

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 10/14/19

TITLE: 622 ½ E Gorham St - Exterior Alteration
to a Designated Madison Landmark
(Bernard Hoover Boathouse) -
Replacement of windows; 2nd Ald.
Dist.

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 10/21/19

ID NUMBER: 57655

Members present were: Anna Andrzejewski, Richard Arnesen, Katie Kaliszewski, and David McLean. Excused were Betty Banks and Arvina Martin.

SUMMARY:

Amy Scanlon, registering in support and wishing to speak

Bailey described the proposed work to replace 35 nonhistoric windows, which were previously replaced in 1995. She said that the new windows will have wood interior and aluminum exterior, and will have modified muntin patterns based on historic documentation. She said that window 11 is conjectural, but is based upon forensic evidence. She said that the applicant is also proposing jamb and sill repair or replacement where necessary. She provided a selection of images from the application materials and discussed window 11, which will change to a vertical muntin pattern rather than a full grid because that is the pattern that windows of a similar size and vintage had. She mentioned that Ald. Heck supports the project and agrees with staff's recommendation. McLean asked what the leading muntin pattern was, and Bailey said that there was not necessarily a pattern depending on when the window was installed. She discussed the applicable standards and said that staff recommends approval with the condition that final window specifications be approved by staff because the applicant was still settling on a window manufacturer.

Scanlon referenced the submission materials, and said that the first image from 1915 is the most original photo they have showing the condition after construction. She pointed out that in the photo, each pair of casement windows has two horizontal muntins. She said that in the 1995 renovation, they likely replaced the windows in-kind with what was existing at that time rather than going back to the historic appearance. She said that in the photos from the 1960s-70s, one can see the windows have two-wide and three-high muntins, which don't appear to be original as shown in the 1915 photo. She said that rather than replacing in-kind again and ending up with a weird mismatch of windows, they are proposing to go with something more clean and original, which are casements with two horizontal muntins and double-hungs with single vertical muntins. She said that the exception is window 11 because there is no window like it, so they have decided on a pair of casements with one horizontal muntin. She showed a color sample, which will match the trim. She said that they are having trouble deciding on a window manufacturer because of the odd muntin configuration. She explained that she wants a simple muntin with an angle to look like original glazing putty, whereas the samples she brought had too much profile and too many shadow lines. McLean suggested the Pella Architect Series Reserve window, which has a clean putty line exterior. He asked who is doing the work, and Scanlon said that the Parks Department will do the install.

ACTION:

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Arnesen, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that final window specifications be approved by staff. The motion passed by voice vote/other. Kaliszewski recused herself, so the Chair, Andrzejewski, voted.