

AGENDA # 11

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: January 9, 2008
TITLE: 101-109 North Franklin Street - PUD (GDP) for the relocation of the Conklin House. 2nd Ald. Dist. (08666)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: January 9, 2008	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, Bonnie Cosgrove, Richard Wagner and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of January 9, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. Appearing on behalf of the project were J. Randy Bruce, Knothe & Bruce Architects, John Lesa and Ald. Brenda Konkel. The project provides for the combining of three adjacent lots located at 101-109 North Franklin Street which will be renovated to contain one dwelling unit with 3-bedrooms, three dwelling units with 9-bedrooms, and two dwelling units with 5-bedrooms. Existing detached garages at the rear of 101 and 107-109 Franklin Street will be demolished to provide for the relocation of the "Conklin House" from its current site on South Mills Street. The Conklin House will either be moved all at once or in sections, with a new stair tower provided at its rear on the relocated site's East Mifflin Street frontage. As part of its renovation, the existing 12-bedroom house will be converted to a 4-unit apartment building with 8-bedrooms. It is anticipated that the existing sandstone foundation at the Conklin House's existing location will be utilized as a foundation for the porch element only with the balance of the structure to be placed on a split face masonry block base, which is necessary to be in place when the building is moved. The exterior alterations to the remaining existing three structures on the site will include new windows, siding replacement and roofing, including historically accurate railings and other details, in addition to recovering and returning original porches to an open condition. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Not sure if this is the right spot to relocate, cramming a house into three lots that may not be best suited for it, house is not structured to fit at rear of three lots and houses doesn't mesh with the fabric of the area.
- Hard to approve with no bigger context with the interior of the block provided.

Erica Fox, representing the Madison Trust for Historic Preservation spoke in favor of the relocation of the house, noting her preference that the house be moved to Conklin Place, issues with the relocation site; its proximity to a proposed surface parking lot but comfortable with site as proposed.

Ald. Brenda Konkel spoke raising concerns with the appearance of the house in context with everything on the block. She also noted that there have been no neighborhood meetings to plan for January 30, 2008. She also noted that she was neither in support nor opposition.

Continued discussion by the Commission noted issues with the relocation site not good urban design, especially as adjacent to a proposed parking lot.

ACTION:

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Cosgrove, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (4-3-1) with Rummel, Ferm and Barnett voting no, and Woods abstaining. The motion for initial approval required address of the above stated concerns and the following:

- Discuss with City staff alternatives to the proposed surface parking lot as proposed to widen the driveway and provide for backing out of vehicles to minimize the amount of pavement and provide more greenspace, to reduce the number of parking stalls, as well as alternatives to the surface parking lot as proposed, including the elimination of all parking on the combined sites.
- In addition, further consideration of the project should be provided following a neighborhood meeting that staff requested to investigate any further consideration by the Landmarks Commission.*

*Upon investigation, staff found that the Plan Commission approval of the relocation of the Conklin House and contingencies for the demolition of the remaining house (1022 West Johnson Street) on the site required no further consideration by the Landmarks Commission of any consideration for the approval on relocation sites for either of the two houses affiliated with the residential redevelopment.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 6, 6 and 6.5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 101-109 North Franklin Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	8	-	-	-	-	8	6.5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	5	-	5	-	-	-	5	5
	6	-	5	-	-	-	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Kudos for moving the Conklin House. However, the parking lot in its front yard is an issue.
- I want this to work but not there yet. Improving adjacent properties is a benefit. Would like to see context of block – concern that majestic house being squeezed into a lot without side yards or greenspace.
- Good design in this situation, and the reality of parking in the dense city, suggests no parking on this site.
- Thanks for finding a home for Conklin House. Consider only 1 handicapped parking spot.
- Don't believe this location is the right choice for the project.