

AGENDA # 12.

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION **PRESENTED:** October 19, 2005

TITLE: 1433 Monroe Street – Referral from Plan Commission – Recommendation Needed, Credit Union with Drive-Up. **REFERRED:**
REREFERRED:
REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: William A. Fruhling, Acting Secretary **ADOPTED:** **POF:**

DATED: October 19, 2005 **ID NUMBER:**

Members present were: Paul Wagner (Chair), Bruce Woods, Lou Host-Jablonski, Lisa Geer, Ald. Noel Radomski, Todd Barnett, Cathleen Feland, Robert March and Michael Barrett.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 19, 2005, the Urban Design Commission **RECOMMENDED APPROVAL** of a credit union with a drive-up located at 1433 Monroe Street. Kevin Carey, project architect, explained that this item was referred to the Commission by the Plan Commission primarily due to concerns about the location of the building on the site. He stated that the site plan has been totally redone since that time, noting that the building has been moved up to the street, its orientation has been changed, and that Traffic Engineering is allowing three stacking spaces per drive-up window. Bill Rattunde, Brad McClain, and Gary Brown registered in support.

The Commission had very favorable comments about the proposal overall. However, there was considerable discussion about the use of EIFS around the base of the building. Several members felt that since the primary reason for referral to the Commission was building placement, it would not be appropriate to comment on the materials.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Barrett, the Urban Design Commission **RECOMMENDED APPROVAL** of a credit union with a drive-up located at 1433 Monroe Street.

The motion was approved on a vote of (6-3) with Feland, Woods, and Wagner voting no.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 6.5, 7, 7, 7, 7.5, 8, 8 and 8.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1433 Monroe Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	8	7	7	6	-	8	8	7
	9	6	6	2	6	7	7	7
	7	6	6	6	-	6	5	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	8
	8	7	6	-	-	6	7	7
	8	8	8	8	-	9	8	8
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7.5
	7	6	7	-	-	6	7	6.5
	8	8	8	-	-	8	8	8

General Comments:

- Great street orientation. LEEDS certification application is also commendable. May want to consider all native plants for site credits, which may do better with the contaminated soil.
- Change site lighting from high pressure sodium to metal halide. Provide hard masonry or concrete at base of walls – not EIFS.
- Covered bike parking and fenestration 360° - it can be done!
- Resounding approval.
- The UW does LEEDS. I love it.