

---

**REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION****PRESENTED:** August 5, 2009**TITLE:** 400 State Street – Lisa Link Peace Park  
Improvements in the C4 District. 4<sup>th</sup> Ald.  
Dist. (14907)**REFERRED:****REREFERRED:****REPORTED BACK:****AUTHOR:** Alan J. Martin, Secretary**ADOPTED:****POF:****DATED:** August 5, 2009**ID NUMBER:**

---

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Wagner, John Harrington, Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Richard Slayton, Todd Barnett, Jay Ferm, Ron Luskin and Mark Smith.

**SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of August 5, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of the Lisa Link Peace Park improvements. Appearing on behalf of the project were Mike Sturm and Ken Saiki, representing Ken Saiki Design; Carter Arndt, representing MSA Professional Services; Bill Bauer, representing City of Madison Parks Division; and Mary Carbine, representing Madison Central BID. Prior to the presentation staff apprised the Commission of an ordinance amendment to allow for modifications to the height restrictions of buildings within the C4 Central Commercial District for City-owned parks when approved as a conditional use, which was just recently introduced and would allow for the Urban Design Commission's current consideration of a 1-story option for the park facility as currently proposed. Staff noted if the ordinance amendment failed, the project would require modifications to meet the current requirement for the establishment of 2-story structures on zoning lots which abut State Street. The revised plans featured the following:

- Incorporation of a full glass door and longer window openings on the stage side elevation (northeast).
- A redesign of the Gilman Street frontage provides for bicycle parking within the right-of-way.
- The incorporation of Philosopher's stone arrangements at the State Street entry featuring peace related quotations, hopefully by Lisa Link, and on benches within the circular seating area of the park's center.
- Building exterior changes emphasize the exposure of the return of the turret element at the corner as an interface between the State Street and stage side façade.
- A review of the building materials/color palette was provided, along with details of the signage concept.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Issue with the overall design elements providing an expression of a "Peace Park." The Philosopher's stones combined with quotations and signage may not be enough to speak to the tradition of peace in Madison with some sensitivity.
- Issue with the cone shape versus cylinder shape for the round element as differentially detailed within perspective renderings and various building elevations. In some instances, the cone appears to have a steep angle with less of a slope on other versions of the renderings; don't like the steep angle.

- Like cone with steep slope but reduce size and/or number of base projections below the vertical pilasters on the stage side elevation.
- Suggest the use of Wisconsin stone rather than manufactured stone.
- Replace the use of blue corian with stainless steel, stone or metal.
- Although the formal tree arrangement at the State Street entry was previously recommended, it conflicts with the third tree within the arrangements with an adjacent planter. As an alternative, move third tree to reduce its conflicts with the planter around the corner of the adjacent building.
- Relative to landscaping, adjust tree arrangement at State Street out of a four cluster pattern with the slight movement of the third tree around the corner of adjacent building.
- Add more bike parking within the Gilman Street right-of-way that relates to the circulation pattern plan for the park.
- Replace the use of Virginia Creeper and Viburnum due to maintenance issues.
- Architecture still doesn't fit context of State Street, especially historic buildings in area; need to consider a 2-story building consistent with the requirements of the C4 District.
- Design has gotten really nice.
- How much seating is provided today versus with proposal? Bring back comparative information.
- Play up theater appearance of the park side wall/façade more.
- Agree with Wagner on the on the extreme slope of the dome feature as not appropriate. Replace the use of corian due to its scratchability.
- The philosopher's stone needs to have Lisa Link quotes, graphics need more of Lisa Link and peace themes.
- Use stone benches to provide a larger text opportunities for peace quotes, including walkways to distribute quotes throughout the park.
- Like the stone/masonry treatment of the State Street elevation, the horizontal banding on north (stage wall) is not necessary, eliminate spandrel glass on State Street and pull up stone base as a substitute.
- Like the four tree arrangement as a gateway to State Street as is.
- Need more history and message of park. Question whether or not the cone can be more of an artistic element rather than architecture.
- Make benches around the performance/jet spray feature longer than 4-feet, along with consideration for reducing the number of jets.
- Use frosted glass on the bottom panels on State Street as with the application on the stage side elevation within restrooms.
- Don't use blue tinted glass, use clear vision glass.

