

From: [Natalie Smith](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Subject: Demo Permit 91459
Date: Friday, March 13, 2026 6:49:20 PM

You don't often get email from natsmithjd@gmail.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

5534 Medical Circle: A Building That Was Not in Disrepair Until It Was Convenient to Say So

The Purchase Price Says Everything

BPH LLC, owned by Stacy Bruner — a professional real estate operator — purchased 5534 Medical Circle in November 2024 at asking price. The listing described it as a "mid-century modern gem on Madison's west side" with active suggestions for reuse as a daycare, fitness studio, or medical office. Sophisticated real estate professionals do not pay asking price for buildings they believe are functionally obsolete. If the building was truly in the state now being described, that would have been reflected in the purchase price. Its absence from the record is telling — the Commission should require disclosure of the purchase price before accepting any argument that rehabilitation is economically infeasible.

A Maintenance Backlog Is Not a Condemnation

The list of building deficiencies submitted to the Commission was compiled by the tenant, Madison Psychiatric Associates — not an independent engineer. It includes leaky faucets, clogged drains, mice, peeling cabinet laminate, a door that needs replacement, and mold in two offices that has already been remediated. This is a deferred maintenance list. None of it is structural. All of it is the kind of routine repair work that a responsible property owner addresses as a matter of course. The new ownership held this building for over a year and addressed none of it — and is now presenting their own neglect as evidence that the building cannot be saved.

A Roofing Bid Is Not a Structural Engineering Report

The \$252,000 exterior repair estimate was provided by Badgerland Exteriors — a contractor that would perform the work if hired. It is a bid, not an independent assessment. The report itself notes the flat roof has five years of useful life remaining and recommends replacement "in the next few years." The Mansard roof needs new cedar shakes. These are normal capital repairs for a 60-year-old building — not demolition triggers. No independent structural engineer has assessed this building. The Commission is being asked to demolish a historically significant Marshall Erdman structure based on a roofing contractor's estimate.

The Conclusion Came Before the Evidence

Bear Development filed the demolition application in December 2025 — just over one year after purchase — having already designed a 227-unit project, hired architects and engineers, met with city staff repeatedly, and presented to the Urban Design Commission. The condition assessment did not lead to the demolition decision. The demolition decision led to the

condition assessment. The narrative of disrepair was assembled after the outcome was determined.

The Real Stakes: Public Money and Public Trust

This project is requesting Tax-Exempt Bonds, 4% Low-Income Housing Tax Credits, and Tax Incremental Financing — public resources drawn from Madison taxpayers and from a finite pool that other projects compete for. The 227 proposed units will house residents at or below 60% AMI: people with limited options and limited leverage when a landlord fails to perform.

The Commission should weigh this carefully. The same ownership and management structure that ignored a medical tenant's routine repair requests — including a broken handicap-accessible door, 4% fresh air return, and active mold — is now asking the public to finance 227 units of affordable housing under their stewardship. They have presented their case to this Commission by omitting the purchase price, substituting a contractor's bid for an engineering report, and framing their own management failures as proof that a sound building cannot be saved.

This Commission is entitled to ask plainly: if this is how they present information when seeking approval, and this is how they managed property when they had tenants, **are they the right partners for public investment in affordable housing? That question is not a footnote to this proceeding. It is the heart of it.**

From: [Trina McCormick](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Subject: Registrar #s 91459 and 91512 (5534 Medical Circle)
Date: Friday, March 13, 2026 9:25:24 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)
[5534 Medical Cir. building issues.docx](#)

You don't often get email from trina@mpamadison.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

To Whom It May Concern,

We appreciate the opportunity to provide this statement for the record regarding our organization's decision to relocate from our current building. Our intent is to briefly outline the considerations that informed this decision as part of our long-term planning process.

After careful consideration, our organization determined that relocating from the current building at 5534 Medical Circle was necessary due to the age of the structure and the scope of infrastructure improvements required to maintain and modernize the facility. An evaluation of the building's systems and ongoing maintenance needs indicated that addressing these issues would require extensive and costly repairs.

