



Project Name & Address: 1144 Florence Court

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

Legistar File ID # [61087](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: July 7, 2020

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Elizabeth Cwik, BWZ Architects

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a dormer addition on the second floor.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
 - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a dormer addition to the roof on the second floor. The building current has two similar dormers on that side of the roof (west). Per the preservation file, the roof dormers were added in the 1940s to the 1916 residential structure. In 1986, the Landmarks Commission retroactively approved the modification of the windows in the dormers, which altered their style to the present configuration. The new hipped dormer will have the same style of shingles are currently installed on the building and be clad with the same siding as the rest of the building. The window configuration will mimic that on the hipped dormer on the southernmost end of this side of the roof.

This building is a part of a grouping of houses on a short private drive. Madison developer, H.C. Nichols, created four identical, hipped-roof bungalows to maximize the development potential of four lakefront lots. He had developed four lakefront lots a few years prior, with buildings that fronted onto Rutledge St. For these houses he subdivided those lots halfway and introduced a shared private drive (Florence Ct) to serve all eight of the properties.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. The height of the both the existing dormers and proposed new dormer are below the existing roof ridge and so the proposed addition is of a similar height of dormers on roofs of other structures in the vicinity.
 - 2. N/A
 - 3. Most of the historic resources within 200 feet that have dormers, do so in a symmetrical fashion. The building is one of the few that does not currently have a symmetrical configuration of rooftop dormers, and the introduction of this third dormer on the side of the building will introduce symmetry to the previous rooftop alterations.
 - (b) N/A

- (c) N/A
- (d) This addition to the roof does not alter the existing hipped roof form of the structure. The hipped dormer will replicate the pattern of the other dormers on this side of the roof.
- (e) N/A

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the proposal as submitted.