### **ACTION:**

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-2) with Luskin and Rummel voting no. The motion required address of the above stated comments with the motion noting that the Urban Design Commission makes a finding that based on site specific approval as a one-story building because of its size, scale and context, a park with a pavilion type structure is appropriate with the C4 Central Commercial District.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5.5, 6, 6, 6, 7, 7.5, 8 and 9.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 400 State Street**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	7.5	7	7.5	7.5	7	7.5	8	7.5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	7	7	7	5	-	7	7	7
	-	-	5	6	-	-	5	6
	6	6	6	-	6	6	6	6
	8	6	7	8	5	9	9	8
	6	3	6	6	4	6	7	5.5
	6	7	6	6	-	6	7	6.5
	9	7	9	9	-	10	10	9

**General Comments:**

- A lot of very skilled designers at work here.
- Wonderful improvements.
- Lisa Link “story” still needed.
- Park plan is very successful. Need more of Lisa Link’s story and develop connection to world-wide peace park movement.
- The architecture doesn’t address park design or State Street. The cone/cylinder appears tacked on. Peace – Lisa Link – Women’s International League for Peace & Freedom missing for signage/feel of park. Make sure there is enough seating to make everyone feel welcome.
- A vibrant architecture in a somewhat subdued site design. More could be given to energize the site.
- Continues to improve. Simplify performance elevation. Alternative to corian.

## AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: July 1, 2009

TITLE: 400 State Street – Lisa Link Peace Park  
Improvements in the C4 District. 4<sup>th</sup> Ald.  
Dist. (14907)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: July 1, 2009

ID NUMBER:

---

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, Richard Wagner, Mark Smith, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Marsha Rummel and Ron Lusk.

### SUMMARY:

At its meeting of July 1, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for improvements to the Lisa Link Peace Park located at 400 State Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Carter Arndt, representing MSA Professional Services; Mike Sturm and Ken Saiki, both representing Ken Saiki Design; and Mary Carbine, representing Madison Central BID. The revised plans as presented featured the following:

- A combined performance/fountain space provides that the fountain space is only active when the performance space is not.
- The building has been redesigned to feature a storefront brick façade along State Street with a two-story volume with the round tower element acting as a hinge that transitions the design of the façade into the park.

Following the presentation of the plans, the Commission noted the following:

- The top piece of the round element looks like Warner Park, not State Street. Like a park on the lake and still an issue with the two-story requirement on State Street not being met.
- Eliminate consideration of the round element as EIFS, should be fishscale metal.
- Reveal the cone base at break between the north and south elevations.
- Keep round element simple with top as is.
- Ideal to pull slot through on drum OK. Twist so as to allow view from State Street. EIFS is not OK, cheap, use metal panel or vertical standing seam, explore having openings in drum to provide more light and transparency.
- The two-story provision for storefront is not for parks, not appropriate for a park. Like drum, provide something new and modern on State Street but needs to be kept simple.
- The door along stage, slit and window should be more proportional to the adjacent windows on the performance space side façade. Not sure about the banners sticking above the parapet line, should be below the parapet.

- Place a greater emphasis on the sculpture.
- Treat water feature as a backdrop to the stage.
- Banner concept doesn't honor history of activism and rallies around Lisa Link, include a peace sign or sufficient images to reflect the namesake of the park.
- Need to provide historic context, comfortable with not being a two-story building, not comfortable with use of EIFS, concern that providing bike parking within the State Street right-of-way conflicting with entry and activities.

Following discussion Mary Carbine, representing Madison Central BID spoke in favor of the improvements. Continued discussion noted the following:

- On fountain blue areas shown on the plans between benches (jets); blue pools break up space between, need to make more linear.
- Need to elaborate on green amenities.
- Concern with screening of mechanicals and sound due to the building's proximity to the performance area.

### **ACTION:**

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 7, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 400 State Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	7	7	7	7	7	7	8	7
	6	7	-	6	7	6	7	7
	-	5	7.5	-	-	-	-	-

General Comments:

- Highly resolved solution – Bravo! Fish scale metal panels for corbu cone! One story scheme is appropriate.
- Park design and water elements interesting. Not convinced that 1-story building with drum cone is appropriate for State Street. Banner logo misses opportunity to honor Lisa Link and history of public activism her name represents. Would like to see City seek highest levels of sustainability as possible.
- Much improved building and park. Tilt drum up State Street.

## AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: June 3, 2009
TITLE: 400 State Street – Lisa Link Peace Park Improvements in the C4 District. 4 <sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist. (14907)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: June 3, 2009	ID NUMBER:

---

Members present were: Bruce Woods, Richard Wagner, John Harrington, Richard Slayton, Jay Ferm and Todd Barnett.

### SUMMARY:

At its meeting of June 3, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for improvements to the Lisa Link Peace Park located at 400 State Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Mike Sturm, representing Ken Saiki Design; Ken Saiki, representing Ken Saiki Design; Carter Arndt, representing MSA Professional Services; and Mary Carbine, representing Madison Central BID;. Appearing in opposition was Dolores Grengg. Prior to the presentation staff noted that the Urban Design Commission, at its meeting of February 18, 2004 recommended approval of Resolution, I.D. 25282 adopting the Lisa Link Peace Conception Master Plan and authorizing the Parks Division to retain architectural services to move beyond the conceptual plan to construction drawings. The proposed improvements provide for construction of facilities within the park that include an amphitheater, a center fountain and stage, including Visitor's Center. Sturm provided details of the modified development proposal for the park facility emphasizing site and landscape amenities with Arndt providing a detailed review of the various building elevations for the Visitor's Center. The elevations provided for consideration of two options. Option 1, the preferred option, a one-story version with Option 2 expressing the same mass and volume as a two-story structure. Option 2 is intended to address provisions within the C4 Central Commercial District that require buildings to be a minimum of not less than two-stories abutting the property's State Street frontage. Staff noted the visitor's center not being two stories was an issue more relevant to the Plan Commission's review of the project and that the Urban Design Commission should look at design elements and comment if the two-story version has issues. Following the presentation, Bruce Woods, Chair referenced an email from Commissioner Dawn Weber (excused) relevant to project as follows:

