



Project Name & Address: 719 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District

Legistar File ID # [61086](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: January 5, 2021

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Ryan Reda

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
 - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to complete all items from the Building Inspection Work Order related to deterioration of the property. The proposed work is only to stabilize the existing structure, but the work is proposed in a fashion to allow for the potential of a rear addition in the near future.

This rear wing of the building was constructed in 1854 by Julius Vogel and in 1867 he added the front wing of the building to accommodate his family of ten children. This vernacular building has largely retained its form, but various layers of shingle siding were added to the exterior starting in the mid-twentieth century. Over time, the building has suffered the effects of deferred maintenance. The City has worked with both the previous and current property owners to salvage what is one of the oldest residential buildings in Madison.

Included in the submittal is a 3rd party assessment of the existing windows. The applicant concurs with the assessment and will repair the historic windows on the front of the building, replicate the deteriorated or missing windows on the side of the building, and secure the rear window openings so that they are weather tight, but not introduce new windows on an elevation that will potentially have a new addition in the near future. New storm windows will be introduced on the front that will compliment the unique curved shape of the upper window sash, and a new wood storm door on the front of the building.

The applicant completed some investigation on the interior to determine that the original layer of siding was likely clapboard with a 5-1/2" exposure. The applicant proposes to remove all of the nonhistoric layers of shingle siding, install insulation and a vapor barrier, and then install LP Smartside 6" exposure clapboards. The original application materials specified textured, but the applicant has agreed to use smooth surfaced boards and trim.

Decorative elements on the building will be preserved and repaired, and all deteriorated window trim, soffits, and fascia will be replaced with profiles to match the existing or historic. The applicant is proposing a new rear entry that is a simple stoop, constructed of wood. The balusters will be a simple square design. There will be a new period-appropriate rear door. Additionally, the electrical will be property secured to the building and the basement access doors will be repaired.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) N/A
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) Work complies with the Third Lake Ridge Historic District standards.
 - (d) In completing the work, the property owner will be complying with the intent of the preservation ordinance by salvaging a significant historic resource.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
 - (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 1. No changes to proposed height.
 2. No changes to the landscape treatment and the rear entry will be compatible with the siting of the previous entry.
 3. No changes to the rhythm of masses and spaces.
 - (b) The alterations will maintain the existing and historic proportion of solids and voids. On the street façade, the proposal is to repair the historic windows and fabricate new storms that will compliment the unique shape of those windows.
 - (c) The proposal will repair decorative corbelling and front porch elements, remove multiple layers of nonhistoric siding, and return the exterior appearance to the historic clapboard appearance. The materials to be replaced are those that are deteriorated and have failed or are beyond repair.
 - (d) No proposed changes to the roof.
 - (e) No changes to door and window sizes.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following condition:

1. Final window specifications to be approved by staff