

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION	PRESENTED: July 21, 2010
TITLE: 109 State Street – Comprehensive Design Review for a Wall Sign in the C4 District. 4 th Ald. Dist. (19230)	REFERRED: REREFERRED: REPORTED BACK:
AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary	ADOPTED: POF:
DATED: July 21, 2010	ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn O’Kroley, Todd Barnett, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, R. Richard Wagner, Jay Ferm and Henry Lufler.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of July 21, 2010, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a Comprehensive Design Review for a wall sign located at 109 State Street in the C4 District. Appearing on behalf of the project was Craig R. Shaub. Prior to the presentation staff noted that consideration of the wall sign on the building’s State Street façade under the provisions for “Comprehensive Design Review” was necessitated by the removal of the storefront’s conventional sign and that allowed the restoration of underlying transom windows containing vision glass. The Sign Control Ordinance does not allow the use of vision glass as the signable area for a wall sign. In order to comply the conventional sign band would be required to be restored or the vision glass to be replaced with spandrel glass. Staff further noted that the restoration of the building’s glass storefront satisfies the criteria for allowing the signage as proposed; creating visual harmony between the building and signage with no relevance to the site since it’s at a zero setback to the right-of-way. The logo would be cut out of the sign material, of which he presented a sample. A recessed nut/bolt system will be used to hide all of the lower portion of the support straps. This keeps the openness that was created and allows light to pass through the sign. On the south elevation would be the same concept above the door with a stud mounted system with a pad stand-off. The sign design follows the concept of opening up the entry and allowing natural light into the store. Staff informed the Commission that the Landmarks Commission has approved this signage. Comments by the Commission were as follows:

- Would it be possible to pull out the signage from the glass?
- There ought to be a way to attach it directly to the stone band above. Staff indicated that is out of the sign area, but since this is a Comprehensive Design Review the Commission can approve a sign outside of the signable area.
- The straps coming down could be more successful if carried them down past or through the sign.
- The concept is great, just needs a little tweaking.
- You need to be able to get a squeegee through there (and a hand).
- It’s a very nice sign.
- Use a C-Channel to hold the sign off of the glass.

ACTION:

On a motion by O’Kroley, seconded by Rummel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a unanimous vote of (8-0). The motion provided for the following:

- Use a C-Channel attached to the top and bottom mullions with the same thickness, with two verticals spanning from the top to the bottom, finished to match the existing mullions, to return to staff for approval.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 6, 7, 7, 8, 8 and 9.

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 109 State Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	-	-	-	-	7	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	8
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	7
	-	-	-	-	6	-	6	6
	-	-	-	-	9	-	-	9
	-	-	-	-	9	-	-	8
	-	-	-	-	6	-	7	-

General Comments:

- Very nice.
- Simple and unobtrusive.
- Thanks for improving façade and proposing very attractive sign.