

AGENDA # 11

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: September 16, 2009

TITLE: 1144 and 1148 Jenifer Street – PUD-SIP to Move a 2-Unit Structure Onto a Vacant Lot and Make Alterations to an Existing 2-Unit Structure. 6th Ald. Dist. (13650)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Alan J. Martin, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: September 16, 2009

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Marsha Rummel, Mark Smith, Dawn Weber, Todd Barnett, Bruce Woods, Richard Slayton, John Harrington, Ron Luskin, Richard Wagner and Jay Ferm.

SUMMARY:

(REVISED) - PLANS NOW BEFORE PC

At its meeting of September 16, 2009, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL** of a PUD-SIP located at 1144 and 1148 Jenifer Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Mark Schmidt, the project architect; Navin Jarugumilli, the property owner; and Lindsey Lee. Appearing in opposition to the project were Rolf Rodefeld and Frederick Johnson. Prior to the presentation of the site, staff apprised the Commission as to the need to provide for reapproval of both of this project at South Thornton/Jenifer Street and Cantwell Court in combination with its companion project at 1144-1148 Jenifer Street as a follow-up to modifications to both plans following referral by the Plan Commission at its meeting of June 1, 2009. The referral required a meeting with the neighborhood to discuss revisions to the plans as has recently occurred as well as the need for the Urban Design Commission to review the most recent plan revisions as a follow-up to the previous initial approval of both projects at its March 18 and May 6, 2008 meetings. In reviewing modifications to the site Schmidt noted that the plans were as previously approved by the Commission at its meeting of May 6, 2008 with additional modifications providing for the removal of the parking at the rear of the site as well as the reduction of pavement between both the existing and relocated buildings to provide for loading and unloading at minimum.

ACTION:

On a motion by Barnett, seconded by Slayton, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED INITIAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (5-3) with Luskin, Rummel, and Wagner voting no. Slayton, Barnett, Harrington, Weber, and Smith voting in favor.

After the Commission acts on an application, individual Commissioners rate the overall design on a scale of 1 to 10, including any changes required by the Commission. The ratings are for information only. They are not used to decide whether the project should be approved. The scale is 1 = complete failure; 2 = critically bad; 3 = very poor; 4 = poor; 5 = fair; 6 = good; 7 = very good; 8 = excellent; 9 = superior; and 10 = outstanding. The overall ratings for this project are 3, 4, 5, 5, 5, 6, 6 and 6.

y

URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION PROJECT RATING FOR: 1144 and 1148 Jenifer Street

	Site Plan	Architecture	Landscape Plan	Site Amenities, Lighting, Etc.	Signs	Circulation (Pedestrian, Vehicular)	Urban Context	Overall Rating
Member Ratings	6	-	-	-	-	-	7	6
	3	4	4	-	-	3	3	3
	6	-	-	-	-	6	6	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	4
	6	-	-	-	-	-	8	6
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5
	5	-	-	-	-	-	5	5
	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	5

General Comments:

- Reuse of existing home is wonderful.
- New building should not be built and existing home should not be moved. Owner should be forced to complete the remodel of the existing building as soon as possible and a tight timeline should be set.
- Fine.
- Strongly recommend Plan Commission require Certificates of Occupancy for 3 existing buildings before approval for moving 430 Cantwell is granted.
- Too much building smushed into a small lot. Not convinced that applicant is capable of resolving building code violations, let alone able to fulfill the standards for a PUD. There should be conditions that require the completion of the rehab portion before the house is relocated and new construction commences and proof of financial viability.