

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION **PRESENTED:** February 9, 2011

TITLE: 434-454 West Johnson Street – PUD(GDP-SIP), Nine-Story Hotel with First Floor Commercial Space and Elevated Parking. 4th Ald. Dist. (18499) **REFERRED:**
REREFERRED:
REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary **ADOPTED:** **POF:**

DATED: February 9, 2011 **ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Mark Smith, Dawn O’Kroley, Richard Slayton, John Harrington and Henry Lufler, Jr.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of February 9, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **RECEIVED AN INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** on a PUD(GDP-SIP) located at 434-454 West Johnson Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Jeff Brenkus and Jeff Kraemer, both representing Raymond Management. The project now consists of a hotel only with about 3,000 square feet of retail on the first floor. There is still a first floor connection to the Aberdeen, with a drop-off location and two levels of above grade parking with 133 parking stalls. Three levels of underground parking that were previously included have been removed due to water table issues. Floors 5-9 are configured in the shape of an upside down “T” with 195 guest rooms. The previous 12-stories and two towers has been reduced to one tower of 9-stories. Precast concrete, masonry and glass materials selections have been made; how they will be used has yet to be fully determined. Comments and questions from the Commission were as follows:

- These upper floors are “crushing” the floors below them, right down to the ground; suburban-like.
- Need to be urban, need vertically oriented building. Carry that all the way to ground or at least drive some portion of the building all the way to the top and eliminate non-used roof on top of first floor.
- Provide green roof above two garage level.
- You may want to rethink your pool placement; think about how to handle people in front of pool area on Bassett Street.
- Is there going to be a destination for non-hotel guests to be entering the building?
 - We’ll have minimal meeting space so pretty much it’ll just be guests.
- The façade we’re looking at doesn’t say “entrance.” Need presence on street with entry.
- The places where pedestrian will enter and your commercial space will appreciate street frontage with an entrance at grade.
- You may want to look at getting some more height to the building to hold your own on the one side next to the “Aberdeen;” street frontage at Bassett a little higher.
- The building side looks more suburban.
- Bike parking for retail and guests should be at grade.
- From a pedestrian standpoint it could be a much stronger entranceway. You need to grab people more.

- This is the beacon for this corner, so however you can celebrate that, do so. Previous versions were more vertical; need to stress the corner more.
- You need to have enough room to engage the street and for landscaping.
- You should think about this façade as having way more detail than it does now. One of the things that might help there is hardscape. Some kind of truly large scale urban gesture that holds that corner at that 15-18 foot high area there.
- When you come back we're going to want to see at least the first story in large scale, eye level perspectives of that area from at least the sidewalk area, looking up to the east from Johnson and south from Bassett, as well as these aerial overall shots. You need to put us on the street there so we can see what it's like.
- We'll need to see a larger scale proposal of the landscaping plans.
- The signs are useful next to an interstate or airport don't work here in an urban context.
- It looks like you're attempting to address the streetscape with landscaping. This is a much more special site; the interaction is important for the site.
- The fifteen feet between the sidewalk and face of the building should include amenities that relate to the street.
- Corner façade needs more detail and interest; open arcade, some large scale urban gesture that holds corner that's integrated into the whole building design.
- Need to frame corner.
- Signage should relate to traffic patterns and view shed; need to be creative, not suburban.

ACTION:

Since this was an **INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATION** no formal action was taken by the Commission.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall rating for this project is 5.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 434-454 West Johnson Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	5	-	-	-	-	-	-
	-	5	-	-	-	5	4	5

General Comments:

- Plain suburban look.
- Architecture must be more vertical, urban and integrated from the ground all the way to the roof/parapet.
- Building needs to better respond to street and corner. Consider activating the street. Pedestrian activity.