



Landmark Structures

1665 Harmon Road
Fort Worth, Texas 76177
817.439.8888 Phone
817.439.9001 Fax
www.teamlandmark.com

January 31, 2017

Mr. Al Larson, P.E.
City of Madison Water Utility
119 East Olin Avenue
Madison, WI 53713

RE: Notice of Bid Protest
“Blackhawk Water Tower” – Contract 7821, Project No. 10445
Munis No. 10445-86-140
Bid Date: January 27, 2017 @ 1:00 PM CST

Dear Mr. Larson:

Landmark Structures formally protests consideration of the bid from Caldwell Tanks for the project referenced above based on the following:

- Section 33 16 19.33 Concrete / Steel Composite Water Storage Tanks, Part 2 – Products, Item 2.5 Concrete Support Structure, Item A.9.a mandates the following: “Place all wall concrete **vertically** and directly inside the reinforcement cage with drop chutes to prevent form splatter and the resulting surface finish variations.” It is our understanding that the concrete placement procedure used by Caldwell allows for **horizontal** placement of concrete and therefore, does not comply with the specification.
- Section 33 16 19.33 Concrete / Steel Composite Water Storage Tanks, Part 2 – Products, Item 2.5 Concrete Support Structure, Item A.9.d mandates the following: “Extend form panels full height of the concrete lift using only vertical panels.” It is our understanding that the components of the slip-form system used by Caldwell cannot be extended as required, and therefore do not comply with the specification.
- Section 33 16 19.33 Concrete / Steel Composite Water Storage Tanks, Part 2 – Products, Item 2.5 Concrete Support Structure, Item A.9.e mandates the following: “Utilize segmented placement procedures with concreting support all consisting of temporary vertical bulkheads dividing the wall pour into segments corresponding to a single batch (truck load) of concrete.” It is our understanding that the vertical bulkheads used in conjunction with the slip-form system used by Caldwell does not correspond to a single batch of concrete, and therefore does not comply with the specification.
- Section 33 16 19.33 Concrete / Steel Composite Water Storage Tanks, Part 2 – Products, Item 2.5 Concrete Support Structure, Item A.9.f mandates the following: “Placement of multiple batches is not permitted.” It is our understanding that the vertical bulkheads used in conjunction with the slip-form system used by Caldwell requires multiple

batches of concrete to reach full height, and therefore does not comply with the specification.


- Section 33 16 19.33 Concrete / Steel Composite Water Storage Tanks, Part 2 – Products, Item 2.5 Concrete Support Structure, Item A.9.g mandates the following: “Continuously place wall segment concrete to full form height for a single load.” It is our understanding that the horizontal concrete placement method used by Caldwell requires multiple batches to reach full form height, and as such, cannot be considered a continuous placement of concrete, and therefore does not comply with the specification.
- Section 33 16 19.33 Concrete / Steel Composite Water Storage Tanks, Part 2 – Products, Item 2.5 Concrete Support Structure, Item A.9.h mandates the following: “Place a maximum of one support wall concreting operation each day.” It is our understanding the form system used by Caldwell requires continuous adjustment (disturbance) of the form system to advance pedestal operations, and therefore does not comply with the specification.
- Section 33 16 19.33 Concrete / Steel Composite Water Storage Tanks, Part 2 – Products, Item 2.5 Concrete Support Structure, Item A.9.j, as revised in Addendum No. 1, mandates the following: “Forms that provide for distances between horizontal rustications to be more than 24-inches will require an additional form insert to be provided at no additional cost to Owner.” While this additional form insert must be provided at no cost to the City of Madison, it is our opinion that the slip-form system used by Caldwell is not capable of accommodating this additional insert and also that the resulting aesthetic would not be in keeping with the mandate for architectural grade concrete.

By contrast, the bid submitted by Landmark for the Blackhawk Water Tower complies fully with the project specification and all project provisions as outlined by the City of Madison, including planned participation in an approved apprenticeship program for the specific trades identified in our bid submittal.

We understand that the City will be reviewing the bids in the next several days and we would welcome any questions regarding our proposal.

Sincerely,

LANDMARK STRUCTURES



Elton Youart
Division Manager