

AGENDA # 10

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: March 2, 2011

TITLE: 1907-1911 Monroe Street – PUD(GDP-SIP) for a 4-Story Commercial/Residential Apartment Building. 13th Ald. Dist. (21200)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: March 2, 2011

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Mark Smith, Dawn O’Kroley, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, R. Richard Wagner, Melissa Huggins and Henry Lufler, Jr.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of March 2, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** for a PUD(GDP-SIP) for a 4-story commercial/residential building located at 1907-1911 Monroe Street. Appearing on behalf of the project was Randy Bruce, representing Mark and Mary Smith, the property owners. Bruce spoke to the Commission about the history of the building and the business contained within, Empire Photography. The building owners have acquired the neighboring property and having outgrown their building want to expand. The plan proposes to use the first floor street frontage for commercial use, the back portion and upper levels for housing, and ground level from the alley would have 6 or so parking spaces as well as the entrance to the underground parking for roughly 19 stalls. For the foreseeable future this will have one commercial tenant, they have designed it to accommodate three individual storefronts. Various views of the site were shown. The roof provides an opportunity for open space as well as a common gathering space and green roof amenities are being considered. Roof terraces are planned for the residential tenants. The alley is very heavily used and operates as two-way traffic.

Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- The problem I have is the mass of it. The vertical break up is good, but I would like to see that vertical feel expressed in setback as well.
- You’ve got a really strong storefront presence but your residential entrance is a bit lost.
- I have a problem with the height and the mass, and I’m curious about what the neighborhood has said about this project.
 - We have had a neighborhood meeting and they gave us the go-ahead to submit. Generally people were encouraged and happy to see this.

A couple of weeks ago Julia Kerr asked us to pull this item from our agenda and we did, so the neighborhood process could be finished.

- The steppers on the right side of the building are out of context, rather see grid of steppers with plantings.
- Problem with size/mass, need to see vertical feel on setbacks, carry color down to ground, concern with massiveness.

- An emphasis is needed on the residential entry.
- Bothered by the fourth floor on south side; a bit big, need convincing.
- Fourth floor should relate to the architecture below.
- Look at building across the street which has a nice sense of scale with precise window openings.
- The center section of the building needs to be stronger; materials need to be brought to ground and tie materials up to penthouse (dark masonry at lower level).

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7 and 9.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1907-1911 Monroe Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	9	9	7	-	-	8	9	9
	6	7	-	-	-	6	7	7
	-	5	-	-	-	-	6	6

General Comments:

- Great addition to the neighborhood!
- Look at scale of windows and think of some variation too. Stronger cut in the center of the Monroe Street elevation.
- Concerned about scale in this neighborhood – vertical “striation” of façade will help blend with existing buildings.