Please find attached a list of areas of concern identified within the past 12 months. This list is not intended to be comprehensive.

Best Regards,

Trina McCormick

The logo for Madison Psychiatric Associates (MPA) consists of the letters 'M', 'P', and 'A' in a stylized, spaced-out font. The 'M' is blue, the 'P' is green, and the 'A' is orange.

**Trina
McCormick**

Clinic Manager

Madison Psychiatric Associates
trina@mpamadison.com

608.274.0355

Madison Psychiatric Associates
[5534 Medical Circle](#)
[Madison, WI 53719](#)

t: 608.274.0355

f: 608.274.5546

www.madisonpsychiatricassociates.com

*****WARNING: CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE-** The information contained in this transmission may contain privileged and confidential information, including patient information protected by federal and state privacy laws. It is intended only for the use of the person(s) named above. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any review, dissemination, distribution, or duplication of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender by reply email or at (608) 274-0355 and destroy all copies of the original message.

- Roof not draining, water funneling toward the building. Regrading the entire West side of the building.
- Plethora of mice – get trapped and die behind the walls or die in the crawl space. Also free range in the kitchen cabinets.
- Clogged drains, (kitchen, drain outside basement door and employee bathroom downstairs) upstairs waiting room sink needs to be snaked and back employee bathroom needs new toilet handle.
- Back door needs to be replaced. Heat escapes and creates an ice dam preventing the door from closing. This is the handicapped door. Had repairman come look at it. Replacement is only option.
- Furnace / Air conditioning issues due to old system and new duct work is not an option. Some rooms very hot and others very cold for either season.
- Very low fresh air return-4%, should be more than 20%. This reading was done by the mold remediation company in June 2025. Would require digging under the building to replace old ductwork. (Currently caved in)
- No hot water in the faucet in the coffee station. Leaks when you turn it on under the cabinet.
- Some of the outside lighting will not go on despite new bulbs. Need electrician to troubleshoot.
- All the cabinet laminate is falling off or is off.
- Mold was identified in offices 10 & 12. Remediation completed but all ducts were recommended to be replaced as they're all rusted allowing for dust, dirt, mold etc to gather and grow.

From: [Jim Lottridge](#)
To: [Plan Commission Comments](#)
Cc: [Montessori Childrens House](#)
Subject: #91459
Date: Friday, March 13, 2026 9:01:16 AM

You don't often get email from director@madisonmontessori.org. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Commenters: Jim Lottridge & Laura Kvalheim, Directors of Montessori Children's House, 5530 Medical Circle, Madison WI

Dear Plan Commission,

We are writing to express opposition to the demolition and redevelopment as proposed, of 5555 Odana Road & 5534 Medical Circle because of the potential impacts for our school during the construction process and beyond. We are writing in service to the children and families that are currently at our school and for all future families. We understand that there is a need for more housing in Madison, but this shouldn't come at the expense of children's safety and security.

Our non-profit school, 501(c)(3) has been in business since 1964, and located at 5530 Medical Circle since 1991, serving families with children ages 18 months through 6 years during the school year and 18 months through 10 years old during the summer. We are state licensed, City of Madison Accredited (one of the first programs to be accredited in the 1970s), and are a verified American Montessori Society school. We own our building and have done our part to maintain it and keep it as original as possible. We are located within the cluster of four Marshall Erdman designed buildings on Medical Circle. We love the Erdman aesthetic. It suits Montessori well! One of the key components of Montessori philosophy is the environment. Our building's airy lobby/gathering area, wood panelled, warm classrooms and large sunlit spaces, lend themselves to a "children's house." **It's a warm, comfortable space for children, staff, and families - not an institutional feel.** Our spacious playground, tucked in behind our building, adjacent to Supreme Health Club, is large, loved by the children and used three hours per day, for much of the year. When children look up, their eyes rest on clouds or migrating birds (we are on a flyway). Obviously, the proposed demolition and proposed construction will have a significant impact on our ability to use this space. And as most people know, outdoor play is a critical part of early childhood education. Throughout this process, it has seemed as if we have been invisible! **On behalf of today's and tomorrow's children, we urge the commission to require the developers to adjust their plans and build the proposed apartment building (5555 Odana Road - building A) on the footprint of the current building, aligning with the apartment building to their west. We also urge the commission to require changes to the plans to limit/eliminate sight lines from the apartment**

building to our playground. This could be done be with a redesign, removing balconies from south wall of building A and replacing with corridors and stairwells.

