



# City of Madison

City of Madison  
Madison, WI 53703  
www.cityofmadison.com

## Meeting Minutes - Approved ADA TRANSIT SUBCOMMITTEE TO THE TRANSIT AND PARKING COMM

---

Monday, February 21, 2011

5:10 PM 5 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd., Room LL-130 (Madison  
Municipal Building)

---

1. Call to Order/Roll Call

**Staff:** Crystal Martin, Ann Schroeder

**Chair DuRocher called the meeting to order at 5:13 PM.**

**Present:** 7 -

Chris Schmidt; Kenneth M. Streit; Lorry Bond; Jeanne M. Tregoning;  
Susan M. De Vos; Mary E. Jacobs and Carl D. DuRocher

**Absent:** 1 -

Michael A. Huckaby

**Excused:** 1 -

Ida W. Nathan

2. Proper Meeting Notification

**The meeting was properly noticed.**

3. Introductions

**Introductions were skipped since no new people were present.**

4. Approval of Minutes

**Mr. Streit moved approval of the minutes as written; Ms. Brunette-Tregoning seconded. Ms. Bond and Ms. De Vos abstained as they were not present at the last meeting. The motion carried.**

5. Public Appearances

**There were no public appearances.**

6. Disclosures and Recusals

**There were no disclosures or recusals.**

7. [21427](#)

Managing Paratransit Fare Media

Update on changes in how Metro handles bulk paratransit ticket sales and plan for moving forward.

Attachments: [Discussion Para QT Bulk Sales 01 11.pdf](#)

Mr. DuRocher said there is so much impact on our budget with statewide brokerage looming that this issue is worth a second look. Ms. Martin said that the State Department of Health Services has contracted with a firm, Logisticare, to manage Medicaid common carrier and other related transportation services on a statewide basis. They are preparing to provide those services starting July 1st. Currently those services are administered by Dane County Human Services. Norah Cashin estimates that the budget is currently \$8 million in Dane County for common carrier rides. Metro has a contract with the county to be reimbursed for those services. We received about \$100,000 in revenue last year. We are not the largest vendor by far. The rest of this service is provided by private providers such as WeCare, Transit Solutions, Badger Cab, Union Cab, etc. Various clinics have the authority through Dane County to authorize this kind of transportation. Our concern is that when the broker takes over, they are a for-profit entity. They will be given by the state a flat amount of money for the year. Whatever savings they can realize is their profit. Our concern is one way the statewide brokerage has been administered in other states. Instead of going with private providers, the broker could try to move as much of the service as possible onto Metro fixed route, which is good, and Metro paratransit, which is problematic. Paratransit service is much more expensive for us if we get only the fare of \$3 rather than the cost of the ride. The brokerage does not include Milwaukee and Kenosha area, so Dane County is the largest population center that has people eligible for these services. There is easily \$1 or \$2 million of that \$8 million that could be shed onto Metro. As a defensive move, it is in our interest to control the sale of paratransit fare media.

When Dave Lowe was here from Wisconsin Department of Transportation (WisDOT) he spoke about tools we should have in place such as agency fares and educating our customers and public officials about what is happening. The last tool he spoke of was controlling the sale of paratransit fare media. We have done those things, except fare media. If the broker has the opportunity to buy large numbers of tickets from us, they won't have the pressure of negotiating agency fares. We want individuals to be able to purchase the tickets. So we are trying to get feedback about how many tickets individuals need to purchase at once. Right now we have agencies that order 200 books of tickets per month. But for individuals who buy their tickets for personal use, what is a reasonable number to be able to purchase? The update from last time is that there are two agencies that purchase in large numbers – Dane County Human Services (on behalf of several organizations which then distribute them) and the Madison Metropolitan School District (MMSD). Staff met with both of those entities and explained the situation, which they understand. Ms. Martin has had 12 meetings with various stakeholders to find out who is receiving bulk purchased tickets and what their situations are. We are learning that many of them have someone administering funds for them through other programs, but that there are alternatives for them that we can

transition to before July 1st.

