

From: [Dave Mollenhoff](#)
To: [Erica Gerhig](#); [Michael Rosenblum](#); [Stuart Levitan](#); [Jason Fowler](#); [Christina Slattery](#); [David McLean](#); [Rummel, Marsha](#); [Scanlon, Amy](#)
Subject: Key documents needed for the January 6 meeting
Date: Saturday, January 04, 2014 7:02:03 AM
Attachments: [121-127 Gilman Graphic Analysis \(1\).pdf](#)
[Demolition by neglect.pdf](#)
[H3 VRA rev1.pdf](#)

To: Landmarks Commissioners and Amy Scanlon

From: David Mollenhoff on behalf of the Mansion Hill Gilman Project Steering Committee

Subject: Key documents needed for the January 6 meeting

The Mansion Hill Gilman Project Steering Committee has major concerns about the Brown project at 121-123-127 West Gilman. We are particularly concerned that you commissioners and staff have accurate and complete information about this project. Toward that end, we have prepared three attachments:

The first attachment, "121-127 Gilman Graphic Analysis," consists of four pages as follows:

Page 1 consists of two overlays. The top drawing shows the proposed Brown triple towers in blue superimposed over the existing block elevation. The bottom drawing shows the existing buildings superimposed in pink over the block elevation *with* the proposed triple towers in black. They dramatically illustrate how out of scale the proposed triple towers are to all other contributing buildings in the visually related area (VRA). Both drawings utilize street elevations prepared by Brown's architect.

Pages 2 and 3 raise serious questions about the ability of the parking structure to be completely underground given the grade of the lot. The blue overlay labeled "parking pedestal" shows the extent of the grade that is ignored in the Brown drawings.

Page 4 shows the footprint of the triple towers in red atop the parking structure (the pedestal for the triple towers) in blue. The drawing shows that the new project is massively larger than existing homes in the VRA and that the parking structure consumes nearly every square foot of the lot. There is no way such a massive project complies with the Mansion Hill rules. This drawing also shows that this massive intrusion in the Mansion Hill Historic District is inappropriate immediately adjacent to 120 West Gorham--a Madison landmark and, bitter irony, the headquarters of Steve Brown Apartments. Finally, note that almost all other buildings in the VRA have generously sized back yards with plenty of space for large trees.

The second attachment, "H-3 VRA rev.," consists of two pages as follows:

Page 1 provides a detailed volume analysis of all buildings in the project's VRA.

Page 2 provides detailed *comparisons* between existing buildings and the new Brown project. These comparative metrics show how wildly out-of-scale the new project is to existing buildings.

The first and second attachments were carefully compiled by John Martens, a highly respected Madison architect.

The third attachment, "Demolition by neglect," is a paper written by our committee that asserts that SBA's 19 year treatment of 127 West Gilman is a classic case of demolition by neglect.

As you analyze this project, we hope you will give careful consideration to all of these documents. All provide vitally important facts that will help you make informed decisions.