

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: October 17, 2007
TITLE: 505-550 Midvale Boulevard, Midvale Plaza Redevelopment, PUD(SIP), Mixed-Use Development, Alterations to Previously Approved Plans. 11 th Ald. Dist. (02988)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: October 17, 2007	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Paul Wagner, Chair; Bonnie Cosgrove, Richard Slayton, Bruce Woods, Lou Host-Jablonski, Todd Barnett, Jay Ferm, John Harrington and Richard Wagner.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 17, 2007, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of alterations to previously approved plans located at 505-550 Midvale Boulevard. Appearing on behalf of the project were Joseph Krupp, Bruce Simonson and Dan Yoder, Midvale Joint Venture, LLC. The signage component of the project was the first item under consideration as presented by Yoder, providing for uniform signage provisions for the first phase retail/commercial tenants, as well as the new location for the "Sequoia Branch Library." The library signage consists of above canopy signage located at the main entry to the library on its north "interior parking court oriented elevation" and south elevation at its entry off of Tokay Boulevard. A monument type ground sign is proposed along the south side of the main driveway entrance off of Midvale Boulevard, which will be relocated to the north side with the development of future phase two of the project. The signage package features raceway mounted individual letter signage in conjunction with fabric awnings for the retail/commercial tenant spaces abutting the property's Midvale Boulevard and Tokay Boulevard frontages. The signage for the retail/commercial spaces abutting the interior parking court will be fabric awnings. Additional signage is also provided to identify the entry to the upper story residential units at their entry located adjacent to the interior parking court. Following the presentation of the signage package, Krupp and Simonson presented an update to the issues dealing with the sidewalk/open space plaza adjacent to the library space at the southwesterly corner of the site adjacent to the intersection of Midvale Boulevard and Tokay Boulevard. A previous proposed modification to the originally approved sidewalk/open space plaza area was not granted by the Commission at its meeting of April 11, 2007. Krupp and Simonson informed the Commission as to issues with the City Engineer relevant to the treatment of the open space plaza area as previously approved, in combination with the modifications as currently proposed. They noted that comments by the City Engineer relevant to an approval surface treatment for the plaza area based on its partial location in a public right-of-way still require adjustment to the originally approved plans, as well as response to the Commission's previous concerns. The current proposal provides for concrete in a single color with a tooled finish incorporating a diagonal patterning with additional plantings along Midvale with retaining structures; kept open at the corners; in a brown color concrete complementary to the palette on the building, including the provision of two sets of paired benches at the face of the building.

Following the presentation the Commission noted the following:

- Question the need of such a large open space at the corner. Consider that benches should be turned in, in addition to elimination of the diagonal patterning, concern with how inviting the space will be.
- The cuttings into and jogging around the corner area make it less of a space.
- Like the low grade planter along Midvale; gives separation between seating area and traffic on Midvale.
- Open planter edge along Tokay Boulevard to balance with planter edge treatment along Midvale to provide more open access.
- Create symmetry with the location of canopy trees and planter edges and get rid of diagonal patterning with benches parallel to the face of the building.
- Concern with salt sensitive issues with plantings adjacent to walk.
- Consider rotating benches to relate at right angles to the face of the building.

ACTION:

On a motion by Host-Jablonski, seconded by Woods, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of alterations to previously approved plans. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (9-0). The motion required the following:

- Pull the line of planters back to parallel with the face of the building to open up corner seating area.
- Adjust handicapped access ramp at corner to provide for two curb cuts at 90 degrees to replace the single diagonal curb cut.
- Provide salt tolerant plantings in lower planting bed along Midvale Boulevard.
- Adjust benches at the face of the building to provide a 90 degree orientation with an additional bench provided adjacent to the Midvale Boulevard façade.
- Consider crowning the yew bed adjacent to the Midvale Boulevard frontage to provide drainage to the sidewalk area.
- Add an additional tree on both sides of the corner.

On a motion by Woods, seconded by R. Wagner, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a uniform sign package. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (9-0).

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7, 7, 7, 7, 7.5 and 8 (signage band); 4, 5, 5, 5, 5 and 5 for modification to the previously approved project.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 505-550 Midvale Boulevard (SIGNS)

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7
	-	-	-	7	-	-	-	-
	-	-	-	-	7	-	7	-
	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7.5
	-	-	-	-	6	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	8	-	-	8
	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7

General Comments:

- Handsome signage package. Color and creativity.
- The residential sign may be hard to read as is. Otherwise, nice package.
- Great signage.
- Sign design and placement re nicely integrated with architecture.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 505-550 Midvale Boulevard (CORNER)

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	5	-	5	-	-	5	5	5
	5	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
	5	-	-	-	-	5	-	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	6	-	5	5	-	5	5	5
	4	-	6	5	-	5	5	5
	5	-	4	-	-	5	5	5
	-	-	4	-	-	-	-	-

General Comments:

- Prominent project element (corner) was left unprogrammed. Consequently, it doesn't work well and opportunity has been missed.
- All this design horsepower, and they can't even get the corner resolved as an urban place. Opportunity lost.
- With the movement back of the second bed and addition of a bench, this will be a more usable space.
- Solution doesn't seem to have a concept, trying to do too many things at once.
- Opportunities lost; lack of imagination.