

AGENDA # 7

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 8/12/19

TITLE: 1229 Jenifer St - Exterior Alteration in the
Third Lake Ridge Hist. Dist.; 6th
Ald. Dist.

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 8/19/19

ID NUMBER: 54857

Members present were: Richard Arnesen, Katie Kaliszewski, Arvina Martin, and David McLean. Excused was Anna Andrzejewski.

SUMMARY:

Kurt Hartjes, registering in support and available to answer questions

Ann Kox, registering in support and wishing to speak

Bailey explained that the proposed work is to replace all windows on the house. She said that on August 7, she and a Building Inspector made a site visit with the contractor and property owner to evaluate the windows. She described the applicable standards, and pointed out that the proposed work does not meet the standard for 41.23(9)(c), which states that alterations of the street façade shall retain the original or existing historical materials. She said that she recommends replacement of the non-historic windows only, which are located in the kitchen and bathroom. She said that a couple windows have rotted sills, and she recommends they be replaced with wood that is painted to match the trim. She said that the storm windows can also be replaced, but the historic windows should all be repaired. She said that she understood the property owner had a contractor look at the windows and provide an estimate.

Hartjes said that regarding the rotted sills, they don't know how many are rotted because they are currently clad in aluminum. He said that one window is boarded up and another is inoperable, and they don't know what is happening with them until they start to dive in. He said that they had the windows tested for lead paint, and there was a failing lead test in the windows, but the fluted trim on the inside passed. He said that all windows tested had a Pb level of 5. He said that they had Wahl Painting come in, who said they could paint the windows. Kox said that they contacted everyone on the list of contractors, and James Westring got back to her, but said they are booked into 2020 and not taking on new work. She said that the only one who got back to her and was available is Wahl Painting, but she was troubled because he does not do sill replacement. She said that he does not do restoration, and he was not concerned about rot, though everyone else has agreed there is rot. She said that he will caulk and paint, which does not address the rot that will continue to grow. She said that they want to fix the house and add value to the neighborhood, and they are not opposed to restoration, but have not been able to get anybody to take a look at it. She said that simply caulking, painting, and fixing some ropes is \$11,000, but that is only a quarter of the job because that doesn't include any exterior work. She said that the storm windows also need to be replaced and the rot needs to be addressed. She said that she is really concerned and ready to move forward on any path, but it is not a viable path to go with this painter. She said that she would really like someone to come in and do the work right.

Kaliszewski asked for confirmation that the picture windows do not have any decorative stained glass, and Bailey said that was correct. Hartjes said that they are keeping the very top front window, which is leaded glass, and all the others will be replaced. He said that the double-hung windows don't have any muntins, but they did add a fully divided light grid in both picture windows to mimic what is existing. Kaliszewski asked what type of window is being proposed, and Hartjes said that they are wood composite. Kaliszewski asked if they are aluminum-clad. Hartjes said they are open to suggestions because they are all rotted now, so they want to pull off the aluminum cladding and fix them. He said that the property owner is open to how they fix and seal the outside. Kaliszewski asked if they are pulling the frames off around the windows and if they will need to be replaced. Hartjes said that on the exterior they are, but not the whole frame because they are trying to preserve the fluted trim on the inside. Kaliszewski asked if the exterior trim is staying in place. Hartjes said that it is currently clad in aluminum, so they will pull that off and seal it with caulk. Bailey said that in the areas where the aluminum wrapping is off, there is significant rot. She said that they have approved wrapping exterior wood elements as a way of preventing deterioration, but her concern is that one does not see when it fails until it is a more serious structural issue. She said that her recommendation would be to approve replacement with wood or LP Smartside rather than a replacement and wrapping. Kaliszewski asked if Bailey was willing to administratively approve the dimensions and details, and Bailey said that she can. Kox said that the integrity of the house is starting to be compromised, and the porch has significant rot. Bailey said that there are some issues with the box beam on the porch. McLean asked Bailey for her opinion on the overall window conditions because she inspected the site. Bailey said that a lot of the sills could be replaced, and likely the exterior frames as well. She said that it is difficult to tell because they are wrapped in aluminum, but given the amount of deterioration she saw in the sills, the frames are probably not in great condition. She said that the non-historic windows are replacements, so it is fine to replace those. For the wood windows, she said that staff's recommendation is that they be repaired. Kox said that it is unclear how that can be done because she began this project a year ago, and over the last few weeks has not been able to find anybody to do the work. She said that as a practical matter, the Commission should consider the fact that the house is rotting and she is a landlord who should be able to fix her property. Arnesen asked if this project is different than the others they reviewed at tonight's meeting and McLean asked if the condition of the windows is as bad as the others they have seen. Bailey said that it is hard to say because she did not see the windows of the other properties in person, but these windows are probably in worse condition than 15 E Gilman Street.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Arnesen, seconded by McLean, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the conditions that window specifications be approved by staff and rotted window sills be replaced in kind and painted to match trim. The motion passed by voice vote/other.