We are also writing to express opposition to the demolition of 5534 Medical Circle because it will detract from the remaining beautiful Erdman buildings, which were built into the hill/landscape. This proposed development will tower over our building, 5530 Medical Circle, with a totally different architectural philosophy. Additionally, for our school, it will change the feeling of safety and security we've had since moving to Medical Circle in the 1990's. Even though we have an excellent reputation, being the only American Montessori Society verified school in the area and our extraordinarily long tenured staff (more than 160 years at our school), **prospective families typically choose us based upon how they felt when they toured. This starts when they drive down Medical Circle towards our school. Does the area look safe and secure?** To that end, MPA and other neighbors on Medical Circle have been wonderful. We've felt safe and secure in this location and the traffic has been reasonable. The proposed demolition of current buildings and proposed development of apartments will lead to significantly more traffic near us - near the children. Who knows what the commercial bottom floor will house - Kwik Trip? Increased traffic and people, plus balconies looking out over our playground will be concerning. This doesn't exude a safe feeling for families. In our 30 plus years of experience (20 plus in leadership of the school) no amount of trees, fencing and privacy screening will convince current and prospective families that our school is safe and private with this proposed development. **We wonder if this project would be approved next to a public school. If the demolition and development of 5534 Medical Circle goes forward, we urge the commission to require changes to the plan that limit the size/look/feel of the project to better align with the existing buildings on Medical Circle. Additionally, we urge the commission to eliminate any sight lines toward our property and specifically our playground.**

Again, we love our Erdman building and the architecture of the area and **considered 5530 Medical Circle our forever home.** If this demolition goes forward and the proposed apartments are built, as designed, the situation will likely become untenable for us and we will be **forced out.** And then, likely this last cluster of early Erdman buildings will be torn down. **Again, we urge the commission to consider the impacts of this proposed development on the children in our care now and for children in the future.**

If you are not familiar with the area, we would encourage you to drive slowly down Medical Circle and see for yourself. You are welcome to pull into our parking lot and have a closer look.

Thank you for your time and consideration!
Jim Lottridge & Laura Kvalheim

--

Montessori Children's House

Madison, Wisconsin
Serving children since 1964!
Follow us on [Facebook!](#)

608.273.8600
608.441.9686 (fax)
MadisonMontessori.org



From: [Stacy Bruner](#)
To: [Punt, Colin](#); [Plan Commission Comments](#); [Urban Design Comments](#)
Subject: #91512 (5534 Medical Circle & 5555 Odana Road)
Date: Thursday, March 12, 2026 4:55:43 PM
Attachments: [Medical Circle Roof and Siding Report.pdf](#)
[5534 Medical Cir. building issues - from MPA.docx](#)

Some people who received this message don't often get email from stacyb@brunerrealtyinc.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Caution: This email was sent from an external source. Avoid unknown links and attachments.

Dear City of Madison Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission Members,

My name is Stacy Bruner, and I am a principal member of BPH LLC, the current ownership group of 5534 Medical Circle. I am writing to submit comments regarding the potential consideration of 5534 Medical Circle for historic designation as part of a broader proposed district.

I respectfully request that 5534 Medical Circle not be designated as a historic property and the demolition permit be approved for the following reasons.

1. The building is already functionally obsolete and its long-term tenant is vacating:

The original owner and long-term occupant, Madison Psychiatric Associates (MPA), made the decision to sell the building to our group in November 2024 with the intention of relocating due to the age, layout, and limitations of the structure. Their relocation plans were established well before any redevelopment discussions were underway. Their lease is ending, and they are moving to a more modern facility better suited to current medical and operational standards.

