



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Master

File Number: 21380

File ID: 21380

File Type: Resolution

Status: Items Referred

Version: 1

Reference:

Controlling Body: BOARD OF PARK COMMISSIONERS

Lead Referral: BOARD OF ESTIMATES

Cost:

File Created Date : 02/04/2011

File Name: Accepting the Madison City Staff authored feasibility study for a rooftop intensive community garden and/or a green roof at the remodeled/renovated Madison Central Public Library.

Final Action:

Title: Accepting the Madison City Staff authored feasibility study for a rooftop intensive community garden and/or a green roof at the remodeled/renovated Madison Central Public Library.

Notes: Bryan C.

Code Sections:

CC Agenda Date: 02/22/2011

Indexes:

Agenda Number: 17.

Sponsors: Michael E. Verveer and Larry Palm

Enactment Date:

Attachments: 02-11-2011 Green Roof Feasibility Study.pdf, Appendix I - City of Madison – Library Capital Budget Summary for 2010 & 2011.pdf, Appendix II - Sketch of general building area considered for roof top garden.pdf, Appendix III - Back-up for cost estimates.pdf, Appendix IV - Schematic Design Report & Drawings.pdf, Appendix V - Madison Parks memo and flow chart information for community garden .pdf, Appendix VII - James Madison Park Memo & Title Information for Community Garden.pdf, Appendix VIII - Olin Turville Park Memo & Title Information for Community Garden.pdf, Appendix VI - Brittingham Park Memo & Title Information for Community Gardens.pdf

Enactment Number:

Author: Rob Phillips, City Engineering

Hearing Date:

Entered by: mhacker@cityofmadison.com

Published Date:

Approval History

Version	Date	Approver	Action
1	02/16/2011	Debra Simon	Approve

History of Legislative File

Ver- sion:	Acting Body:	Date:	Action:	Sent To:	Due Date:	Return Date:	Result:
1	Engineering Division	02/10/2011	Referred for Introduction				
	Action Text:	This Resolution was Referred for Introduction					
	Notes:	Board of Estimates, Library Board, Community Gardens Committee, Downtown Coordinating Committee, Parks Commission					
1	COMMON COUNCIL	02/22/2011	Referred	BOARD OF ESTIMATES		03/17/2011	
	Action Text:	This Resolution was Referred to the BOARD OF ESTIMATES					
	Notes:	Additional Referral to: Library Board, Community Gardens Committee, Downtown Coordinating Committee, Parks Commission.					
1	BOARD OF ESTIMATES	02/22/2011	Referred	MADISON PUBLIC LIBRARY BOARD		04/07/2011	
	Action Text:	This Resolution was Referred to the MADISON PUBLIC LIBRARY BOARD					
	Notes:						
1	BOARD OF ESTIMATES	02/22/2011	Refer	COMMUNITY GARDENS COMMITTEE		03/22/2011	
	Action Text:	This Resolution was Refer to the COMMUNITY GARDENS COMMITTEE					
	Notes:						
1	BOARD OF ESTIMATES	02/22/2011	Refer	DOWNTOWN COORDINATING COMMITTEE			
	Action Text:	This Resolution was Refer to the DOWNTOWN COORDINATING COMMITTEE					
	Notes:						
1	BOARD OF ESTIMATES	02/22/2011	Refer	BOARD OF PARK COMMISSIONER S			
	Action Text:	This Resolution was Refer to the BOARD OF PARK COMMISSIONERS					
	Notes:						
1	BOARD OF PARK COMMISSIONERS	03/09/2011	Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval	BOARD OF ESTIMATES	03/21/2011		

Action Text: This Resolution was Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval to the BOARD OF ESTIMATES. Due back on 3/21/2011.

Registered Speaker:

NAME	SUPPORT	OPPOSE
Bryan Cooper, Facilities & Sustainability , Eng Div.		XX

As part of the capital budget appropriation for the remodeled library there was a provision for city staff to complete a feasibility study for a rooftop community garden or green roof. This presentation addressed the potential for a rooftop garden at the new Central Library and described the various types of gardens. They range from an intensive (community garden) roof to an extensive (green) roof. Green roofs keep buildings dry and provide benefits in the form of extending roof life, reducing energy costs, recreating a natural environment for flora and fauna, providing storm water runoff , reducing the urban heat island effect, decreasing noise pollution and filtering airborne pollutants.

An intensive roof provides approximately 12 inches of soil depth to accommodate small trees, shrubs, large plants or vegetable gardens. They are designed to be accessible by the public and those who are taking care of the gardens. It is the most expensive to construct and requires the most long term maintenance.

An intensive green roof is designed for use by the public, and would have to follow all codes, including providing additional security for that area to make sure it is monitored. Neither the city nor the library would operate a rooftop garden. They would need a separate entity to sign a lease for the garden that would include liability and holding the city harmless for any claims associated with the use of the garden. There are not elevators that can currently accommodate gardeners. Additionally the library is not open on Sundays in the summer. A major concern is the estimated additional construction cost for an intensive rooftop of \$775,000 and annual maintenance of \$149,850. At this time City staff are not interested in pursuing this type of rooftop due to costs, access and security.

An extensive green roof has a shallow growth medium of 1 to 6 inches and is typically made up of succulent plants that are drought and wind tolerant and require low maintenance. The estimated additional construction cost for an extensive rooftop is \$156,000 while a traditional roof is \$72,000. Staff determined it is feasible to pursue an extensive green roof as an alternate in the design and bidding process. A diagram showing the portion of the roof being considered for the extensive green roof was presented. The balance of the roof would be topped with a decorative pebble like material.

