



19 August, 2011

Amy Scanlon - Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development
Bill Fruhling- Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development

In advance of the Landmarks Commission's August 22 meeting, please see comments on agenda items from the *Madison Trust for Historic Preservation* below.

Item 1 – 2101 Chamberlain Avenue

Informational presentation. No comments.

Item 2 – 723 State Street - Development adjacent to a Local Landmark

The amended proposal for new construction for St. Paul's Catholic Student Center, if constructed as shown in submitted renderings, would not be so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjoining landmark site, the University Presbyterian Church. The current proposal for St. Paul's is a far better design than the previously submitted proposal in terms of its relation to the size and scale of the adjacent Pres House, and is far more compatible with the Pres House. It would not diminish the presence of the landmark Pres House as the previous iteration would have done. Its proportions are also much more complimentary to the Pres House.

Item 3 – 2135 Chamberlain Ave.

No concerns. Concur with staff report.

Item 4 – 1001 University Avenue – PUD(SIP)

We defer to our previous statements on this proposal and add the following:

The amended proposal for new construction on the St. Francis House parcel would not have an immediate deleterious effect on the physical fabric of Luther Memorial Church. The size and scale of the proposed new construction would not visually diminish or intrude upon the historic character or integrity of the adjacent Landmark.

Item 5 – Buildings proposed for demolition - 2011

1112 Spaight St. We oppose the demolition of this house, and ask that the Landmarks Commission deny a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of this house. The house is a modest element of the Orton Park National Register Historic District, as well as the Third Lake Ridge local Historic District. The significance of the Third Lake Ridge district is derived from the architectural and social diversity of the area. Grand houses stand next to modest houses, and the architecture ranges from excellent examples of popular styles to modest examples of vernacular forms. This house stands adjacent to a grand, and somewhat eclectic, example of Queen Anne style, exemplifying the diversity and openness of this area during its period of significance and is still a characteristic of the neighborhood today. Also, a local professional restoration contractor with extensive experience restoring and rehabilitating old buildings has examined the house and concluded that it is "not worthy of demolition, and could instead be gutted and restored." Also, the Preservation and Development Committee of the Marquette Neighborhood Association voted to oppose the demolition of this house.

Respectfully submitted,

Jason Tish
Executive Director
Madison Trust for Historic Preservation

Dedicated to the Preservation of Madison's Historic Places