

Mall Special Charges District Expansion Study

Prepared For:
Alder Michael Verveer
And
Members of the Downtown Coordinating Committee

Prepared By:
Eric Knepp, Interim Parks Superintendent
Lisa Laschinger, Central Parks General Supervisor
Laura Bauer, West Parks General Supervisor
Pat Hario, Administrative Assistant
Charlie Romines, Former Parks Operations Manager
Scott Wood, Financial Management Intern

August 21, 2014

Introduction

The State Street Mall and Capitol Concourse is a vital part of Madison. The area is a hub of dining, shopping and tourism in the City's downtown. In 1979 Resolution No. 37075 mandated that a portion of the City's annual costs devoted to maintaining the State Street Mall and Capitol Concourse (hereafter, Mall Concourse) be specially charged to properties who reside within the service area. Per Resolution 37401 in 1981, the charges assessed to property owners in the district would be calculated based upon a combination of parcel square footage and effective service frontage length. Since 1982, a portion of the City's cost to maintain the district has been recovered by assessing special charges against properties in proximity to the Mall Concourse area.

Alder Michael Verveer and the Downtown Coordinating Committee have requested the City of Madison Parks Division study expansion of the special charges district to provide additional areas with same level of service currently provided. This study reviews cost apportionment and service standards of the current Mall Concourse area, examines the costs of servicing the eleven proposed expansion areas, and concludes with recommendations for the Downtown Coordinating Committee going forward.

Current Service Area and Service Standards

The current Mall Concourse service area includes all of State Street, the State Capitol Square, and applicable adjacent parcels (See Map attached). This area receives the following services from the City of Madison Parks Division (For a more detailed description of services and standards please see Appendix A):

- Recycling and Trash Service
- Turf and Landscape Maintenance
- Special Event Preparation and Clean-up Services
- Bus Stop Maintenance
- Sidewalk Maintenance and Cleaning
- Snow Removal
- Visitor Center Maintenance

Current Apportionment Method

The total costs for servicing the Mall Concourse district is apportioned between the City and Mall Concourse district property owners. The City pays for two-thirds of the following: the total amount of chargeable expenses less all landscaping fees less one full-time Parks Maintenance Worker's salary and benefits. The Mall Concourse property owners are responsible for paying the remaining one-third of the sum left unpaid by the City plus one hundred percent of all landscaping fees and one full-time Parks Maintenance Worker's salary and benefits. Total chargeable expenses include an adjustment for citywide trash/recycling pickup one day per week.

Special charges are assessed against individual property owners as per the following: fifty percent of the total amount owed is apportioned by each property owner's percentage of the total parcel square footage in the Mall Concourse district. The other fifty percent of the total amount owed is apportioned by each property owner's percentage of total frontage feet in the district. Chargeable frontage feet are defined as the sum of one-

hundred percent of primary store frontage feet plus fifty percent of any secondary frontage feet. Each property owner is billed the sum of their parcel share and frontage feet share at the end of each fiscal year.

Current Costs

Special charges to property owners for the 2012/2013 fiscal year totaled \$304,871.86. In 2013/2014, these charges totaled nearly \$319,000. The district has been expanded in current fiscal year to include the 300 block of West Gorham Street and nearby North Broom Street and thus it is projected that the 2014/2015 charges will total approximately \$328,000. These charges are assessed against the Mall Concourse property owners using the formula outlined above.

Review of Expansion Area and Service Standards

This study considers the possibility of expanding the Mall Special Charges District to incorporate 11 new areas. All proposed areas have been highlighted on the attached Map.

- 1) Lake St., 400 block, east side
- 2) Hawthorne Ct., "street" section of alley
- 3) N. Frances St., 400 block, west side
- 4) N. Frances St., 400 block, east side
- 5) W. Gilman St., 400 block, north side
- 6) W. Gilman St., 400 block, south side
- 7) W. Gorham St., 400 block, north side
- 8) W. Gorham St., 400 block, south side
- 9) University Ave., 600 block, north side
- 10) Removed from consideration due to safety concerns
- 11) University Ave., 500 block, north side

Mall Concourse staff closely reviewed each area and made the following determinations:

Narrowest width:	to determine if current equipment could fit
Width restriction:	noting any item(s) blocking the area
Snow equipment:	noting which equipment would fit
Sidewalk cleaning equipment:	noting which equipment would fit
Trash/recycling can placement:	possibility of
Bench placement:	possibility of
Planter placement:	possibility of
Street parking:	yes or no
Curblinewindrow: (from street plowing)	yes or no
Bus stop:	yes or no
Bus lane:	yes or no
Driveways:	listing and description
Other issues:	items not covered by the above, with assessments by staff

After detailed review, staff arranged the areas into three groups:

Base Area comprises areas #1, #3, #4, #5, #6, #9 and #11. These areas are determined to have the best chance of a successful inclusion into the Mall Concourse responsibility area.

