

## AGENDA # 4

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	<b>PRESENTED:</b> August 23, 2006
TITLE: 5901 Odana Road – Demolition and New Construction of an Auto Dealership in Urban Design District No. 3. 19 <sup>th</sup> Ald. Dist. (04007)	<b>REFERRED:</b> <b>REREFERRED:</b> <b>REPORTED BACK:</b>
AUTHOR: William A. Fruhling, Acting Secretary	<b>ADOPTED:</b> <span style="float: right;"><b>POF:</b></span>
DATED: August 23, 2006	<b>ID NUMBER:</b>

---

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Ald. Noel Radomski, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Lisa Geer, Robert March and Michael Barrett.

### **SUMMARY:**

At its meeting of August 23, 2006, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** for the demolition and new construction of an auto dealership at 5901 Odana Road, in UDD No. 3. Appearing on behalf of the project were Allen Foster, Jim Triatik, Atty. Michael Christopher, Tom Knoop, James A. Budinetz, Ryan Quam and Jeremy Holmstadt. Maurice Adams also registered in support. Triatik gave an overview of the changes to the site, landscaping, stormwater management and lighting plans. He clarified that the raised display area along the Beltline is 6-inches high with a mountable curb. The Commission questioned whether the light spillage along the sidewalk met City requirements, but could otherwise accept the lighting plan.

A memo from Matt Tucker, Zoning Administrator, was distributed that clarified that the landscaping requirements in the code apply to automobile inventory parking just as they would to customer parking areas. Foster clarified that the plan being presented meets this requirement. He also noted that more trees were added to the perimeter to offset the lack of trees within the inventory parking area. Adams requested that two new trees planned near the western driveway be relocated so they don't block the view of his commercial building on the adjacent lot.

### **ACTION:**

On a motion by Woods, seconded by Ald. Radomski, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** with the following conditions to be approved by staff:

1. Trees be added along both sides of the drive aisle paralleling the east side of the building (replacing some shrubs);
2. One parking stall be converted to a tree island, with a tree, in the center of the southern cluster of inventory parking;
3. Trees be added along the Beltline frontage adjacent to the inventory parking area;
4. Trees be added in the tree islands along the eastern edge of the inventory parking area;

5. The two trees proposed near the western entrance be relocated to the landscaping strip closest to the building near the employee parking area;
6. Zoning requirements for the landscaping or screening for off-street parking areas (as described in Tucker's memo) must be met; and
7. The applicant has the option of using paving instead of asphalt in the drive aisles.

The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (8-0).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 5, 5, 5.5, 5.75, 6, 6 and 6.

**URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 5901 Odana Road**

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
<b>Member Ratings</b>	6	6	7	6	6	5	6	6
	5	6	5	5	6	6	4	5
	-	7	4	4	-	-	-	5.75
	6	6	5	5	6	6	6	5.5
	5	5	5	5	-	5	5	5
	5	5	5	5	-	5	5	5
	6	7	4	5	6	6	6	6
	6	7	6	6	-	6	7	6

**General Comments:**

- As auto dealerships go, not outstanding but acceptable.
- This is minimal, landscape-wise, for an urban design district.
- Small, incremental change barely makes this approvable. Why should a car dealership be asking for special variances from long-established precedents?
- Add trees into the tree islands shown on either end of the inventory area and along the parking edge towards the Beltline at a minimum for shade and heat reduction.
- Need to meet City requirements for trees in parking lot and 75% vegetative area in islands. Reduce light bleed to the sidewalk.
- Heat island and stormwater issues still concern.
- Improvements added at tonight’s meeting were very positive – consistent with City ordinances, Urban Design District guidelines, and past precedents. Once constructed the owner can sell great cars in a great environment. I encourage Plan Commission and Council approval.