



Project Name & Address: 817-821 Williamson Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Legistar File ID # [59708](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: August 11, 2020

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Brandon Cook, John Fontain Realty

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new mixed-use structure.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.
- 41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**
- (6) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial

use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:

- (a) Gross Volume.
- (b) Height.
- (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facade(s).
- (d) The materials used in the street facade(s).
- (e) The design of the roof.
- (f) The rhythm of buildings masses and spaces.

Analysis and Conclusion

At its June 1, 2020, meeting, the Landmarks Commission approved the applicant's request for demolition of the existing building at 817 Williamson and the combination of the lots at 817 and 821 Williamson. They provided feedback to the applicant on the proposed new structure and referred the project to a future meeting for a final decision. The commission reviewed the updated proposal at its July 13 meeting and referred the item to the next meeting with guidance to explore a two façade solution and address the height of the building at the street.

The updated submission has two street façades with a slightly different rhythm of window and door placements between the two. The commercial façade is two stories with a third-floor balcony screened behind the cornice. The apartment façade is three-stories, but the applicant as reduced the height of the building down to 40'-7" from the original 41'-3". There is a cornice applied between the second and third stories on that façade. The cladding on the front portion of the building has returned to the darker red brick of the initial proposal. The spacing between the two façades is comparable to the spacing between the other buildings on this block face.

The applicant has broken up the mass of the street façade of the building by creating two street façades and has reduced the height of the building at the street. Staff believes that the project as submitted meets the standards for new construction in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District. Please see the analysis in the previous staff reports.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting Certificates of Appropriateness for the new construction are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the proposal.