Area #2, Hawthorne Ct.. It is deemed that the additional hours, equipment, and costs required to for providing this area with a sufficient level of service requires special review and discussion.

Areas #7 and #8 comprise the third group. Again, it is deemed that the additional hours, equipment, and costs required of providing this area with a sufficient level of service requires additional review and discussion.

Cost Estimates:

Cost of Adding Base Area

Analysis of the Base Area finds that it would require approximately an additional \$177,000 in annual operating costs to service. This amount reflects the addition of staff positions, seasonal hours, equipment, benches, trash receptacles etc. Appendices contain descriptions of needs and the breakdown of costs for each group and various options. Under the current cost apportionment method, two-thirds of this cost (\$118,000) would be paid for by the City. The remaining one-third (\$59,000) would be recovered through special assessments to Mall Concourse property owners.

Cost of Adding Area #2

Analysis of adding Area #2 (Hawthorne Ct.) to the Mall Concourse finds that it would require approximately an additional \$26,000 in annual operating costs to service. This amount reflects additional staffing and anticipated overtime needs. Under the current apportionment method, two-thirds of this cost (\$17,333) would be paid for by the City. The remaining one-third (\$8,667) would be recovered through special assessments.

Cost of Adding Areas #7 and #8

Analysis of Areas #7 and #8 find that it would require approximately an additional \$47,000 in annual operating costs. This amount reflects the need for special equipment to be purchased for servicing this area as well as additional staff hours needed. Under the current cost apportionment method, two-thirds of this cost (\$31,333) would be paid for by the City. The remaining one-third (\$15,667) would be recovered through special charges to property owners.

A summary of these costs can be found in the table below:

Estimated Annual Operating Costs to Service Expansion Areas			
Area	Total Cost	Cost to City	Assessed to Prop. Owners
Base Area	\$177,000	\$118,000	\$59,000
Area #2	\$26,000	\$17,333	\$8,667
Area #7 & #8	\$47,000	\$31,333	\$15,667
Total	\$250,000	\$166,666	\$83,334

Impacts of Expanding the District:

Status Quo:

The average special assessment charged to property owners in 2013/2014 was \$1,684. This marks a 2% increase from 2012/2013 for incumbent property owners and a 100% increase for the 5 property owners who were new to the district in 2013/2014.

Addition of Base Area:

If the Mall Concourse District expanded to include the Base Area, the total billable amount charged to property owners will increase by approximately 21% to \$387,000. Incumbent property owners in the district would see their annual special assessment fees increase on average by about 7.6% to \$1,773. The 33 additional property owners in the expansion area will pay on average \$1,482 per year for Mall Concourse services.

Addition of Base Area plus Area #2:

If the Mall Concourse expanded to include the Base Area plus Area #2, the total billable amount would increase by 24% to \$396,667. Incumbent property owners would see their annual special assessment fees increase on average by about 8.6% to \$1,802. The 34 additional property owners in the expansion area would pay on average \$1,594 for services.

Addition of Base Area plus Areas #7 and #8:

If the Mall Concourse expanded to include the Base Area plus Areas #7 and #8, the total billable amount would increase by 26% to \$402,667. Incumbent property owners would see their annual special assessment fees increase on average by about 6.8% to \$1,768. The 45 additional property owners in the expansion area would pay on average \$1,630 for services.

Addition of Base Area plus Areas #2, #7, and #8:

If the Mall Concourse District expanded to include all proposed expansion areas, the total billable amount will increase by 29% to \$412,000. Incumbent property owners would see their annual special assessment fees increase on average by about 8.5% to \$1,800. The 46 additional property owners in the expansion area will pay on average \$1,665 for Mall Concourse services.

Recommendation:

Parks is confident in the accuracy of the cost estimates provided in this report and is confident the expansion of service can be provided. If enough City resources are available, Parks recommends expanding the Mall Concourse district to include the Base Area as it is some of the most highly trafficked and readily serviceable portion of the proposed expansion area.