The study recommended that community gardens be pursued in other downtown parks. Those parks are James Madison, Olin and Brittingham Parks. Title searches were conducted and there are areas in each of these parks that are not restricted and could be used as community garden areas. The study was shared with the downtown community garden group that has been advocating for space on the rooftop of the library. The garden group would need to follow the process outlined by the Parks Division to request space for gardening.

A motion was made by Leopold/Chewning to accept the feasibility study for a rooftop intensive community garden and/or a green roof at the remodeled/renovated Madison Central Public Library. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

It was also pointed out that space has been allocated in Central Park on the parcel being acquired from MG&E for community garden plots. Barker stated that community gardening is a great public use of parks and is one of the cutting edge uses of parks. The soil will either be amended or raised garden beds will be built because there is a big need for accessible garden plot opportunities.

Barker then addressed the flow sheet for Public Gardens notation "City attorney / Risk Manager recommends a lease agreement similar to community garden leases" which is contrary to our accepted process here. He had a meeting with Ald. Rhodes-Conway and progress has been made on this issue in regard to leases and indemnity. She has been working independently on this issue and working with the City Attorney's office on a Resolution to be brought before the Common Council. Superintendent Briski is not yet aware of all of the particulars. He presented a volunteer model to her for edible landscape. Parks currently has trees and bushes in our system that need care and he suggested that some volunteer relationships be created as a pilot to care for them. Barker continued that on one hand, we've talked about the looming budget issue and the need for more volunteers and philanthropy and on the other hand, we're saying there's a big boulder in the road stopping you from helping us. We have to tell the Risk Manager risk vs. reward, it's an easy calculation.

Notes:

1	DOWNTOWN COORDINATING COMMITTEE	03/17/2011	Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval	BOARD OF ESTIMATES	03/21/2011	
	Action Text:	This Resolution was Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval to the BOARD OF ESTIMATES. Due back on 3/21/2011.				
	Notes:					
1	COMMUNITY GARDENS COMMITTEE	03/22/2011	Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval	BOARD OF ESTIMATES		Pass
	Action Text:	The committee voted to accept the feasibility study (motion made by Sanders, seconded by Scaife) with the following recommendations:				
		1. If the City decides chooses the "extensive green roof) option, that is also aggressively pursue the development of community gardens in downtown parks.				
		2. If the City is willing to consider the more "intensive" use of green roof space for community gardens, that it further investigate the following issues:				
		a. Reducing costs by reconfiguring the areas for planting and pathways.				
		b. Reducing costs by utilizing alternative security options.				
		c. Re-evaluating the lighting standard necessary for this use and				
		d. Re-evaluating wheher a third elevator would be necessary.				
	Notes:					
1	MADISON PUBLIC LIBRARY BOARD	04/07/2011	Return to Lead with the Recommendation for Approval	BOARD OF ESTIMATES		
	Action Text:	A motion was made by Palm, seconded by Arntsen, to accept the green roof feasibility report. Motion passed by voice vote/other.				
	Notes:					
1	BOARD OF ESTIMATES	04/11/2011				

Text of Legislative File 21380

Title

Accepting the Madison City Staff authored feasibility study for a rooftop intensive community garden and/or a green roof at the remodeled/renovated Madison Central Public Library.

Body

Whereas, the Madison Central Public Library is located at 201 West Mifflin Street, Madison Wisconsin. The original library was designed in the early 1960's and construction was completed in 1965. After 45 years the library is being remodeled to address issues associated with deferred maintenance, accommodate new uses such as computers and other technologies, and provide additional public and staff space. The 2010 and 2011 Capital Budget appropriation to build the remodeled library directed city staff to complete a feasibility study for a rooftop intensive community garden or green roof (see attached files *Green Roof Feasibility Study 01-25-2011.pdf*, *Appendix I - City of Madison - Library Capital Budget Summary for 2010 & 2011.pdf*, *Appendix II - Sketch of general building area considered for roof top garden.pdf*, *Appendix III - Back-up for cost estimates.pdf*, *Appendix IV - Schematic Design Report & Drawings.pdf*, *Appendix V- Madison Parks memo and flow chart information for community garden.pdf*, *Appendix VI - Brittingham Park Memo and Title Information for Community Garden.pdf*, *Appendix VIII - Olin Turville Park Memo & Title Information for Community Garden.pdf*) and,

Whereas, the renovated/remodeled library will be approximately 118,000 square feet distributed across five floors above and below grade. The new third floor will be located at the existing roof

level.

Approximately half of the third floor will be enclosed space accommodating meeting rooms, reading areas, staff offices as well as other miscellaneous support spaces. The other half of the existing roof level will remain as roof. This is the space addressed in the feasibility study for accommodation of the rooftop community garden or green roof, **and**,

Whereas, the design team led by Meyer, Scherer, & Rockcastle Architecture & Interior Design, have completed the schematic design phase and have recently started the design development phase of the architectural design process. Currently there is no provision for an intensive green roof (i.e. rooftop

community garden) in the schematic design documents nor is there any direction from the City of Madison to MS&R to include this type of roof in the design development phase or any future design phases. There is an option in the schematic design documents to include an extensive green roof, **and**,

Whereas, outlined in the feasibility document the city staff acknowledges the benefits offered by a living roof of any type. However based on several major challenges staff recommends not to pursue an

intensive green roof (i.e. rooftop community garden) for the Madison Central Public Library remodel project. City staff does recommend continuing to pursue an extensive green roof as an alternative throughout the remaining design and construction bidding phases, **and**,

Whereas, as an alternative to a rooftop community garden on the central public library there are possibilities for establishing a community garden in nearby Madison public parks as outlined in the body of this document and appendices V, VI, VII, and VIII.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Common Council hereby accepts the Madison City Staff authored feasibility study for a rooftop intensive community garden and/or a green roof at the remodeled/renovated Madison Central Public Library.

Fiscal Note

No expenditure is required to accept this study.