

AGENDA # 9

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: April 19, 2006
TITLE: 2200 West Broadway – New Construction, Multiple Tenant Commercial/Retail Building in Urban Design District No. 1. 14 th Ald. Dist. (03433)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: April 19, 2006	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Ald. Noel Radomski, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Lisa Geer, Robert March, Michael Barrett, Bruce Woods and Cathleen Feland.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of April 19, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a new construction, multiple tenant commercial/retail building in Urban Design District No. 1 located at 2200 West Broadway. Appearing on behalf of the project were David Nelsen, Homer Simpson and Scott Stewart. The project provides for the development of a new multi-tenant commercial/retail building on a vacant portion of the site currently occupied by the “Antler’s Tavern.” The new structure will be located off of the northeasterly corner of the site adjacent to existing single-family development at its rear. The new structure is approximately 500 square feet in size, 1-½ stories in height and features a steel roof and fascia and steel siding with a brick wainscot base. The development of additional parking combined with that existing for the tavern will provide for a shared parking arrangement of 40 stalls versus 49 stalls that would be required if the new structure was developed separately. Following the presentation, the Commission expressed concerns on the following:

- The metal sided structure does not complement the stone exterior of the existing adjacent restaurant/tavern.
- Need to see more development of architecture; building is too severe; underdeveloped, need more context photos and information about the site and adjoining properties.
- Need higher architecture and development as required within an Urban Design District.
- Concern with metal buildings architecture as it is inconsistent with restaurant and surrounding residential development.
- Give consideration to bringing the building up to the street as does the existing restaurant tavern on the site.
- Pull building to the street, drainage considerations should not dictate its location, as well as create a street face for the structure.
- Need to provide screening and buffering along the rear lot line adjacent to existing residential where the reorientation toward the street will provide and create more screening opportunities.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION**, no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3, 3, 3, 4, 5 and 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 2200 West Broadway

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	3	3	-	-	-	3	3	3
	3	5	3	-	-	4	4	4
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	3
	6	4	-	-	-	6	4	5
	3	3	-	-	-	-	3	3
	5	4	6	6	-	5	4	5

General Comments:

- Need to pull the new building to the street.
- Building must be pulled up to street. And there's gotta be more architecture. This needs re-conceptualizing.
- Needs much more architectural attention.
- Pull building to street; very important.
- There is nothing remarkable about this building.
- Like the potential of shared parking. Consider reorienting building towards street. Screen for residents behind.
- Avoid metal siding on new building – should relate more to existing building appearance and residential neighborhood. Study moving new building close to street, as is existing building.