



PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION

Project Address: 503-519 Commerce Drive
Application Type: Alteration to a PD-SIP
Legistar File ID # [38934](#)
Prepared By: Heather Stouder, AICP, Planning Division
Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted

Summary

Applicant/Project Contact: David Baum; Architecture 2000; 311 E. Chicago, Suite 310; Milwaukee, WI 53202

Property Owner: All Saints Cottages and Condos, Inc.; 702 South High Point Road; Madison, WI 53719

Requested Action: Approval of an alteration to an approved PD (Planned Development) District for Phase 3 of the All Saints Campus, which includes 48 senior apartments, 60 assisted living units, and a retail space at 503-519 Commerce Drive.

Proposal Summary: The applicant is requesting approval of an alteration to allow for a change from fiber cement to vinyl siding on the approved buildings.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This proposal is subject to the standards for Planned Developments (MGO Section 28.098).

Review Required By: Plan Commission (PC)

Summary Recommendation: Planning Division staff recommends that the Plan Commission find that the Planned Development standards are not met, and **place on file** the requested alteration.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject property is located at the southeast corner of Commerce Drive and Watts Road; Planned Development (PD) Districts; Aldermanic District 9 (Skidmore); Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: The site is currently under construction.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

North: Undeveloped land in the PD District, approved in 2006 and recorded in January 2007 as part of the Ganser Heights General Development Plan for a restaurant and a multi-tenant commercial building.

East: Across Watts Road to the east, the Princeton Club and a dental office, both in the PD District.

South: 12-unit residential condominium building, part of the All Saints campus, in the PD District, and undeveloped land in the Agriculture District. Further to the south, a monastery, church, and associated lands on over 75 acres in the SR-C1 and Agriculture Districts.

West: All Saints Retirement Center, a three-story apartment building in the PD (Planned Development) District

Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan (2006) recommends medium-density residential uses for a majority of the subject property, and special Institutional uses for a small portion of the southeast part of the site. There is no more detailed neighborhood plan for this area.

Zoning Summary: This property lies within the PD (Planned Development) District.

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site is not located in a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities & Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services, including Metro Transit Route 73.

Related Approvals

On May 20, 2014, the Common Council approved the rezoning of this property from PD-GDP and Agriculture to PD-GDP-SIP for construction of Phase 3 of the All Saints Campus, which includes 48 senior apartments, 60 assisted living units, and a retail space at 503-519 Commerce Drive. The Common Council approval followed recommendations from the Urban Design Commission and Plan Commission (See Legistar Item [#33590](#) for the rezoning and Item [#31146](#) for the Urban Design Commission history).

Project Description, Analysis, and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting approval for an alteration to the Planned Development in order to change the exterior building materials from fiber cement, as originally approved, to vinyl siding. No further changes are requested by the applicant at this time. Throughout the review process for the approved proposal, the design of the buildings evolved several times. In fact, the proposal was seen by the Urban Design Commission at least five times between August, 2013 and May, 2014. However, the applicant consistently showed the primary exterior material as fiber cement siding until the very last set of plans submitted for final design review by the UDC, when “vinyl siding” was substituted as a small note for the areas formerly shown as “fiber cement siding”. This change was not mentioned to staff nor the UDC members, even though the version reviewed by staff and approved by the Plan Commission and Common Council clearly indicated “fiber cement” siding.

In MGO 28.098, the Statement of Purpose for the Planned Development District is as follows (*emphasis added*):

The Planned Development (PD) District is established to provide a voluntary regulatory framework as a means to facilitate the unique development of land in an integrated and innovative fashion, to allow for flexibility in site design, and to encourage development that is sensitive to environmental, cultural, and economic considerations, and that features **high-quality architecture and building materials...**

In the standards for approval of Planned Developments, Standard (e) is most relevant to this review:

(e) The PD District plan shall coordinate architectural styles and building forms to achieve greater compatibility with surrounding land uses and create an environment of sustained aesthetic desirability compatible with the existing or intended character of the area and the statement of purpose of the PD district.

Staff acknowledges that other existing buildings on earlier phases of the All Saints campus do indeed have vinyl siding. However, since these other buildings were approved and constructed, the Zoning Code has been substantially modified to exclude vinyl as a primary building material in many conventional zoning districts, and also to significantly limit the use of the Planned Development District. If the approved mixed-use development were in a conventional mixed-use zoning district, vinyl would not be allowed as anything more than an accent material. Thus, staff cannot support the use of vinyl as a primary building material in this Planned Development District, which should have a much higher bar for the architectural design and building materials than would a conventional district.

Recommendation

Planning Division staff recommends that the Plan Commission find that the Planned Development standards are not met, and **place on file** the requested alteration.