

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

September 16, 2019

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 1254 Rutledge Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Legistar File ID # [57355](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: September 12, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Mark H. Jenssen

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to repair and renovate the exterior of a house.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to make repairs to deteriorated elements on the exterior of the building. Most of the proposal includes limited replacement in-kind, and replicating the existing profiles or decorative elements.

The proposal includes replacement of the existing attic windows with aluminum clad units to replicate the existing. From reviewing the historic photo, the current windows do not appear to be historic. The question is how comparable the dimensions of the replacements are to the existing windows.

The proposal also includes removing an entry on the side porch. As a corner lot, the side porch is street facing. The door is one of two entrances on the side porch. The space where the door is located appears to be a later addition to the house, with a vertical piece of trim denoting the original end of the house. As a later addition to the house, the modification of this space by removing the door framing and covering over the area with siding to match the existing elsewhere on the house, while maintaining the vertical piece of trim located to the left (southeast) of the door, would allow this area to still read as a later addition. The porch would still retain a doorway, and that door would be the one closer to the stair.

The proposal to replace the cellar door with a metal door is in keeping with the type of doors found on these types of features. Staff would like to review a product sheet for the type of door selected to ensure that the style of replacement is in keeping with the character of the building, while acknowledging that this access is located on the back of the building and would not be visible to the street.

The final alteration is a modification of the decorative design in the gable-end of the front porch. The existing design is different from the early design as seen in the historic image available from the Wisconsin Historical Society. The design reads as being contemporary, speaks to the evolution of the building, but is also in keeping with the character of the building.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
 - a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height: no changes
 - (ii) Landscape treatment: no changes
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces: the rhythm of spaces will be altered slightly with the enclosing of the second doorway on the side of the house. However, this is a space that has already seen modifications over time. Additionally the change will be compatible with other historic resources within 200 feet and with the structure itself.
 - b) No proposed changes to the rhythm of solids and voids to the street façade.
 - c) Alterations to materials on the street façades (and elsewhere) will largely retain the historic materials. The drip edges applied to the windows will be minimally visible. All other areas will replicate the existing. While the design of the porch gable-end decoration and of the second entry on the side porch will be removed, the modifications will both use the same type of materials found currently and historically on the building.
 - d) No proposed changes to the roof.

- e) The side porch is proposed to lose one of its doors. However, that door does not appear to be historic and the alteration would reinstate the historical proportional relationship of door and window sizes.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness can be met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the proposal with the following conditions:

1. Cellar door specifications be approved by staff
2. New screen door specifications be approved by staff
3. New attic window specifications be approved by staff