



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Monday, October 4, 2010

4:45 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
Room LL-110 (Madison Municipal Building)

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Present: 6 -
Stuart Levitan; Christina Slattery; Bridget R. Maniaci; Daniel J. Stephans;
Robin M. Taylor and Michael J. Rosenblum

Excused: 1 -
Erica Fox Gehrig

APPROVAL OF September 20, 2010 MINUTES

A motion was made by Slattery, seconded by Taylor, to approve the September 20, 2010 minutes.
This motion was approved by a voice vote/other.

PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

PUBLIC HEARING - CONSIDERATION OF ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 19994** 2109 Chamberlain Avenue - University Heights Historic District - Demolition of existing garage building and construction of new garage building.
Contact: Don Bruns

Mr. Don Bruns described the proposed project. He explained that the condition of the garage was poor and that he was proposing to demolish the existing garage and construct a new garage that would be smaller than the one previously submitted for review. He handed out new drawings showing a 16' wide by 22' deep garage. He explained that he would like to reuse some new 3 over 1 double hung windows that match the house. One window would be located on the end elevation and one would be located on the backyard elevation next to the service door.

Mr. Levitan requested that Mr. Bruns address the points in the Wittenwyler email dated 9/27/10. Mr. Bruns stated that he disagreed with the presumption that the condition of the garage was exacerbated by his work on the site. He agreed that the original garage proposal was too large and explained that the new garage proposal would be preferred.

Alder Bidar-Sielaff registered to speak neither in support or in opposition. She noted that the submission materials were not detailed or complete. She said that the Applicant had not contacted her to discuss the project.

Mr. Bruns stated that American Garage Builders would be the contractors for the project. Mr. Stephans suggested that the contractor provide Mr. Bruns with more accurate drawings for submission to preservation staff.

Mr. Rosenblum asked if Mr. Bruns had reviewed the staff report and Mr. Bruns said he had.

A motion was made by Maniaci, seconded by Rosenblum, to approve the demolition of the existing garage and to approve the construction of a new garage with the following condition:

1. The Applicant shall submit architectural drawings showing accurate details for staff review of the smaller garage option (16' wide by 22' deep).

2. [19275](#)

40 North Roby Road - University Heights Historic District - Construct new addition including attached two car garage and renovation with variance request to alter roof height.

Contact: Amy Hasselman

Ms. Amy Hasselman described the proposed project. She explained the revisions that had been made since the informational review by the Landmarks Commission in July which included the reduced roof height on the existing residence and the configuration of windows on the addition. She also explained that the materials, siding exposure, roof pitch, and roof materials would match the existing residence. She explained that the new low sloped roofs would have dark metal roofs and the new main roof increase in height would have an EPDM with metal coping properly terminated and flashed. Ms. Hasselman explained that she had reviewed the staff report and followed the suggestions which are reflected in the drawings used for the presentation.

Alder Bidar-Sielaff noted that there was positive feed back from the neighbors.

Mr. Stephans stated that a metal roof is a historically appropriate material for the date of construction.

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Maniaci, to Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the proposed addition and exterior alterations, and to Approve a variance for the increase in building height.

The motion was passed by a voicevote/other.

CONSIDERATION OF ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

3. [20032](#) 923 Williamson Street - Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Exterior alterations including general exterior repairs, relocation of existing windows, installation of new window, modification of front railing, and construction of new addition and new patio. Contact: John Martens
- Mr. John Martens, Mr. Randy Ng and Mr. Michael Ding registered to speak. Mr. Martens described the proposed project. He requested that the window shown on the rear elevation of the submitted drawings be changed to a door. Mr. Martens provided drawings showing this revision.
- Alder Maniaci asked about materials to be used at patio. Mr. Martens explained that the patio would be a concrete slab with pavers.
- Alder Maniaci asked if there was a statement from the Alder. Mr. Martens explained that Alder Rummel was supportive.
- Ms. Taylor asked if there would be on-site parking. Mr. Martens explained that there would be on-site parking and that he was working with zoning.
- Mr. Rosenblum asked about materials to be used on the addition. Mr. Martens explained that the siding would be wood or cement board with exposure to match the existing siding. Mr. Stephens suggested ways to make the addition different than the existing building including constructing the addition with an offset on the rear addition.
- For full disclosure, Mr. Levitan wanted to make it known that he served on the Zoning Board of Appeals with Mr. Martens and has used the professional services of Mr. Martens, but he felt his involvement in this matter was not a conflict of interest.
- A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Maniaci, to Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition and exterior alterations with the following conditions:**
- 1. The window shown in the submission drawings shall be changed to a door.**
 - 2. The Applicant shall work with staff to finalize details of differentiating the addition appearance and installing a code compliant railing.**
- The motion passed with a voice vote/other.**

FINAL REVIEW AND APPROVAL

4. [20029](#) 666 Wisconsin Avenue - Mansion Hill Historic District - Review and approval of the rehabilitation of the exterior of the original 1946 Edgewater Hotel building.
- Contact: Amy Supple
- This case was rereferred to the October 25, 2010 meeting at the request of the Applicant.**

OLD BUSINESS

5. [17835](#) Landmarks Ordinance Revisions
- There was a general discussion about the quality of the Landmarks Commission submission standards. Staff explained that a description of the recommended and required submission items would be included in the proposed application that is being developed. The application will be reviewed at an upcoming meeting.
- Staff discussed options with the variance language and requested that the Landmarks Commission

simplify the list. There was a general discussion about ways to clarify the variance section.

Mr. Stephans suggested that the Landmarks Commission change its name to the Historic Preservation Commission as a way to better reflect the mission of the body. **A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Rosenblum, to Approve this revision and include it with the general ordinance revisions.**

This issue was Rereferred to the LANDMARKS COMMISSION for further discussion at the meeting on October 25, 2010.

6. [19902](#)

Landmark plaque procedure

Alder Maniaci reported that she requested landmark plaque funding in the capital budget.

There was a general discussion about the landmark plaque procedure and the preferred material of the plaque (bronze or aluminum).

This issue was Rereferred to the LANDMARKS COMMISSION for further discussion at the meeting on October 25, 2010.

NEW BUSINESS

7. [17150](#)

Buildings proposed for demolition - 2010

There was no discussion about the current building proposed for demolition.

8. [07804](#)

Secretary's Report

Staff explained the Downtown Plan Overview and Draft Recommendations booklet (September 23, 2010) that was included in the Commission packets.

ADJOURNMENT

**A motion was made by Slattery, seconded by Levitan, to Adjourn at 6:30 PM.
The motion passed by a voice vote/other.**