

AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: August 5, 2009
TITLE: 400 State Street – Lisa Link Peace Park Improvements in the C4 District. 4 th Ald. Dist. (14907)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: August 5, 2009	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Wagner, John Harrington, Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Richard Slayton, Todd Barnett, Jay Ferm, Ron Luskin and Mark Smith.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of August 5, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of the Lisa Link Peace Park improvements. Appearing on behalf of the project were Mike Sturm and Ken Saiki, representing Ken Saiki Design; Carter Arndt, representing MSA Professional Services; Bill Bauer, representing City of Madison Parks Division; and Mary Carbine, representing Madison Central BID. Prior to the presentation staff apprised the Commission of an ordinance amendment to allow for modifications to the height restrictions of buildings within the C4 Central Commercial District for City-owned parks when approved as a conditional use, which was just recently introduced and would allow for the Urban Design Commission's current consideration of a 1-story option for the park facility as currently proposed. Staff noted if the ordinance amendment failed, the project would require modifications to meet the current requirement for the establishment of 2-story structures on zoning lots which abut State Street. The revised plans featured the following:

- Incorporation of a full glass door and longer window openings on the stage side elevation (northeast).
- A redesign of the Gilman Street frontage provides for bicycle parking within the right-of-way.
- The incorporation of Philosopher's stone arrangements at the State Street entry featuring peace related quotations, hopefully by Lisa Link, and on benches within the circular seating area of the park's center.
- Building exterior changes emphasize the exposure of the return of the turret element at the corner as an interface between the State Street and stage side façade.
- A review of the building materials/color palette was provided, along with details of the signage concept.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Issue with the overall design elements providing an expression of a "Peace Park." The Philosopher's stones combined with quotations and signage may not be enough to speak to the tradition of peace in Madison with some sensitivity.
- Issue with the cone shape versus cylinder shape for the round element as differentially detailed within perspective renderings and various building elevations. In some instances, the cone appears to have a steep angle with less of a slope on other versions of the renderings; don't like the steep angle.

- Like cone with steep slope but reduce size and/or number of base projections below the vertical pilasters on the stage side elevation.
- Suggest the use of Wisconsin stone rather than manufactured stone.
- Replace the use of blue corian with stainless steel, stone or metal.
- Although the formal tree arrangement at the State Street entry was previously recommended, it conflicts; the third tree within the arrangement with an adjacent planter. As an alternative, move third tree to reduce its conflicts with the planter around the corner of the adjacent building.
- Relative to landscaping, adjust tree arrangement at State Street out of a four cluster pattern with the slight movement of the third tree around the corner of adjacent building.
- Add more bike parking within the Gilman Street right-of-way that relates to the circulation pattern plan for the park.
- Replace the use of Virginia Creeper and Viburnum due to maintenance issues.
- Architecture still doesn't fit context of State Street, especially historic buildings in area; need to consider a 2-story building consistent with the requirements of the C4 District.
- Design has gotten really nice.
- How much seating is provided today versus with proposal? Bring back comparative information.
- Play up theater appearance of the park side wall/façade more.
- Agree with Wagner on the on the extreme slope of the dome feature as not appropriate. Replace the use of corian due to its scratchability.
- The philosopher's stone needs to have Lisa Link quotes, graphics need more of Lisa Link and peace themes.
- Use stone benches to provide larger text opportunities for peace quotes, including walkways to distribute quotes throughout the park.
- Like the stone/masonry treatment of the State Street elevation, the horizontal banding on north (stage wall) is not necessary, eliminate spandrel glass on State Street and pull up stone base as a substitute.
- Like the four tree arrangement as a gateway to State Street as is.
- Need more history and message of park. Question whether or not the cone can be more of an artistic element rather than architecture.
- Make benches around the performance/jet spray feature longer than 4-feet, along with consideration for reducing the number of jets.
- Use frosted glass on the bottom panels on State Street as with the application on the stage side elevation within restrooms.
- Don't use blue tinted glass, use clear vision glass.

ACTION:

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-2) with Luskin and Rummel voting no. The motion required address of the above stated comments with the motion noting that the Urban Design Commission makes a finding that based on site specific approval as a one-story building because of its size, scale and context, a park with a pavilion type structure is appropriate with the C4 Central Commercial District.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5.5, 6, 6, 6, 7, 7.5, 8 and 9.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 400 State Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	7.5	7	7.5	7.5	7	7.5	8	7.5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	7	7	7	5	-	7	7	7
	-	-	5	6	-	-	5	6
	6	6	6	-	6	6	6	6
	8	6	7	8	5	9	9	8
	6	3	6	6	4	6	7	5.5
	6	7	6	6	-	6	7	6.5
	9	7	9	9	-	10	10	9

General Comments:

- A lot of very skilled designers at work here.
- Wonderful improvements.
- Lisa Link “story” still needed.
- Park plan is very successful. Need more of Lisa Link’s story and develop connection to world-wide peace park movement.
- The architecture doesn’t address park design or State Street. The cone/cylinder appears tacked on. Peace – Lisa Link – Women’s International League for Peace & Freedom missing for signage/feel of park. Make sure there is enough seating to make everyone feel welcome.
- A vibrant architecture in a somewhat subdued site design. More could be given to energize the site.
- Continues to improve. Simplify performance elevation. Alternative to corian.