

AGENDA # 7

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: December 21, 2011
TITLE: 5515 Medical Circle – Comprehensive Design Review and Exceptions for Signage for the YMCA of Dane County in UDD No. 3. 19 th Ald. Dist. (24240)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: December 21, 2011	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Richard Wagner, Marsha Rummel, Todd Barnett, Dawn O’Kroley, Melissa Huggins and Richard Slayton.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of December 21, 2011, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a Comprehensive Design Review located at 5515 Medical Circle. Appearing on behalf of the project were Deb Burton and Emily Poblocki, representing Poblocki Signs; and Jim Trebian, Paul Vandervelde and Sharon Baldwin, representing the YMCA of Dane County. The YMCA is getting new signs and a new image. The new logo will go in and existing signs will be replaced with new. The site is in UDD No. 3 and it is very restrictive for signage, 40 square feet maximum. They are over that limit. In addition signs cannot go 10 feet over grade, the new signs are over that limit, two on each edge off the corner of the building. The logo element presents a clean white image in day, with an outline logo to be lighted only on edges at night. The existing manual changeable copy reader board can be reworked if not acceptable to have a black background with white lettering. The issues requiring Comprehensive Design Review is that there are two signs on same side and same elevation facing the Beltline but are facing east and west which is why they are there in the current form now. There are no signs on the Medical Circle side of the building. One of the signs is non-lit. The standards for Comprehensive Design Review require that there is a tie between the building’s architecture, site design as well as in signs existing and proposed in total. The building’s unique architecture limits sign visibility.

Comments by the Commission noted that the two signs are building entry signs rather than building identification signs. The cost of wiring of 1 sign rather than 2 new separately wired signs was noted. The Commission suggested utilizing a single sign to be located on a large horizontal band atop the highest point on the building; centrally located between the existing two wall signs. It was estimated that the height of sign area is approximately 4 feet and can provide for a sign replacement, in a more visible area from both view points and questionably is more economical.

ACTION:

On a motion by Slayton, seconded by Barnett, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-0). The motion to approve one sign on the upper central façade band of the building with the sign around corner's liter board sign to have black background. An additional main entry sign can be an option to be approved along with wayfinding signage. Additional signs for entrance. Center sign above area. Staff can approve entry sign.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 5, 6 and 7.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 5515 Medical Circle

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6
	-	-	-	-	5	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Good on-the-spot design process.
- Good solution for sign package.
- Consolidating signs to one location (vs. 2) will have greater impact.