This vacancy is not speculative. It is imminent and based on functional inadequacy, not redevelopment pressure.

2. The building is in deteriorating condition and economically impractical to rehabilitate:

The structure is in poor physical condition and is functionally outdated. Significant capital investment would be required to modernize the building systems, accessibility, layout, and overall usability while maintaining its current architectural appearance.

To better understand the condition of the building's exterior envelope, our ownership group engaged Badgerland Exteriors, an established exterior construction company, to provide an objective assessment of the roof, siding, and overall exterior condition of the structure. Their written report, which is attached along with photographic documentation, estimates that it would cost in excess of \$250,000 to repair the building's exterior components alone while maintaining the building in like form.

Importantly, this estimate does not include additional known deficiencies such as the deteriorating parking lot or the various interior issues identified by the current tenant, Madison Psychiatric Associates, which are also documented in the materials attached to this submission.

Based on realistic leasing economics in this corridor, these combined costs would not be recoverable through market rents.

A historic designation would likely render the property economically unviable, resulting in prolonged vacancy rather than meaningful preservation. Without a financially sustainable use, designation does not preserve vitality; it risks accelerating deterioration.

3. Similar nearby properties demonstrate the risk of long-term vacancy:

My understanding is that 5534 Medical Circle is being evaluated alongside several buildings of similar age and architecture as part of a potential historic district.

At least one comparable property in the immediate area, 5520 Medical Circle, has remained largely vacant for well over a decade. This is not a reflection of a lack of effort, but rather the reality that these structures, in their current form, are difficult to lease or repurpose under modern code, accessibility, and operational standards.

Granting historic designation to 5534 Medical Circle would significantly limit redevelopment flexibility and likely produce a similar outcome of long-term vacancy and underutilization.

4. Redevelopment aligns with adopted planning goals

The property is under contract to Bear Development proposing a mixed-use development. Additional housing supply in this corridor directly aligns with the City's Comprehensive Plan goals, including infill development, housing availability, and efficient land use near employment centers and services.

Preserving a functionally obsolete building at the expense of needed housing would conflict with broader community objectives.

I fully appreciate the importance of historic preservation when a property possesses clear architectural, cultural, or community significance that justifies long-term protection. However, in this case, designation would not serve the public interest. Instead, it would likely result in vacancy, deterioration, and underutilization of a property in a corridor well-positioned for reinvestment and housing growth.

Once again, I respectfully request that the Commission approve the demolition permit for 5534 Medical Circle and allow the property to move forward through the standard redevelopment review process.

Thank you for your time and thoughtful consideration.

Stacy Bruner
Member – BPH LLC
StacyB@brunerrealtyinc.com

- Roof not draining, water funneling toward the building. Regrading the entire West side of the building.
- Plethora of mice – get trapped and die behind the walls or die in the crawl space. Also free range in the kitchen cabinets.
- Clogged drains, (kitchen, drain outside basement door and employee bathroom downstairs) upstairs waiting room sink needs to be snaked and back employee bathroom needs new toilet handle.
- Back door needs to be replaced. Heat escapes and creates an ice dam preventing the door from closing. This is the handicapped door. Had repairman come look at it. Replacement is only option.
- Furnace / Air conditioning issues due to old system and new duct work is not an option. Some rooms very hot and others very cold for either season.
- Very low fresh air return-4%, should be more than 20%. This reading was done by the mold remediation company in June 2025. Would require digging under the building to replace old ductwork. (Currently caved in)
- No hot water in the faucet in the coffee station. Leaks when you turn it on under the cabinet.
- Some of the outside lighting will not go on despite new bulbs. Need electrician to troubleshoot.
- All the cabinet laminate is falling off or is off.
- Mold was identified in offices 10 & 12. Remediation completed but all ducts were recommended to be replaced as they're all rusted allowing for dust, dirt, mold etc to gather and grow.