It must be noted that the metrics and recommendation put forth by this report assume the continuation of the existing cost apportionment method to the expansion areas. Any other apportionment method would call for a significant policy choice from the Downtown Coordinating Committee and the Common Council and would require careful deliberation.

Appendix A

Detail of Services Provided to Mall Concourse District:

1. Recycling and Trash

Recycling: Recycling cans are lined with plastic bags and are emptied as needed. During warm months, cans are checked daily. In winter, this can decrease to 1 or 2 times per week. Material collected is put in a truck and taken to the Pellitteri recycling facility.

There can be some problems with this recycling program. Cans may be stuffed full of packaging material by merchants. There could be confusion about what is and is not recyclable (pizza boxes with grease and Styrofoam are NOT recyclable). Food cart vendors may fill the recycling cans full of juice jugs.

Sidewalk picking: Mall Concourse crews pick large pieces of trash from State Street and Capitol Square sidewalks daily. This usually occurs in conjunction with the trash run, though occasionally it is done as a separate step when the garbage truck does not go out or when there is a lot of trash on the sidewalk.

Dumpsters: Dumpsters are located at State Street Campus Ramp, State Street Capitol Ramp (2), Madison Municipal Building (2) and Mall Concourse shop. These dumpsters are emptied each weekend and 1 - 2 times per week, depending on the volume of trash.

Capitol Loop and Water Utility trash can: Sidewalk cans are emptied 1 – 2 times per week, depending on the season and volume of trash.

Capitol Square: Sidewalk cans are emptied daily or every other day, again, depending on the volume of trash.

State Street: On State Street, the sidewalk cans are emptied daily. Bagged merchant/resident trash is collected on Thursdays by Mall Staff. Tan wheeled trash carts are emptied Thursdays by Streets Department staff, as the Mall Concourse garbage truck is not equipped to empty the wheeled trash bins. Large items are collected by the Streets Division every other Thursday (alternating with recycling Thursdays). On busy summer weekends, every effort is made to collect trash a second time in the afternoon.

Low volumes of rubbish because of extremely cold weather or the absence of students may increase the time between pickups. Snowy weather can pre-empt pickup, as all Mall Concourse staff may be working on snow removal.

There can be problems with the rubbish collection. Sometimes merchants or residents use the decorative metal sidewalk containers for their own trash and/or recycling, or deposit trash next to the sidewalk cans. These metal containers are placed for the convenience of pedestrians who need to dispose of cups, wrappers, bottles, etc. They were never intended to function as drop-off points for merchant or residential trash and recycling. This illegal dumping gives the impression that there aren't enough trash cans

sited on the sidewalk or that Mall Concourse staff is not emptying the cans regularly. Bags left next to the sidewalk cans at all hours are unsightly and can increase the time it takes to complete the trash run. In addition, there is the risk that the bags' contents will become scattered on the sidewalk. Staff is currently working with Building Inspection to draft a letter to residents and merchants in the service area that would allow us to charge for labor hours to retrieve trash that is disposed of improperly.

2. Turf and Landscape Maintenance

One of the goals of the Mall Concourse crew is to maintain grass, shrubs and flower plantings in an attractive manner. This means labor at more than 60 grass islands, 99 planters, 4 road medians and Peace Park Grove. Tasks include mowing, trimming, fertilization and irrigation, core aerating, overseeding and hand-watering. Staff also assists Olbrich Botanical Gardens and the Business Improvement District with the seasonal changeout program in the large planter tubs.

3. Special Events

The Mall Concourse area sees over 60 events such as Concerts on the Square, Farmer's Market, Freakfest, etc. that need services in a typical year. Staff's goal is to return the sidewalks and streets to pre-event condition before stores open for business the following day. For many special events, trash and recycling barrels are delivered to prearranged spots in advance of the events. This equipment is then retrieved after the event.

When possible, staff uses the sidewalk sweeper in the special event area the day before an event is scheduled. This helps determine whether or not the event organizer has cleaned up appropriately after the event.

4. Bus Stop Maintenance

Bus shelter windows, floors and benches are cleaned and power washed as needed. Power washing is done April through November when the risk of freezing does not exist.

5. Sidewalk Maintenance and Cleaning

Sidewalks are swept and seating is power washed as needed. Crew install benches, bike racks and refuse containers by securing them to stainless steel anchors drilled into the pavement.

