage will help support the ease of use for the clients of the Alano Society.
2. This will not change distinctive materials or features on the structure.
3. This signage will read as a product of its time and not introduce conjectural features that create a false sense of history.
4. N/A.
5. N/A.
6. N/A.
7. N/A.
8. N/A.
9. The new signage will read as new, but is being applied to the building in the locations where we would expect to find signage so that it is architecturally compatible with the structure.
10. The new signage will be installed in the masonry joints with stainless steel fasteners, so that it does not permanently alter the historic fabric of the building and could be removed in the future.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Install the signage with stainless steel fasteners at the masonry joints.