

AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: October 15, 2008
TITLE: 501 State Street – Façade Improvement Grant Application. 4 th Ald. Dist. (12030)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: October 15, 2008	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Chair; Bruce Woods, Jay Ferm, John Harrington, Ron Luskin, Marsha Rummel, Dawn Weber, Richard Slayton and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 15, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **ACCEPTED** the report of the Façade Grant Team for a façade grant application located at 501 State Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was Josh Johnson, representing Chuck and Rose Prestigiacomo, the property owners. Prior to the presentation, staff provided clarification of the Commission’s role in reviewing “facade grants” referenced within a copy of Resolution ID Number 34241, approved by the Common Council in February of 2004, distributed as a handout. The resolution as modified by Ald. Steve Holtzman (former aldermanic representative to the Commission) required the following: “...all Facade Improvement proposals will be referred to the Urban Design Commission for comments and recommendations to be promptly made to the Community Development Authority (CDA). The Urban Design Commission may recommend referral back to the Urban Design Commission if designs are challenging.” Johnson began by distributing copies of the previous facade grant proposal application as previously reviewed by the Commission at its meeting of September 24, 2008. Johnson requested that the replacement materials detailing the original proposal be substituted with the circulated packet version due to cost issues. Johnson summarized his request for the Commission’s consideration of the original version of the façade grant proposal noting the following:

- The painting of aluminum framed windows to match overall color scheme of other proposed improvements.
- The replacement of the front door on State Street with a brown tone aluminum with matching frame, along with replacing the two doors on the Gilman Street elevation of the building, all featuring two panels to be reviewed and approved by Kitty Rankin, Preservation Planner.
- Existing lighting in the form of walpacs is to remain on the building as is.
- Replacements would feature the use of Azek product as previously proposed so that every attempt will be made to move the air conditioning unit over the front entry to the building, if budget allows, a redo at the front entry as proposed.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- The building has charm but is an eyesore. Building has been in disrepair for a long time. City has invested around property, building has many elements that are in disrepair and need attention.
- Air conditioning unit at the front main entry to the store is a huge eyesore to the building; needs to resolve the project not a huge improvement to State Street.

A general discussion among the Commission members and the project's architect followed, noting issues between those improvements to the building caused by maintenance related issues.

ACTION:

On a motion by Wagner, seconded by Harrington, the Urban Design Commission **ACCEPTED** the report of the Façade Grant Team. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-1) with Ferm voting no. The motion required the replacement of the air conditioning unit and its relocation with existing utilities on the Gilman Street elevation, with the flatiron entry door to be glass that feature two side lights with a glass transom above.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3, 4, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5, 5.5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 501 State Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5.5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	5	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	4	-	-	-	-	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	3
	-	5	-	-	-	-	5	5

General Comments:

- For a \$25,000 investment – not a gift – the City can expect more than correcting deferred maintenance.
- Looking forward to the restoration in total...
- Appreciate the desire for façade improvements, but the entry is not the improvement needed.
- It seems this grant is intended to cover basic maintenance that has been long deferred by existing owner. Before and after façades are not substantially different, no real improvement.
- Support grant but years of neglected maintenance means much money will go to repair versus historic restoration.
- Flat iron door entry has to be brought up to a higher aesthetic and eliminate AC at front door.