Sidewalk sweeping is done every day, weather permitting. When staff is available, crews use backpack and hand-held blowers to direct debris to where it can be picked up by the sweeper. On sidewalks where the sweeper does not fit (due to sidewalk cafes, dumpsters, etc.) debris maybe blown onto the street or parking areas and swept up from there.

The 100 blocks of King, North Hamilton and South Hamilton Streets are swept once per week. The Capitol square is swept weekly in conjunction with mowing operations, cleaning up any grass clippings along with regular sidewalk debris.

6. Snow Removal

Mall Concourse staff removes snow and ice from sidewalk, while the Streets Division manages snow removal from the street. Mall Concourse crew make snow and ice removal a priority, in keeping with their objective of making the environment safe, passable and well-maintained. This also includes hand shoveling snow accumulations around bike racks, benches and bus stops as need dictates and time allows.

7. Visitor Center

Crew maintains and cleans the visitor center. It is checked daily and cleaned as needed. Mall Concourse staff are responsible for the foyer, bathrooms and ambassador office. Staff removes trash and recycling.

APPENDIX B

Year-Long Maintenance of “Base” Area:

Our analysis estimates the proposed expansion area is equivalent to approximately one side of State Street from top to bottom; however, since this area was never considered part of State Street and was not constructed in the same manner, it will take much longer to complete services and will require different machines (that we do not currently have) for maintaining the existing service area. The “Base” includes the following Areas #1, #3, #4, #5, #6, #9 and #11 as indicated on attached map, Appendix A. All areas within the base are constructed in such a way that staff would be able to provide maintenance of the same scope as in the existing Mall Concourse Service Area. Several minor adjustments would need to occur for staff to complete the work, and those are as follows:

- Staff would need the ability to bag the parking meters in the service area as work dictates without obtaining approval each time. We estimate we would need 12 meter bags.
- The sign for the parking ramp in Area #1 would need to be relocated, as it obstructs the staff’s ability to clear the walks with current equipment.
- The US Postal Mailbox in Area #1 would need to be relocated for the same reason as above.
- The guard to the gas meter in Area #6 would need to be painted or otherwise staked to make it visible during snow plowing operations.

Staff would require the following additional resources in order to perform this maintenance to a consistent level and not impact the current service levels in other areas:

Additional Staff Requirements:

- 2 Full-Time Park Maintenance Workers
- 1 Seasonal Employee

Additional Equipment Requirements:

- One Toolcat
- Broom for Toolcat
- Spreader for Toolcat
- Straight blade plow for Toolcat
- One four-wheel-drive John Deere 1435
- Broom for John Deere
- Plow for John Deere
- Bobcat S-70
- Plow for S-70
- Broom for S-70
- Blower for S-70
- Spreader for S-70
- Tennant 636 Sweeper
- Expanded Shop Space (3400 additional square feet within Fairchild Facility)

Potential Amenities to Base Area:

In order to achieve similar appearance and services as the original service area, we may allow the addition of the following components if so desired. Placement of any of the components below will be at the discretion of City Staff.

Parks staff consulted with Madison Police Department prior to finalizing the study. Staff requested a determination of amenities permitted with regards to safety. Areas #9 and #11 are currently very challenging for MPD at certain times of day. The addition of amenities (i.e., pots, benches, receptacles) would increase the number of obstacles in the area and present hazards in MPD’s ability to keep the traffic flowing and the public safe. Therefore, no amenities have been included for Areas #9 and #10.

- **Benches:**
 - Benches would only be allowed in Areas #4, #5, #6
 - Max 4-2' benches on #4, #5 and #6.
- **Trash and Recycling Receptacles:**
 - Maximum of one of each to Areas #3, #4, #5
 - We do not support adding any receptacles to Area #1 due to width restrictions.
- **Above Ground Pots:** (up to a maximum of 3 per area)
 - Pots may be allowed in Areas #3, #4, #5 and #6
- **Bike Racks:**
 - Bike rings exist already in areas #5 and #6.
 - Areas #1, #3 and #4 are too narrow for bike racks.