One surprise is that the number of tickets purchased is much more than the trips we can track. It shows that people aren't using all the tickets they purchase. It is not infrequent that agencies have tickets returned by family members when someone moves or passes away.

Mr. Streit asked if there was a different broker for the 6 counties not included in the statewide brokerage. Ms. Martin said she is not sure. The state has tried several times to start this type of brokerage, and they were not successful. This time it seems that they were because the national firms that would be interested in this type of bid did heavy lobbying.

Mr. Streit asked if the idea is that the brokerage can do this by negotiating better prices with vendors. Ms. Martin said the business model is reviewing the eligibility rules and figuring out who might not be eligible, reviewing the level of service (i.e. ambulatory individuals don't need lift service), shifting people onto public transit, recruiting volunteer drivers away from established programs, negotiating a very low price with mom and pop set ups and then telling other vendors this is 'the' rate. In New Jersey they have a statewide transit system, but it is strictly a cash fare system. That has worked to their advantage because the broker has to administer the funds for the individual; they cannot distribute cash to individuals. That has curtailed trip shedding and cost shifting onto transit systems. Metro staff doesn't recommend doing away with tickets or a cash only system. Staff thinks it is important for people to have access to tickets if they can't physically manipulate cash or carrying cash makes them vulnerable in the community.

Ms. Martin said we've been quickly doing outreach to case managers and others who would be affected, and they understand the situation. We'd like feedback from individuals who buy tickets on their own. We want them to be able to continue to do that, but we'd like to know what number of tickets distinguishes individual purchases from bulk agency purchases. We thought about the number of 3 to 5 books. Three books would get one through a workweek with round trips. Five books would be round trips to work plus a couple extra trips. That would have people needing to buy tickets every week. We are not hearing from those people for whom this would be problematic.

Ms. De Vos said she tended to buy a 4 to 6 month supply. Ms. Bond said there are only a few places in town where you can get the paratransit tickets. Those are the outlets that have actually asked for the paratransit tickets. Our goal is to have a policy in place for July 1st. We hope to take this to the Transit and Parking Commission (TPC) in March and let them have a chance to review it. Mr. Streit said if there is enough of a profit motive, there might be scams. So there should be a way to block that, such as making a deal to increase the ticket price for bulk sales. Ms. Martin said that happened in Racine, and they assessed a \$17 service fee per ticket.

Ms. DuRocher wondered if we could limit bulk sales to inter-governmental sales only. Ms. Martin said Logisticare could ask the DHS to make a purchase on their behalf. Mr. Streit said he is concerned that trip shedding onto Metro Transit would also be a problem for private vendors. Ms. Martin said we don't want to be competing with the very vendors that we contract with.

When we look at what has happened with Family Care and what WisDOT says you can and can't do, there aren't a lot of options except to limit ticket sales or have a cash only system. Ms. Martin would be disappointed to see a cash only system. This will be on the March 8th TPC agenda.

Ms. De Vos said staff has a good handle on this and there is no really good solution. They are doing the best they can. Ms. Bond said staff is working to keep the options open and that's a good thing. Ms. Jacobs said it seems staff is doing what they need to do. Mr. Streit moved that that the ADA Transit Subcommittee to the Transit and Parking Commission would support Metro staff in considering options and erecting sufficient barriers that Logisticare has incentive to negotiate agency fares. Ms. Jacobs seconded. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

8. [21428](#) Performance Indicators - Year End 2010

Attachments: [Para Indicators Dec10.pdf](#)  
[Para Summary Dec10.pdf](#)  
[Para Indicators Aug10.pdf](#)  
[Para Indicators Sept10.pdf](#)  
[Para Indicators Oct10.pdf](#)  
[Para Indicators Nov10.pdf](#)

Ms. Martin spoke about the paratransit summary chart. It includes information about vehicle accidents and fleet maintenance data. The 2009 actual compared to 2010 shows a decrease in the number of accidents, particularly the number of chargeable accidents. These have a lot to do with the weather. Paratransit accidents tend to be broken side mirrors and not ruined vehicles or injuries. The number of road calls are down quite a bit. We replaced ELF buses with low floor buses. Newer buses tend to reduce road calls. We've been keeping up with inspections.