♿
ENTRANCE
→

















25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 35 36 37 38 39 40 41







**BADGERLAND
EXTERIORS
— & SOLAR —**

Badgerland Exteriors
E11408 Hwy 12
Sauk City, WI 53583
Phone: (608) 643-0400

Company Representative
Jeremy Meier
Phone: (608) 370-1514
jeremy.meier@badgerlandexteriors.com

We looked at the property at 5534 Medical Circle, Madison WI on March 2nd. Inspection included the Mansard Roof, the low sloped roof, siding, soffit, and fascia. The cedar shakes on the Mansard roof areas is about to the end of its life. Shakes are starting to hold moisture and several are starting to split. Several areas are showing algae growth. My recommendation is for full replacement. The low sloped roof which is EPDM looks to be about 15 years old. Most EPDM roofs last about 20 years. Flashing tapes are starting to lose adhesion. Seams are starting to come apart. Recommendation is to replace in the next few years.

Bruner Realty and Property Management

5534 Medical Circle
Madison, WI 53719
(608) 695-9390

Job: Bruner Realty and Property Management

Mansard Roof - Jumbo Wood Shakes

Cedar #1 Tapersawn Shakes - CCA Treated - 24"x5/8" Royal
#1 Medium Hand-Split Shingle Ridge - CCA Treated
Grace Ice & Water Shield HT (2 sq)
Installation of Cedar Shake

\$50,480.86

EPDM Roof

Remove current flat roof material and install 60 mil EPDM. We will tear off current roof down to the roof deck. We will inspect the roof deck for any compromised decking. If we find any compromised decking that we need to replace, it will be billed at \$75 per sheet. When the roof deck has been inspected and cleaned we will install 1/2" fiberboard on the entire roof deck. Fiberboard Insulation possesses unique bonding characteristics that ultimately result in superior adhesion capabilities with the EPDM membrane and adhesive that we will be using. We will use screws and plates to secure the fiberboard to the decking of the roof. Once the fiberboard is properly fastened we will glue the EPDM to the fiberboard.

Mule-Hide EPDM Sheet - .060 - 20'x100'
Tapered ISO System
Drill Point Screws - 1 5/8" (100 Cnt)
Mule-Hide Insulation Plate - 3" (1000 Cnt)
Mule-Hide Uncured EPDM Flashing Tape - 6"x100' - Black
Mule-Hide Cured Cover Tape - 6"x100' - Black
Mule-Hide EPDM In-Seam Tape - 6"x100' - Black
Mule-Hide Uncured EPDM Flashing Tape - 12"x50' - Black
Mule-Hide EPDM RMS w/ 3" Tape - 6"x100'
Mule-Hide Water Cut-Off Mastic (11 oz)
Mule-Hide Lap Sealant (11 oz) - Black
Mule-Hide EPDM Bonding Adhesive (5 gal)
Mule-Hide Tape Primer (1 Gal)
Chip Brush - 3"
Standard Roller Frame - 9"
Roller Cover - 9" - 3/8" Nap
Mule-Hide EPDM Pipe Flashing w/ Tape - 1"-6" - Black

Labor

Removal of current flat roofing material and installation of new Mule Hide 60mil rubber roofing system

\$134,828.36

Cedar Siding and Trims

11/16 in. x 8 in. x 144 in. Wood Cedar Bevel Siding

5/4x4" Cedar Trim


5/4"x12" Cedar Trim

Labor

\$67,486.74

TOTAL

\$252,795.96

Finance as much as \$100,000 • Starting at \$1,025/month with  • [APPLY](#)

Badgerland Exteriors LLC, ("Badgerland"), provides this estimate to the above-identified Customer to provide the foregoing labor and materials for the estimated Contract Price stated above.

This estimate is an approximation and is not guaranteed. This estimate is based on information provided from Customer regarding project requirements. Actual costs may change once all project elements are finalized or negotiated. Prior to any changes of cost, Customer will be notified. This Estimate is only valid for 15 days. After 15 days, this Estimate shall be null and void for all purposes. This estimate does not create a binding agreement between Badgerland and Customer, and no binding agreement between Badgerland and Customer shall exist until both parties have duly executed a Service Agreement for the above described labor and materials.

Company Authorized Signature

Date

Customer Signature

Date

Customer Signature

Date