BASE (AREAS 1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 9, 11)		
Resource Requirement	Quantity	Estimated Annual Cost
Full-Time Park Maintenance Worker	2	\$ 110,000.00
Seasonal Labor (1100 Hours)	1	\$ 15,000.00
One Toolcat	1	\$ 7,760.00
Broom for Toolcat	1	\$ 970.00
Spreader for Toolcat	1	\$ 543.20
Straight blade plow for Toolcat	1	\$ 407.40
John Deere 1435 (4x4)	1	\$ 3,511.40
Cab for John Deere	1	\$ 698.40
Broom for John Deere (M-B)	1	\$ 1,067.00
Plow for John Deere	1	\$ 349.20
Bobcat S-70 (Fully equipped plus attachments)	1	\$ 3,303.31
S-70 Broom	1	\$ 577.34
S-70 Plow	1	\$ 348.35
S-70 Blower + Stainless steel blade	1	\$ 976.79
S-70 Bucket + Stainless steel blade	1	\$ 348.35
Tennant 636 Sweeper	1	\$ 18,821.10
Expanded Shop Space	3400 Sq. Ft.	\$ -
Benches (2 allowed in areas 9 and 11)	4	\$ 887.74
Benches (4 allowed in 4,5,6)	12	\$ 2,273.99
Pots (3 per area allowed)	18	\$ 1,950.63
Trash Receptacles (per allowed)	7	\$ 991.54
Recycling Receptacles (per allowed)	7	\$ 1,141.60
Bike Racks (per allowed)	1	\$ 70.84
Estimated Total Annual Cost of Base Expansion:		\$ 171,998.19

APPENDIX C

Season-Long Maintenance of Area #2 (Hawthorne Court):

Due to the make-up of Area #2, crews will face serious obstacles in completing services efficiently, effectively and safely. The area is a narrow street with narrow sidewalks, private driveways and parking areas. The snow from the private areas is frequently pushed into the street, and staff is not well-equipped to move this snow during the regular shift. Therefore, snow from heavy snowfalls will need to be moved during the nighttime and will frequently require the use of a Parks Equipment Operator as well as heavier Parks snow removal equipment that is frequently used on other portions of snow removal routes. In addition, the sidewalks in this area are very narrow, making it very difficult for staff to complete snow removal and sidewalk cleaning services consistent with other areas of the existing service area. Therefore, a significant amount of hand shoveling and salting will be required. We would not support adding any amenities to this area.

In order to complete yearly maintenance of this area, staff would require the following resources that would be in addition to the resource required to complete the “Base” areas:

Additional Staff Requirements:

- .4 Full-Time Parks Maintenance Worker
- Additional Overtime pay for PMW and EOII to haul snow

AREA #2		
Resource Requirement	Quantity	Estimated Annual Cost
Full-Time Park Maintenance Worker	0.4	\$ 22,000.00
Parks EOII OT for Snow Hauling	36	\$ 1,368.00
PMW OT for Snow Hauling	72	\$ 2,448.00
Total Cost of Area 2 Expansion:		\$ 25,816.00

APPENDIX D

Season-Long Maintenance of Areas #7 and #8:

Areas #7 and #8 as indicated on the map are not currently conducive to staff and equipment performing work consistent with other work performed within the existing Mall Concourse service area or with the proposed “Base” areas. The width of the sidewalks coupled with the speed and volume of traffic from the adjacent Gorham Street would make it very difficult to complete the work in a safe and timely manner. There is no place to pile large snowfalls. Therefore, considerable overtime and heavy equipment resources would be required to remove snow from the walks. The walks are too narrow for equipment-mounted spreaders. Therefore the use of walk-behind spreaders and bagged de-icer product would be required. Such efforts would also involve requiring closure of one lane of traffic during snow removal operations. Additionally, these particular areas lack the pedestrian-friendly “feel” that the rest of the service areas possess. We would not support adding any amenities to either of these areas due to width restrictions.

If these areas were to be added to the service area, we would require the following additional resources:

Additional Staff Requirements:

- .5 Full-Time Parks Maintenance Worker
- Additional overtime pay for PMW and EOII

Additional Equipment Requirements:

- Two Four-wheel-drive John Deere 1435
- Snowblower for John Deere
- Broom for John Deere
- Walk-behind Sweeper
- Push Spreader
- Bagged De-Icer product

AREA #7 and 8		
Resource Requirement	Quantity	Estimated Annual Cost
Full-Time Park Maintenance Worker	0.5	\$ 27,500.00
Push Spreader	1	\$ 87.30
Bagged De-Icer Product	1	\$ 3,000.00
Walk-behind Sweeper	1	\$ 5,736.97
John Deere 1435 (4x4)	2	\$ 6,790.00
Cab for John Deere	2	\$ 1,396.80
Broom for John Deere	2	\$ 1,358.00
Plow for John Deere	2	\$ 698.40
Total Cost of Area 7 and 8 Expansion:		\$ 46,567.47