

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: April 23, 2008
TITLE: 333 West Washington Avenue – Amended PUD-SIP for a Hotel. 4 th Ald. Dist. (06876)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: April 23, 2008	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Marsha Rummel, Bonnie Cosgrove, John Harrington, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of April 23, 2008, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of an Amended PUD-SIP located at 333 West Washington Avenue. Appearing on behalf of the project were Nathan Novak, Jeff Krehbiel, and Denny Meikleham, all representing Lodgeworks; Jonathan Cooper, representing the Bassett District Capitol West Steering Committee; and Catherine Hixon. Prior to the presentation Lou Host-Jablonski, Chair read and the conditions from the prior review of the project contained within the report dated March 26, 2008. The project's architect, Jeff Krehbiel and Denny Meikleham representing Lodgeworks, LLP spoke to the architectural issues raised within the report, emphasizing canopy details, lighting, review of lower level and ground details, as well as the overall structure including presentation on material samples. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Better windows, still not wrapping around. Centerpiece still flat, building still doesn't emphasize its verticality.
- Use of rooftop stand alone fin/blade "billboard-like." Should be as wide as the three bays of underlying windows. Question its use, feels like an extended parapet, e.g. Home Depot.
- Still bothered by spandrel panels in the center projection.
- Comfortable with details on low façade/below canopy.
- Development at ground floor OK, beyond that not enough broad strokes, a narrow building; lacks rhythm.
- If you look at the progression in the design of the building response to what has been requested in gradual steps. The building is not great but approvable.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Wagner, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-1) with Barnett voting no. The motion required that windows on the projecting face be utilized on the return face (both east and west) with the rooftop element to go to the edge and be as wide as the three underlying bays of windows with the spandrel to be glass; jog on common arrangement.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 6, 6, 7, 7 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 333 West Washington Avenue

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	7	-	-	-	-	7	7
	7	6	7	7	-	7	8	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	7	6	6	6	7	7	8	7
	6	5	5	-	-	5	6	5

General Comments:

- Happy to see it go forward but still disappointed.
- Thanks for the changes – the architecture is improved and the project a good addition to Madison’s downtown.
- Appreciate improvements but I’m settling for good instead of great design.
- Approvable, finally, although not great.