



**Project Name & Address:** 1040 Williamson Street  
**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction  
**Legistar File ID #** [66636](#)  
**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division  
**Date Prepared:** August 12, 2021

## Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Jim Vincent  
**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an accessory structure.

## Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.
- 41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**
- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are

located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)

- (a) Gross Volume.
- (b) Height.
- (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
- (d) Materials used in the street facades.
- (e) The design of the roof.
- (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses.
- (g) Directional expression.
- (h) Materials, patterns and textures.
- (i) Landscape treatment.

## Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct an accessory dwelling unit behind the principal structure. The principal structure was constructed in 1895. The new structure is proposed with a garage on the first floor and a unit above. The accessory structure is designed to be similar in style to the principal structure while being clearly secondary to the structure.

There are few remaining historic accessory structures within 200 feet of the subject property. A review of the Sanborn maps shows that there used to be accessory structures behind most buildings, some of which were taller than a single story. Most were wood framed, but a few were concrete block. The historic barn located behind 1042 Williamson was previously addressed as 1042 ½ on the 1942 Sanborn, suggesting it was a residential unit. The largest accessory structure in the vicinity is at 1014 ½ Williamson, which is now a separate parcel for the house located on what was the back of the lot for 1014 Williamson. In 2004 the Landmarks Commission approved new carriage house style units behind 1023 & 1029 Williamson, addressed as 1025 & 1027 Williamson.

While most of the accessory structures within 200 feet were single-story structures, but as the adjacent barn shows, this new structure would be a comparable height to existing and historic accessory structures within 200 feet. The siding of the new structure is proposed to be smooth-surfaced 4-½" reveal clapboard with decorative shingles in the gable end, and EIFS on the first floor. The existing accessory structures within 200 feet seem to largely be clapboard or mimicking clapboard. The barn is the exception with board and batten siding. Of the principal structures in the vicinity, they are largely clapboard with either masonry or concrete (often parged over masonry) foundations. In 1971, wide aluminum siding was installed over the historic siding of the principal structure at 1040 Williamson. The adjacent principal structures are of a similar style. The principal structure at 1038 Williamson still retains its historic siding, which includes decorative shingles in the gable end. There does not seem to be a precedent for EIFS on the first floor and gable siding with decorative shingles in the gable end on either principal or accessory structures on historic resources within 200 feet.

The one-over-one windows, the style of vehicle and pedestrian doors, and the shingle styles are comparable to those found on historic resources in the vicinity.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
- (a) This structure is visually compatible with the gross volume of other accessory structures within 200 feet. It is also visually smaller than the principal structure.
  - (b) The height is comparable to other accessory structures, particularly the historic barn that will be immediately adjacent to the accessory structure. It is also substantially shorter than the principal structures that front the street.
  - (c) The proposed accessory structure maintains the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street façade.
  - (d) The clapboard and decorative shingles in the gable end are comparable to historic resources in the vicinity, but the use of EIFS on the first floor does not appear to have precedent. While there are parged foundations in the vicinity, that treatment is strictly for the foundations and not used as a wall cladding material when mixed with clapboard siding.
  - (e) Most accessory structures in the vicinity have a simple gable-front roof, but there are some complex roof forms, including at 1014 ½ Williamson.
  - (f) There are few remaining historic accessory structures, but this structure is proposed to be at the back of the lot, which is where those accessory structures were historically and are presently located.
  - (g) The structure maintains the directional expression of historic resources in the vicinity.
  - (h) The proposed treatment would largely mimic the historic cladding that was previously found on the principal structure on this lot (and it likely remaining under the aluminum siding). Where this structure diverges is the use of EIFS for the first floor cladding.
  - (i) N/A

## Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following condition:

1. Extend clapboard siding to the first floor of the structure instead of the EIFS cladding