- Request that the applicant show adjacent façades on State Street especially the building to the east.
- The building concept appears to be an exterior simple form with a sculpture inserted within. Please ask applicants to study the exterior simple form; follow and complete a more historic lot line due to the urban character of the site and to maintain the street edge of State Street.
- The interior sculpture could be set further to the north to allow one to walk between the exterior wall and the sculpture in an exterior arcade. This exterior arcade could continue to the northeast elevation to act as a backdrop to the stage and provide performers an entrance to the stage. This eliminates the

utilitarian doors at the stage façade. This could also allow the landscape of the park to enter the building through the arcade.

- Study a void in the roof between the exterior simple form and the sculpture.
- Lighting of the sculptural form should be studied.
- A more urban material for the exterior simple form should be studied, the sculptural form should have more flexibility in material selection.

This is a very unique urban park project. The connection between the built form (both historic and new) and the natural landscape is a design challenge and great opportunity to create a special space.

Continued discussion by the Commission noted the following:

- Surprise with the use of stone on the building's façade; not found on State Street, brick more traditional with State Street buildings.
- Weber's comments are right on.
- In time will be a need for more interior space, for example conference room, building maybe needs to be a two-story structure.
- In concept prefer slope of single-story option don't like the two-story volume in terms of appearance, including brackets.
- Agree with the stone issue, building is less inviting, a masonry volume with punch openings doesn't feel inviting.
- Problem with view of State Street and park for visitors in the visitor's center not being provided.
- Problem with dedicating a room on a major face of the building which will likely be under utilized by police, a mistake.
- Space needs to open up to the outside.
- No shade for ambassador's area due to southern exposure.
- Make a green building as far as budget will allow.
- Entry to building not welcoming, doesn't relate well to State Street.
- In comparing the earlier version, the project with the current proposal; there is a loss of formality of entry at State Street.
- Design as proposed provides for competition between the stage and the fountain with the State Street frontage.
- The game tables would be appropriate on Gilman by at least one.
- The building pinches the gateway to the park from State Street.
- Question why the concept of peace is not incorporated into the design of the "Peace Park."
- Check out the pavement pattern and how it relates to the location of trees.
- Look at amount of solar gain from the slanted roof.
- The performance stage appears to be limited to one direction of orientation, which reflects a lessening of flexibility from the previous design.
- Check out tree alignment in relationship with stage.
- Round form of the architecture at State Street brings people back to State Street.

Doris Grengg, speaking in opposition noted opposition to the hardscape improvements within the park, and distress with permanent presence of police in park. She reminded the Commission that the park was named "Lisa Link Peace Park," which honors peace. She further questioned why police patrols were not sufficient in the area without a police presence in the park, as well with distress with the extent of built environment in the park that is now and as proposed. She emphasized that no police presence in the park would be more



welcoming. In response the Commission noted its charge with reviewing design, not land use. Other comments from the Commission noted the following:

- Permanence of locating police in the park not a UDC issue, more of a Plan Commission issue.
- The fountain and stage conflict. In Wisconsin climate limits use and effect of a fountain, rather see a sculpture element, want to see more of adjoining context and views from both adjoining streets (State and Gilman).
- Bring gaming tables around to corner to be viewable from State. Deal with bike parking in a different manner that allows for a more efficient use of the area abutting State Street where current bike parking is proposed.
- The arcade gallery concept as suggested by Weber would go a long way.

#### **ACTION:**

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 6, 6 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 400 State Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	5	-	-	5	5	5
	6	5	6	6	-	5	7	6
	5	5	-	6	-	6	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	5	4	5	-	-	5	5	5

General Comments:

- Interesting project. Consider conflict between stage and fountain. Is the fountain needed? Provide perspective from Gilman and State Street (both).
- Water drainage off roof. Fountain and stage are in competition. Stage seems oriented to north, not north and south. Plan less engaged with State Street than previous.
- Building interior plan ignores street when the interior should engage the street. State Street face should be more of a gateway into park rather than a semi-random meander. There are many elements of sustainability in this park: water, green, sun. The building should respond to this with passive solar cooling design. Consider rain fountains.
- Previous site plan seems to work better. Stage/fountain are competing for space. Formal (entry) to casual lawn juxtaposition works well on original plan...missing an update.
- Lose the fountain.
- Still needs work to make it more inviting.