

AGENDA # 1

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: November 14, 2007	
TITLE: 707 South Mills Street – St. Mary’s Hospital, PUD-SIP, Modifications/Clarifications to Signage Package. 13 th Ald. Dist. (08008)	REFERRED:	
	REREFERRED:	
	REPORTED BACK:	
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED:	POF:
DATED: November 14, 2007	ID NUMBER:	

Members present were: Lou Host-Jablonski, Chair; John Harrington, Bruce Woods, Bonnie Cosgrove, Jay Ferm, Richard Wagner and Todd Barnett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of November 14, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of modifications/clarifications to a signage package located at 707 South Mills Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were David Sheedy, Chris Oddo and Andrew Schoenherr, all of Kahler Slater; Christopher Thiel, SAA; Marilyn Biros and Harvey Temkin, representing SSM Health Care/St. Mary’s Hospital; and Deb Harvey. Oddo presented details of the comprehensive sign package for St. Mary’s. Oddo noted to the Commission it was the applicant’s belief that signage details had been previously reviewed by the Commission as part of the approval of the overall project for the redevelopment of the St. Mary’s campus, where upon recent communications with staff it was noted that signage approval was at issue. Oddo presented details of an array of wall signage, numerous directional “wayfinding” signage in the form of primarily ground signs, as well as building entry identification, including retail signage for lower level retail abutting the property’s Park Street frontage. Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Signs P-1, P-2, P-3 and P-5 appear to have vision triangle issues, in addition to S-5 and T-1. A response by Thiel referencing Traffic Engineering approval of the location of the signs was noted as an unsatisfactory answer. It was further noted that motorists are not able to see children, bicycles and visitors on adjoining walkways. It was further emphasized that bicyclists on sidewalks are a concern in regards to being seen by automobile operators.
- The upper wall sign on the parking structure at the corner of Emerald Street and Park Street featuring a division of the heart symbol for St. Mary’s crosses architectural details, a violation of the code requirements. In addition, the second lower elevation St. Mary’s sign is a redundant feature on the same façade. It was suggested that the applicant consider changing the precast coloration to create a unified one color signable area, in addition to resolving the redundancy of having two “St. Mary’s” wall signs on the same building elevation, which appear to be viewable from the same point of view within one or two blocks.
- Issues were raised with the box style of the parking entry sign rather than individual letters individually lit, as a more favorable alternative.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Ferm, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (8-0). The motion provided for partial approval of the overall sign package, with the following requiring additional consideration and address as noted:

- Ground signs and vision triangle shall come back with dimensions for further review, in addition to signs not in context with vision triangle issues.
- The building sign SM-2 featuring “St. Mary’s” on the upper stair at the corner of Emerald and Park Streets shall come back for further consideration and shall be modified to resolve the issue of crossing architectural detail.
- The design concept of the ground signs are generally OK.
- The use of an internally lit can or box to identify the garage entry shall be modified in favor of the use of individually mounted letters.
- The proposed signs on the existing building are OK as presented.
- The Dean and St. Mary’s Outpatient Center sign, DSM-1 shall be modified to recognize the relief in brick as an important architectural feature with the sign scaled down to not effect the horizontal relief or reveal with an option to shrink the sign down or locate Dean and St. Mary’s Outpatient Center separately with an alternative signable area.
- Approval of the bar signage above the awnings for the first floor retail abutting Park Street, including blade and wall signs as presented with options to refine to be approved by staff.
- In summary, the following shall come back for further consideration:
 - The heart split on the upper elevation wall sign on the stair of the parking tower for St. Mary’s.
 - The DSM-1 wall sign.
 - All ground signs both in and out of vision triangles, with large scale details of all ground mount signs to be provided, especially in address of the critical issue of vision for bicycles and pedestrians, with staff approval of the directional signs as requested.
 - The motion further provided that the applicant was allowed to return for further consideration at the Commission’s meeting of November 21, 2007 with a modified application which would be accepted beyond the scheduled application deadline for that meeting.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5 and 6.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 707 South Mills Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	5	-	5	5
	-	-	-	-	6	5	6	6

General Comments:

- Handsome, well crafted signage package; concern, however, about signs as noted.