

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 12/17/18

TITLE: 1315 Spaight St - Exterior Alteration in the
Third Lake Ridge Hist. Dist.; 6th
Ald. Dist.

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: William Fruhling, Acting Preservation
Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 12/27/18

ID NUMBER: 53600

Members present were: Stuart Levitan, Anna Andrzejewski, Katie Kaliszewski, and Marsha Rummel. Excused were Richard Arnesen and David McLean.

SUMMARY:

Paul Ososky, registering in support and wishing to speak.

Fred Schumacher, registering in support and wishing to speak.

Fruhling described the various aspects of the project, including residing, replacing all windows, replacing doors on the front and rear, and rebuilding the front porch. He said that the applicant would like to install vinyl siding and wrap trim, which will generally maintain the existing trim details. He explained that the front porch is a key feature of the house, so he has been working with the contractor to properly document the existing porch to ensure that new elements will match the existing. He reported that the applicant intends to reuse any materials they can, otherwise they will use new materials to replicate all details of the existing porch.

Fruhling also made note of the other recommendation in the staff report, which states that siding shall be smooth with no faux wood grain. Ososky said that he liked the siding with the wood texture because he thought it would be closer in appearance to the original siding on the house.

Schumacher discussed the trim, explaining that they will bend and install new metal trim pieces in order to replicate the original appearance.

Rummel asked about the replacement of the windows. Ososky said that that house was built in 1880, and most of the original window sills on the first floor have rotted to the point where he cannot repair them. The majority of windows in the house are inoperable, and several have broken glass. Schumacher said that when installing the replacement windows, they will be able to keep the original wood framework on the interior. Kaliszewski asked if the replacement windows are vinyl or wood, and Ososky stated that they are vinyl. Fruhling said that in looking at the inventory of the existing windows, the information provided regarding their condition seems accurate, and the windows the applicant is proposing are acceptable.

Levitan requested an additional explanation of why smooth siding is preferable to textured. Kaliszewski said that in the 1880s, the siding would have been smooth. Fruhling explained further, noting that because the original wood siding would have been smooth with no wood grain, vinyl siding with a faux wood grain is not visually equivalent to the original wood, according to the Wisconsin Historical Society.

The applicants shared a different siding material sample with a more subtle brushstroke texture, which Commissioners agreed was more acceptable than siding with a faux wood grain.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Andrzejewski, seconded by Rummel, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that the front porch be rebuilt to exactly match the existing and that the vinyl siding have a smooth face or brushstroke texture, not a faux wood grain. The motion passed by voice vote/other.