Ms. De Vos asked if this subcommittee could see statistics for fixed route lift usage. Ms. Martin said yes. That information is available on fixed route reports. Mr. Streit said any time the ramp is deployed for any reason, it is counted. The driver doesn't count it. Ms. Martin said sometimes ramps are put out to board ambulatory passengers quickly at popular stops. So the data doesn't necessarily indicate wheelchair usage.

Ms. Martin said the year-end total ride count is 271,347, about a 2% increase over the previous year. Although we have about the same number of increases, it is a smaller percentage because we are providing more rides overall. Cancellations are down. No shows were down a bit. The number of people provided services was down. We are serving fewer people with more rides, so that means people are making efficient use of the services. DDS trips are up about 9,000 trips. The ratio of people taking cash trips versus MA Waiver trips has changed. Ms. Bond said that more people needing to take advantage of the services based on unemployment could account for some of that. Ms. Martin said also it could be the same people needing to take more trips during the course of the day. At the end of 2005, we had almost 261,000 rides. Our cancellation rate was the same. The no show rate was 2.2%

compared to 1.9%. Metro directly operated service was 25%, and is now 21%. There were 3100 customers in 2005 and now we have 4100.

Ms. Bond asked if we have any data about age of riders. Ms. Martin said we had an upgrade to our software, and she thinks she will be able to get that information now. Ms. Jacobs said that would be interesting. They are seeing that their consumers seem to be getting into the system at an earlier age. Now kids coming out of high school are more independent, but the aging population is needing services.

9. [21429](#)

Committee Member Terms

A number of subcommittee member terms are expiring over the next few months.

Attachments: [ROSTER 08 06 10 .pdf](#)

Alder Schmidt and Mr. DuRocher's terms come up in April. Alder Schmidt said he can't guarantee he would come back because there could be some shuffling around. There was a typo – Mr. Huckaby is good through 2012. In June, Ms. De Vos's term is coming up. She is still interested. Mr. DuRocher said there are people on file in the Mayor's office that are interested in the committee. Ms. Bond said she wondered if there was any thought about having a driver member. Mr. DuRocher said that is by ordinance change. They are welcome to attend any meeting. Ms. Nathan has missed four consecutive meetings. That has been reported to the Mayor's office. We aren't recommending she be removed.

10. Reports

- a. Transit & Parking Commission
- b. Commission on People with Disabilities
- c. Dane county Specialized Transportation Commission
- d. Transportation Planning Board (MPO)
- e. Other Community Meetings
- f. Report from the Chair
- g. Staff Report

a. Transit & Parking Commission – No report.

b. Commission on People with Disabilities – Ms. Martin will be at the next one to talk about bulk ticket sales.

c. Dane County Specialized Transportation Commission – There has not been a meeting since the last ADATS meeting.

d. Transportation Planning Board (MPO) – They are focused on changes to the TIF as far as when larger projects are scheduled. They hired a replacement planner. The Regional Transit Authority (RTA) will most likely be dissolved by the state. The RTA Board decided not to put a vote on the ballot in spring. The City Council would have preferred that they had.

e. Other Community Meetings – Wednesday is Wisconsin Urban and Rural Transit Association (WURTA) lobby day at the capitol. We don't know if it is still happening. It starts at Inn on the Park with a 9:30 AM briefing, then moves to meetings with legislators.

f. Report from the Chair – There was no report.

g. Staff Report – The elevator is fixed. Chuck Kamp was invited to the March ADATS meeting anticipating that the RTA would have a vote and there would be news about that. It will be a different discussion now, but it's timely for to ask for an update.

11. [08706](#) Other Transit Related Announcements

There were no other transit related announcements.

12. ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Schmidt, seconded by Jacobs, to Adjourn. The motion passed by voice vote/other.