



**Project Name & Address:** 504 S Brearly Street (953 Jenifer Street)

**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

**Legistar File ID #** [61590](#)

**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** August 11, 2020

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Elizabeth Cwik, BWZ Architects

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations including roof replacement, stucco repair, exterior door replacement, and installation of an accessible ramp.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (7) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - (a) Height
    - (b) Alterations of street façade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids
    - (c) Alterations of street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
    - (d) Alterations of roof shall retain its existing historical appearance.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to repair the existing roof; repair deteriorated stucco and wood trim with materials in-kind; replacing nonhistoric exterior doors with doors that replicate the style of an extant historic door; installation of wall-mounted lights flanking the main entrance; replace the existing skylight; remove existing wood siding on the 1877 wing and replace with smooth-surfaced vinyl siding that replicates the current clapboard exposure; remove a sign panel in a former window space on the bell tower and replace it with spandrel glass, and replace a nonhistoric ADA ramp.

According to the preservation file, the existing building was originally constructed as the 3<sup>rd</sup> Ward School Building in 1877. That older portion has undergone the most extensive alterations and is the wing of the building clad in clapboard. In 1914, James Law (founding member of noted local architecture firm Law, Law & Potter) designed the stucco-clad Spanish Revival-style wing. The building has undergone changes over time and is currently home to the Wil-Mar Neighborhood Center. The more recent interventions were part of a 1994 Certificate of Appropriateness to rehabilitate the building, which included replacement of many of the existing windows.

Most of the repairs are replacing materials in-kind and replicating existing deteriorated features. There are several nonhistoric exterior doors and the proposal is to replicate the style of an extant exterior door to provide more period appropriate doors on the building. The main double door will replicate the form of the other new doors, but have a glass panel instead of a plank panel. Historic photos show the arched window space on the tower as previously filled in with stucco and later with the signage placed over it. The outline of the former window space is evident and the proposed introduction of spandrel glass into this space will allow it to read as a window opening again.

The current ADA ramp is deteriorating and no longer meets building code. It has a decorative motif of groupings of thin balusters to create a repeated pattern. The current railing is metal and the applicant is proposing to replace it with a wood railing that again creates a pattern of groupings of balusters. The railing is simple but does introduce a slight decorative element. Likewise, the new exterior light flanking the entrance is obviously modern, but is simple in style and compliments the style of the existing building rather than contrasting with it.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (7) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use.
- (a) There is no proposed changes to any height on the building or its components.
  - (b) As a corner property, it has two street facades. The only change to the existing rhythm of solids and voids is to reintroduce the window opening on the tower, which will bring back the void in that location. The rhythm of solids and voids on the railing of the

current ADA ramp was to replicate the window pattern on that side of the building. The new ADA ramp has simple balusters with the occasional square spacer, which will reference the quoins on that side of the building.

- (c) On the street facades, the proposal is to replace nonhistoric elements with period appropriate or stylistically complimentary materials or features. The replacement of the wood siding is not on a street façade.
- (d) The roof and skylight are proposed for replacement with no changes in style or form.

## **Recommendation**

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.