



Agenda Item #: 4

Project Title: 1123 Jenifer Street - Exterior Alteration in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Roof Replacement (District 6)

Legistar File ID #: 91099

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

Members: Present: Richard Arnesen, Ald. John Duncan, Edna Ely-Ledesma, Molly Harris, Katie Kaliszewski, Jacob Morrison, and Maurice Taylor
Excused: None

Summary

William Gustafson, registering in support and wishing to speak

John Bottensek, registering neither in support nor in opposition and available to answer questions

Bailey provided background information on the project.

William Gustafson, applicant, argued that the proposed metal roof would be compatible with the metal roofs at 517 S Baldwin Street and 826 Williamson Street. They said they want a standing seam metal roof due to cost and environmental concerns. They said there was no evidence that the house has always had asphalt shingles, and they didn't think a metal roof would change its historic character.

Arnesen asked about the cost of an asphalt shingle roof versus a standing seam metal roof. Gustafson said it was \$20-30,000 or less for asphalt and \$40,000 for a standing seam metal roof.

Morrison said he didn't see a compelling reason to circumvent the standards for alterations. He appreciated the applicant submitting other examples of nearby roofs, but as staff pointed out, each precedent has different conditions to consider.

Arnesen agreed that it was a "complete nonstarter" and didn't see any situation where the commission would approve a standing seam metal roof on a Victorian house built in the early 1900s.

Harris agreed with Morrison and Arnesen, noting that staff laid out the case well in the staff report and communications with the applicant. She appreciated the applicant's effort that went into finding potential comparables, but they were not actually comparable for the reasons noted by staff. She said that staff offered alternatives and choices, and the applicant will have to weigh those options.

Taylor asked the applicant to reiterate why they wanted a metal roof. Gustafson said the metal roof will last longer and provide better protection for the house; asphalt shingles last 20-30 years, and a metal roof can last up to 100 years. They also have solar panels and would prefer not to remove them every 20-30 years for a roof replacement. Taylor said he had no problem with a metal roof. Kaliszewski reminded commissioners that they must follow the ordinance, which says they should use buildings within the historic district as comparisons and should not create a false sense of history or add conjectural features.

Action

A motion was made by Duncan, seconded by Morrison, to Deny the request for the Certificate of Approval because the standards are not met. The motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes: 5 - John Duncan, Jacob Morrison, Molly Harris, Edna Ely-Ledesma, and Richard Arnesen

Noes: 1 - Maurice Taylor

Non Voting: 1 - Katie Kaliszewski